

RESISTANCE AND WASTE WORK: WOMEN'S ENVIRONMENTALISM IN SOUTHERN
ITALY

BY
VALERIA BONATTI

DISSERTATION

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Sociology
in the Graduate College of the
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 2017

Urbana, Illinois

Doctoral Committee:

Professor Tim Liao, Chair
Professor Zsuzsa Gille, Director of Research
Professor Asef Bayat
Professor Behrooz Ghamari-Tabrizi
Professor Faranak Miraftab

ABSTRACT

This dissertation analyzes how the implementation of the European Union Waste Directives is shaping gender and ethnic relationships in the region of Campania, Italy, an area with an extensive history of illegal dumping and toxic waste contamination. Through ethnographic and archival methods, I examine how women of different ethnic and socio-economic backgrounds strive to address issues of pollution, illegal dumping and toxic waste contamination in various spheres of life, including family, workplace and civil society. The work begins with a review of the history and of the epistemological frameworks underlying the study of the environment and of waste management in Italy. Drawing on neoliberal globalization scholarship, in Chapters 1 and 2 I highlight how the overwhelming prevalence of nation-state policy frameworks risk marginalizing considerations of gender, race and ethnicity from these studies. In the third chapter (Chapter 3) I refer to environmental justice environment to engage with the emergence of maternal politics among working-class Italian women in rural districts, drawing attention to these groups' strategic use of traditional and even stereotypical understandings of gender roles - motherhood in particular – to obtain political legitimacy in the realms of a male-dominated civil society. In the following two chapters (Chapters 4 and 5), I focus on the role of women's work in promoting and enabling environmentally friendly behaviors in Italian society. Since the 2008 recession, many middle and working-class women have struggled to retain their jobs and further their careers. Drawing from their environmentalist agendas and beliefs, and on widespread stereotypes that women are better suited to care for the environment, many have taken to implementing green initiatives within their places of work. These experiences include creative, entrepreneurial initiatives, such as teachers designing sustainable waste management modules to high-school curricula and tour operators leading clean-up initiatives of landmark neighborhoods, as well as un-negotiable restructuring of job duties, as it is the case with foreign-born care

workers taking on recycling duties for their employers. Although these efforts and tasks may provide a degree of visibility and job security, they also represent instances of unpaid labor performed by women: these observations provide a nuanced understanding of the role and politics of labor embedded into sustainability and development literatures, such as ecological modernization theory and the women-development nexus. By highlighting the role of disenfranchised migrant women in waste regimes, this research provides a new perspective on the global care chain and on the outsourcing of social reproduction.

To my parents Stefano and Bruna, and to all who participated in this study.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The work for this dissertation would not have been possible without the support of the Catherine C. and Bruce A. Bastian Scholarship Fund and of the Department of Sociology at the University of Illinois Urbana Champaign. I would also like to acknowledge the University of Minnesota Transatlantic Summer Institute for the support they provided in the early stages of the work.

I would like to begin by thanking my academic advisors, Doctor Zsuzsa Gille, for her mentorship and for her commitment to this research, and Doctor Tim Liao, for his continued guidance through my graduate studies. I also thank my dissertation committee, Professor Asef Bayat, Professor Behrooz Ghamari and Professor Faranak Miraftab, for their insight and feedback.

I would also like to acknowledge Professors Assata Zerai, Stacy Harwood, Anna Marshall and Ghassan Moussawi for their advice and encouragement with my research, and to Doctor Tim Wedig for giving me the opportunity to teach with LAS Global Studies while completing this dissertation. Shari Day and Mina Seaton in the Department of Sociology for the logistical help they gave through my graduate program.

I thank all my friends and colleagues at the University of Illinois and in the Champaign-Urbana community for a memorable seven years, in academia and beyond: Nick Cragoe, Shwetha Delantamajalu, Ashley Feely, Charles Fogelman, Becky Gresh, Carlie Fieseler, Metka Hercog, Jeff Horwat, Heba Khalil, Tanu Kohli, Julie Krueger, Matt Peach, Stephanie Rieder, Cameron and Katie Riopelle, Negin Sattari, Matt Schneider, Dan Steward, Soo Yeon Yoon and Gehui Zhang. Completing this dissertation would have been much harder without the support and comradeship of my writing group, Soo Yeon Yoon and Negin Sattari, and the encouragement of Stefano De Tito,

Vincenzo De Vendittis, Flavia Grieco, Teria Grieco, Walter Guidotti, Francesca Iengo and Laura Torino.

I cannot emphasize enough how grateful I am for my family: my parents, Stefano and Bruna, my grandmother Renata, my godmother Milena and the rest of my family in Naples - Andrea, Monica, Marina and Renata - for supporting my decision to move abroad, and for being there through the ups and downs of graduate life. A huge thanks to my nieces Arya and Maya, and my siblings Alessandro, Giovanni, Marta, Pinar and Sayan - for the laughter, and for the wonderful trips and visits we shared. And my husband Burn, who shared with me the enthusiasm and struggles of our fieldworks, and for his many comments and suggestions on this text.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCING CAMPANIA’S WASTE CRISIS: METHODOLOGICAL NATIONALISM AND POSTCOLONIAL ECHOES.....	1
CHAPTER TWO: STUDY DESIGN: GLOBAL CONTEXT AND CRITICAL ETHNOGRAPHY.....	34
CHAPTER THREE: MOBILIZING AROUND MOTHERHOOD? ESSENTIALISM, FEMINISM AND CATHOLICISM IN CAMPANIA’S ANTI-WASTE MOVEMENTS.....	59
CHAPTER FOUR: SUPPORTING THE GREEN SECTOR WHEN GARBAGE IS PRIVATE: VOLUNTEERISM, ENTREPRENEURIALISM AND MONOPOLIES.....	90
CHAPTER FIVE: OUTSOURCING ENVIRONMENTAL REPRODUCTION: RECYCLING AS A CHORE FOR MIGRANT CARE WORKERS	118
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSIONS.....	146
REFERENCES.....	159
APPENDIX A: INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRES.....	170
APPENDIX B: INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD APPROVAL LETTER.....	172

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCING CAMPANIA'S WASTE CRISIS: METHODOLOGICAL NATIONALISM AND POSTCOLONIAL ECHOES

"It was terrible when I first came to Naples. There were large piles of trash everywhere, it was hard for the traffic and it was difficult to walk. The neighborhood smelled terribly, everywhere you would go. I remembered being scared, very scared- the trash was everywhere and the city felt violent." (Interview with Ella, July 30 2014)

It was a warm sunny day in July of 2014; Ella, a Kyrgyzstani woman in her mid-forties, described her first encounter with the city of Naples, Italy, about seven years before. Growing unemployment rates in her hometown, but also her family's financial concerns had convinced her to move to Naples, leaving behind a husband, two daughters and soon after, a granddaughter and find work as a home cleaner. Ella's contact in Naples had reassured her of employment opportunities in the city; however, her first encounter, after a long train ride, was quite shocking. Many people living in Naples between 2006 and 2011, myself included, would share part of Ella's feelings of shock, dismay, disgust, fear and exasperation. Faced with a seemingly sudden shortage of urban landfills, trash collection in cities and rural areas became sporadic and illegal dumping in fields and street corners, a habit. At first, these problems appeared mostly in rural, working-class districts, but gradually reached to the rest of the city, to the point of blocking sidewalks, courtyards, monuments and traffic. As Ella's memories highlight, the garbage became omnipresent, and turned even small, everyday actions, like opening a window, buying food or going to work into an ordeal of bad smells, traffic jams, and aggressive moods in the city.

Ella's words introduce the core concerns of my dissertation: What does it mean to live in a European region plagued by toxic waste contamination? How do social identities, such as gender, nationality and class contribute to the way people experience and resist these problems? And what

power structures causes waste to materialize- and accumulate- in particular sites rather than others, at the expenses of particular groups and communities?

In the present day, environmental devastation and environmental racism have emerged as painful and yet widespread reminders of social inequalities aggravating under free-market regimes. Across countries of the Global South, but also in marginalized regions of the so-called Global North, instances of environmental racism against low-income groups and ethnic minorities seem to have become part and parcel of national governments' territorial planning and interventions, particularly on matters of hazardous facilities. Within academic circles, a large and diverse group of authors are engaging with such issues from various perspectives, including social justice (Ageyman, 2013), globalization (Klein, 2014; Mirafteb Wilson and Salo 2015), ecology (Mollet and Faria, 2013), development (Resurrecion, 2013), and social movements, particularly environmental justice (Pellow, 2007; Park and Pellow, 2011), just to name a few. This literature includes both theoretical macro-scale perspectives on environmental degradation, as well as an empirical concern for the everyday material and practical considerations of living in an unsound area.

Environmental sociology and political ecology show that race, gender and class are key to understanding how people experience, cope with and resist these oppressive regimes, in the context of formal politics as well as in everyday forms of resistance. Building upon notions that these relationships are indeed key to understanding social injustices, my work draws attention to other relevant yet somewhat neglected considerations, including migration status, labor, and family lives. These new relationships I examine are particularly relevant in a study of women's experiences of environmental matters: as feminist critics highlight, there is a certain tendency among national governments, international organizations (particularly the World Bank), activists and scholarship to explain women's environmental activism with their gender identities (Resurrecion, 2013). In the

Italian case, these include grassroots' actors, including mothers' against toxic waste groups, but also Catholic leaders, journalists and civil societies (Armiero et al 2015). By drawing attention to environmentalist practices of women's professional, political and family lives simultaneously, my work broadens our understanding of the relationship between place and society, particularly in terms of how different people experience and resist the powerful political and economic agents' intentions to alter, reshape and govern the areas where they live.

Empirically, I focus on the case of Campania, a region in the South of Italy that over the past thirty years has suffered from massive forms of illegal dumping, toxic waste contamination and more recently, expects to become a waste-treatment hub, for Italy and for the European Union. I rely on ethnographic methods to discuss how the emerging environmental devastation as well as the work needed to overcome it reflects upon gender and ethnic relationships. By focusing on women's everyday efforts and engagement with sustainable practices, I highlight existing forms of gender discrimination but also forms of resistance, at the levels of public policy, civil society and everyday life. Furthermore, by comparing narratives collected from a diverse group of women living in Naples, including Italian and foreign-born, low and high income individuals, I argue that environmental and globalization scholars need to pay greater attention to the role low-income and migrant women play in producing clean and sustainable communities.

While the intersection between ethnicity and exposure to environmental hazards is not new to environmental justice scholarship, far too little attention has been given to the role of migrants' paid and unpaid work in enabling sustainable lifestyles. This risks neglecting migrant women's engagement with host societies, beyond the traditional realms of caregiving and domestic work (Raghuram, 2012; Yeates, 2012; Pande, 2012). In the context of environmental scholarship, this also risks understanding sustainable lifestyles as the prerogative of liberal middle classes, a limitation that

is quite frequent even in the works of Western feminist writings of environment such as Schultz, 2003; Shove, 2004; Marres, 2013; Littig, 2014. While the latter scholars have drawn attention to the role of domestic practices in European environmentalist regimes, their underlying notions of gender tend to assume legal citizenship, and an urban and of a middle class social background. Here, I shift the focus to those who actually do the work on behalf of these privileged groups. This includes drawing attention to how some of the EU's sustainable regimes rely on the low-wage, if not unpaid, work of migrants. Furthermore, this approach departs from the predilection of environmental studies to depict large migration flows from developing countries as an avenue for environmental devastation. Through the case of migrant domestic workers in Naples, I make a case for a broader understanding of the role of migrant labor in European waste regimes (Gille, 2016).

The purpose of this chapter is to introduce the history of Campania's waste crisis, as it appeared in the media and in academic literature. Following, I outline the theoretical framework for my dissertation, which draws from theories of neoliberal capitalism modes of accumulation by dispossession (Harvey, 2005; Miraftab Wilson and Salo, 2015), as well as Sassen (2000 and 2003) and Brenner's (2002) description of neoliberalism as reconfiguration of social geographies. Following that, I summarize relevant contributions of environmental justice scholarship within the context of Western nations, highlighting, in particular, their discourse of environmental privilege and racism (Park and Pellow, 2011), and feminist perspectives on the relationship between gender and the environment. Finally, I review existing studies of women's labor migration, highlighting those perspectives and spaces that lend themselves to a better reconsideration of reproductive work with sustainable efforts.

The dissertation is organized as follows. In the first part (Chapters One and Two), I discuss my theoretical and methodological perspectives. The former chapters are summarized above; the

latter draw from studies of relational methodologies, but also insider-outsider ethnographic perspectives. Following (Chapters Three, Four and Five) I discuss in-depth ethnographic data on women's involvement with environmentalist movements and practices, taking care to highlight their contributions to social movements (Chapter Three) but also everyday activities seeking to restore sanitary and green living conditions in the city of Naples and nearby towns. While the insight of migrant and Italian-born women are discussed in both chapters, Chapter Four features predominantly insights from Italian women, whereas Chapter Five specifically highlights the experiences of migrants.

A brief history of Campania's *ecomafias*

In recent years, the city of Naples has become a symbol of environmental mismanagement, in Italy and in the European Union. Beginning in 2006, dramatic images of the city's landmark neighborhoods completely covered in urban garbage have made the front pages of national and international headlines, including *Le Monde* (Ridet, 2013), *The Guardian* (Hooper, 2008), *The Huffington Post* (Fuchs, 2011) and *The New York Times* (Nizza, 2011). Their coverage denounces various social problems, including extensive waste trafficking on the part of local criminal groups, but also the failure of national and regional governments in ensuring regular waste collection services for Campania's citizens and businesses. The majority of this press coverage draws particular attention to criminal organizations' interference with waste management in the region and to the corruption, or inefficiency, of the regional administration. Established national newspapers, such as *Il Corriere*, *La Repubblica* and *Il Mattino*, rarely criticize the role of the Italian government in managing Campania's waste crisis; they also do not show much sympathy for Campanian communities whose daily lives continue to be disrupted. In 2008 for example, the President of the

Republic encouraged zero-tolerance for illegal dumping and waste-related protests in Naples' Chiaiano district (Sannino, 2009).

National newspapers began questioning the Italian government's responsibility in producing Campania's waste crisis towards the end of 2013¹. First, an extensive editorial on the national leftist magazine L'Espresso, titled, "Drink Naples and Die" (Di Feo and Pappaianni, 2013), publicized the findings of a 2007 US Navy intelligence analysis warning US troops and their families to avoid drinking water from the local aqueducts because of toxic waste contamination. Once published, the report generated an animated response, particularly among Neapolitan public opinion. The latter condemned the criminal organization responsible for illegal dumping of toxic waste in proximity to water sources, but even more so against the Italian government's deliberate inaction and secrecy: the editorial in the Espresso is the first document disclosing these widespread environmental threats to the larger public. Based on the NATO report, locals began fearing that these political decisions had endangered the health of entire towns and various neighborhoods. A similar scandal followed suit in December of that same year, when a bi-partisan inquiry committee released the 1997 confessions of Carmine Schiavone, former treasurer of a camorra² clan active in the town of Casal di Principe³ (Campania). After his arrest in 1991, Schiavone began collaborating with law enforcement by sharing details about his involvement with waste trafficking of various materials, including nuclear sludge, extending from Germany and Northern Italy to the northeastern provinces of Campania (Di Feo and Pappaianni, 2013).

¹ In Chapter Three, I highlight the role of women's environmentalist activism in determining this shift

² Mafia-like criminal organization dating at least to the 1820s, with a strong territorial base in Naples

³ For many years, this clan has gone by the name of Casalesi, after the town they are based in. More recently however, anti-camorra efforts in the city have re-claimed the word's original meaning of "Inhabitants of Casal di Principe" to distinguish themselves from criminal actors but also to rehabilitate the reputation of their towns

Locally, these interconnected issues of illegal waste trafficking and complacent national governments are known as “eco-mafias,” a term coined by the national environmentalist organization Legambiente to denounce environmental devastation and waste trafficking in Campania (Legambiente, 2013). Although public attention to waste in Campania is rather recent, criminologists, historians and environmentalist organizations, Legambiente in particular, trace ecomafias back to the mid-1980s, if not earlier, when the newly established Italian Ministry of the Environment mandated, for the first time in Italy, a nationally-integrated waste management plan. This period coincides with the failure of the Southern Fund, a post-World War II development project that included the agricultural and industrial development in Southern Italy. In the case of Campania, these funds were used predominantly for infrastructural and industrial development of the region’s inland peripheries (Lepore and Padovani, 2013).

Lepore and Padovani’s (2013) and Andretta’s (2009) historical research reveals that the relatively industrial development in Campania’s inland failed once the subsidies of the Southern Fund and Italian government ended. The loss of factory jobs, coupled with the environmental damage that the closing industrial plants brought to the area’s agricultural surface generated massive internal migration, particularly of younger generations, towards the cities of Naples and Caserta. These abandoned peripheries rapidly became a palatable investment to local camorra clans for the purpose of authorized and unauthorized real estate development, and for waste trafficking (Andretta, 2009). Local clans expanded their businesses to waste transportation and disposal, offering inexpensive waste disposal packages to industries not only located in the North of Italy, but also in Germany and France (Andretta, 2009; Fuchs, 2011; Armiero, 2015). In his study of the role of camorra in southern Italian society, Roberto Saviano (2006) highlights how these criminally-managed waste businesses provided falsified EU certificates to acquire the trust of businesspersons, which and argument that some use to exonerate corporations using these questionable waste

services. Andretta, however, has criticized this interpretation by highlighting how arrangement for waste transportation and allegedly lawful disposal that waste companies affiliated with clans were offering, charged about 20% of the market price, a figure that should have raised a red flag to any law-abiding entrepreneur (Andretta, 2009).

Ecomafias in Campania depended on criminal actors' access to abandoned fields and caves in isolated and low-income areas. Criminal investigations have shown that these organizations also had illegal access to certified and professional urban landfills, which thus, became contaminated, and reached capacity more rapidly than governing bodies would have projected (Di Feo and Pappaianni, 2013; Graziani, 2013). This in turn led to three major problems. First, shortage of landfill space for urban needs, which gradually caused interruptions of trash collection services; second, widespread contamination, particularly in regions surrounding illegal dumpsites and in rural areas, where criminal actors took to burning their own dumpsites in an attempt to render the materials untraceable. Finally, the accumulation of growing volumes of urban trash and recyclables in temporary collection sites established to alleviate the lack of landfill space; the rapid decay that these materials encountered in these open-air facilities further aggravated concerns for soil and groundwater contamination (Ortolani, 2010). These three issues represent the major challenges facing the Italian and Campania's governments, and at least formally, the goals of the waste management framework proposed by the commissioner's office in 1996, 1998 and 2008. While such legislation sought to reduce the volume of landfill waste by increasing urban recycling and using new incinerators to generate renewable energies, the lack of accountability on the part of the Commissioners' office, as well as extensive use of landfills and incinerators met with the resistance of local environmentalist groups (D'Alisa et al. 2010).

National and transnational waste governance frameworks in Campania

In the previous section I highlighted how Campania's problems of trash collection, accumulation and contamination are closely related; however, the policies and interventions endorsed by the commissioners' office, as well as government propaganda, somehow separated issues of toxic waste contamination from ones of trash collection and accumulation of garbage in temporary storage sites (Dines, 2013). According to D'Alisa and co-authors (D'Alisa et al, 2010), the measures proposed by subsequent commissioners' offices between 2007 and 2008 seek to eliminate the visible problem of trash accumulation in the fastest way possible; whether this be in the streets of Naples or in the open-air temporary collection sites in the rural provinces of Acerra. The urge to eliminate massive volumes of refuse urged the national government to fund additional incinerators, further leading the Italian government to accept the bid of a German company, the A2A, in spite of the lack of a reliable risk assessment, or credible energy returns from the plant (D'Alisa et al. 2010). Images of uncollected garbage in Naples made the headlines of national newspapers regularly, urging public opinion to support the regional administration to install additional landfills and incinerators (Dines, 2013). However, problems of toxic waste contamination in the region's rural peripheries, and of the potential health hazards that incinerating unidentifiable materials could bring to the region, remain little known to the public at large (Armiero, 2016). While there is only one active incinerator in Campania, a plant that according to environmentalist organizations hardly reaches 40% of its capacity, over the years, the target number of incinerators increased, from one to three and from three to eight as of 2015, only to return to three in 2016.

Several environmentalist organizations, particularly Legambiente and environmental scholars criticized these interventions extensively. These critiques included the potential uses of these numerous new facilities, whose capacity went way beyond the regional needs and would thus, serve the needs of the national populations. Second, these additional incinerators and landfills were to be built in the same neighborhoods and districts experiencing years of illegal dumping. As waste

scholarship shows, the practice of officially sanctioning an illegal landfill is a common occurrence all over the world as is the resistance to such moves, thus legitimizing what Lerner refers to as ‘sacrifice zones’ (Lerner, 2010). These are sites where the toxic byproducts of modern consumerism can be dealt with, relatively hidden from public scrutiny, in order for industrial production to exist (Gille, 2002). In the case of Campania, the grassroots response to proposals of new incinerators and landfills at times turned militant, particularly in sites that had suffered from illegal dumping in the past (Armiero, 2008).

The involvement of the national government in Campania’s waste administration is extensive and somewhat exceptional, as the EU framework for waste administration, outlined in the EU Waste Directives, is a highly decentralizing (Fagan, 2004) one that encourages on-site waste treatment and indicates maximum distances between the sites of production and disposal of waste (Gille, 2012). Within this framework, regional administrations are the main authorities in designing and implementing local waste management plans, with national governments providing support and suggestions for interregional coordination (Fagan, 2004). While national governments have some authority in determining how to implement the EU Waste Directives, failure to comply may result in fines and sanctions from the EU Court of Justice (Fagan, 2004).

In Campania, regional governments’ apparent inability to produce an effective waste management plan had pushed then prime minister Ciampi to declare a state of regional emergency in 1992. Institutionally, this decree centralized waste administration in the figure of an Extraordinary Commissioner for the Management of Refuse (D’Alisa et al. 2012), an officer nominated by the Prime Minister to oversee and manage all waste-related matters in the area (Corona and Fortini, 2013)⁴. These two institutions, the state of regional emergency and the commissioning of waste

⁴ Campania is the first region to declare a state of emergency due to waste problems, with Sicily following suit in 1998 and Calabria in 2016

administration to a national official, ended in 2009. The authority of the commissioner expanded from drawing an integrated waste management plan for the region to writing criminal and civil law pertaining to waste practices, and finally to mobilizing police and army forces to contain waste protests. Although many of these regulations were later deemed unconstitutional and repealed, the office and authority of the commissioner as a whole represents a significant interruption of the rule of law.

The five years prior to the official end of the waste emergency saw tensions and mistrust between the realms of national governance, as represented by the escalating practice of the commissioning of regional waste management and local communities, particularly among the areas designated for opening (or re-opening) incinerators and landfills (De Biase, 2015). First, several commissioners openly embraced a “zero-tolerance” policy against illegal dumping, and towards any activist effort seeking to counter these plans; these tensions only exacerbated once the authority of the commissioner expanded to authorizing military surveillance over the sites designated for the new waste facilities, and to contain demonstrations opposing them (Armiero, 2008). In addition, many of the designated commissioners had dubious reputations if not outright conflicts of interest in their role. These figures include Campania’s former governor, the leftist democrat Bassolino, in office as a commissioner between the years 2000 and 2004. More recently, for the first half of 2008, Gianni De Gennaro, CEO of the defense equipment company Finmeccanica and former chief of Police, on trial for human rights’ violation since the 2001 G8 protests in Genoa, when he ordered the brutal beating of protestors. Finally, later in 2008 the nominee was transferred to the Head of the Civil Protection branch of the Army Guido Bertolaso.

From a legal standpoint, the most controversial laws produced under this administrative mode concern the permission to operate without prior health and environmental risk assessment to

waste treatment plants, including incinerators and landfills in Campania, by which industrial and toxic waste can be burnt legally in Campania's only incinerator (D'Alisa et al. 2012). Additional regulations include expanding the legal definition of illicit waste trafficking to include any form of transportation, treatment, use or disposal of waste materials on the part of anyone but designated trash collectors, and elevating such acts from a national rank of misdemeanor to one of felony (Integrative Decree 195). While designed to counter waste trafficking, these new laws received extensive criticism from the Italian judiciary. The two main points of contention included the constitutional legitimacy of redefining as felonies acts that in the remaining Italian regions are misdemeanors, but also considering the illicit transportation of waste as proof of the intent and act of illegal dumping (Corriere della Sera, 2013). As I analyze it in Chapter Four, this policy created an antagonistic relationship between trash collection companies, many of them municipal monopolies, and grassroots organizations seeking to establish neighborhood recycling schedules.

The lack of dialogue between the realms of national governance represented by the Waste Commissioner and local claims are key to understanding the relationship between Campania's activists and the European Union Commission and the practices of other EU countries. The European Union Commission became involved with Campania's case in 2008, sending inspectors to oversee the conditions of Acerra's incinerator and of several landfills and dumpsites in the provinces of Serre, Terzigno and Naples (Ortolani, 2010). Upon discovering that state authorities had actively been dumping hazardous materials in flimsy or impromptu landfills, a coalition of local anti-waste movements and public officials appealed to the European Commission to take action against the Italian national government. As of July 2015, the Italian government owes the EU a fine of 20 million Euros, plus E 120,000 per each additional day, for failure to implement the EU waste directives concerning waste collection and management (General Court of the European Union, 2013; La Repubblica, 2015).

As of 2016, the sanctions mandate by the European Commission, particularly the prospect of paying heavy fines, have been decisive in re-regulating the use of select urban landfills uniquely for inert materials produced by local communities. In addition to these concrete results, the intervention of the European Union Commission helped legitimize anti-waste efforts with both national and local public opinions, validating activists' efforts. Informants recounted how their mobilization had been met with harsh criticism on the part of national and regional representatives, whom had described their efforts as violent, uneducated and possibly complacent with organized crime. The majority of the Democratic Party (PD) and all right-wing political parties described the proposed landfills and incinerators as an unpopular, but unavoidable outcome of the city's high-consumption rates and scarce recycling habits (Corona, 2009). In response to the critique and harsh legislation of a government describing their efforts as backwards, uncivilized and criminal, social movements could thus, count upon the European Union as a third party- perhaps more prestigious than the Italian State- to support their claims.

I don't think that the Civil Protection, or anyone really, anticipated that the (EU) inspectors would actually want to go inside the landfills. But that is exactly what she did in Cava Sari- she put on a helmet and gloves and asked us to escort her in the landfill. Once we reached the bottom of the cave, she began moving things around. She found cans of paint, solvents, even old truck tires...all there, dumped in the cave. The same cave that government officials had assured her was just a local landfill, where only authorized personnel could go. She was furious!" (Interview with Jake, November 7 2014).

The excerpt above is taken from an interview with a representative of the Vesuvius National Park organizing against the installment of large landfills in the protected area, but I have collected similar stories from groups mobilizing in other parts of Campania. These narratives highlight in particular how activists felt validated and comforted by the outrage the EU inspectors felt towards the Civil Protection and Italian government officials for their reckless behavior.

At the national level, criticism of these social movements, as well as plans to further the region's incinerator and landfill capacities are still in place (Giliberti, 2016). However, some left-wing parties, particularly the Five Star Movement (M5S) and the Left, Ecology and Liberty (SEL) have begun enlisting Campania's anti-waste activists into their ranks and electorate (Sarli, 2015). Disputes and criminal investigations still surround the design and operation of Campania's only incinerator: It was built in 2009 as a traditional plant, unequipped to treat hazardous waste and virtually useless for power generation; companies charged with building this plant, as well as the additional incinerators, are also facing criminal investigations (D'Alisa et al. 2012). Campania's regional waste plan still features eight additional plants, expanding to the provinces of Salerno, Campania's second largest city, an area that before 2014 had not been considered for siting (Corriere del Mezzogiorno, 2015).

Campania's Waste Crisis in local and expat literatures

The emergence of such a large-scale and contested crisis of waste generated a vast range of research, not only at the academic level but also within the court of law and public research institutions; these studies come from a variety of disciplines, including criminology, law, public health and social movements. Unsurprisingly, the majority of researchers interested in such topics are local or those originally from Naples or Southern Italy and work in a variety of contexts, including local universities, research centers, and international institutions.

The majority of the scholarship on Campania's waste crisis has focused on its criminal aspects, particularly on the involvement of camorra clans, and on institutional perspectives. This literature can be found predominantly in the Italian historical review *Meridiana* (Issue 64:2009) and a selected number in *Modern Italy* (Laino, 2010; Pasotti, 2010; Piazza, 2011). This work is produced by Italian institutes such as the National Research Center (CRN) and the Assise, which have favored

top-down, institutional perspectives and criminology, though recently a few authors of the Assise have used ethnographic perspectives (Capone, 2015). Consistently with the tradition of these reviews, this scholarship has provided detailed recounts of government interventions and infrastructure and on the crimes of local mobs and on the geological characteristics of Campania's landscape as a source of concern for illegal dumping (Andretta, 2009; Corona, 2009; Laino, 2010). The literature thus draws attention to the growing presence of criminal organizations in the area and to growing concerns for toxic contamination. In addition, some authors have offered comparative and historical analyses of waste governance in Italy, highlighting various challenges faced by governing bodies (Sereneri, 2005; Bevilacqua, 2009).

I have two main critiques of this second set of literatures: first, it understands Campania's case in its exceptionality and isolation from external, in particular, from extra-national forces; as such, it falls into what Wimmer and Glick Schiller define as methodological nationalism (Wimmer and Glick-Schiller, 2002), i.e. understanding political power and grassroots agency largely within national boundaries. This is not entirely surprising, nor is it necessarily a fault of the work. The bulk of transnational methodologies have developed largely outside of Italy, and to this day, traditionalist US academics would count them as a subfield or "niche" topics. Furthermore, in the context of federally-funded, semi tuition free public universities, access to international or second language scholarship may be limiting. However, as Massard-Guilbaud and Thorsheim (2007) suggest, Italian environmental historiography has grown in close contact with the emerging Anglo-American paradigm. In occasion of the journal *Meridiana's* 25th anniversary, Gabriella Corona and Rocco Sciarrone (2012) do not hesitate to cite, specifically, transnational methodologies as "the exciting challenge for new environmental histories." The reluctance to engage actively with a transnational framework however limits the extent to which this literature is able to define the interplay between

local and global, legitimate and illegitimate stakeholders in shaping environmental crime and racisms nowadays (Wolf, 2011).

Second, many of these scholars' critiques of rural and peripheral communities' anti-waste protests reinforces the kind of victim-blaming rhetoric I mentioned earlier in this chapter. Authors like Corona and Fortini (2013) explicitly and extensively dismissed the health concerns of local populations as lacking any empirical basis, in spite of the Waste Commission's explicit ban of health risk assessments for the proposed plants, but also in spite of the EU Waste Directives. Political scientist Eleonora Pasotti (2010) opens her article by stating, (though not really explaining), the lack of a causal correlation between global forces and Campania's waste crisis and proceeds to blame it on the lack of civility among local citizens.

An alternative, smaller set of scholarship has sought to support grassroots' mobilizations denouncing toxic waste contamination, but also the legitimacy of the national government's plan to install new waste treatment facilities in Campania (D'Alisa et al. 2012). Scholars operating under these premises, such as Nick Dines (2013), Serena Iovino (2008), and Marco Armiero (2008 and 2010), just to name a few, have applied an environmental justice framework to Campania's waste problems. With some exceptions, their work appears in international, English language journals and publications. Many of these authors are working abroad or in research institutions the Italian government does not directly fund that.

Starting in 2008, this smaller scholarship has worked predominantly in two directions: critiquing national government interventions and debunking attacks on anti-waste grassroots organizations. In an article appearing in *Ecological Economics*, economist Giacomo D'Alisa and co-authors (2010) have denounced a series of fiscal and environmental frauds underlying Campania's only active incinerator. In 1998, the Italian government launched a bid to build and manage nine

different waste treatment facilities in Campania, two traditional incinerators and seven *termovalorizzatori*, high-efficiency plants transforming waste into refuse-derived fuels (Rabitti, 2008; D'Alisa et al. 2010). While the bid was still opened, the Italian-German FIBE consortium, the Commissioner and the Italian Bank Association ABI negotiated a deal with the Commissioner's office allowing specifically FIBE to improve drastically its costs and time of installation. The agreement included a deliver-to-pay incentive for municipalities delivering a certain amount of undifferentiated materials to the incinerators; this agreement was only possible through a 7% increase in electricity bills funding renewable energies, which the Commissioners' office agreed to extend to traditional incinerating plants. The agreement also allowed FIBE to stock materials in the vicinity of its sites, rather than send them to other parts of Italy for immediate treatment. As FIBE was the only participant to be included in these negotiations, it won the bid regardless of the poor technology and environmental value of its plants. After winning the bid, FIBE was further guaranteed the authority to decide where to install its facilities, without having to undergo any type of health and environmental verification, nor include any local participation; the town of Acerra, northeast of Naples, was the designated location (D'Alisa et al. 2010). In 2008, in light of the criminal charges that Impregilo, CEO of FIBE, was facing, Commissioner Bertolaso appointed the A2A consortium to run and manage waste in Campania, while FIBE still maintains its rights over Acerra's incinerator (Greyl et al. 2013). With a similar political intent, historian and later senior editor of *Capitalism Nature Socialism*, Marco Armiero has authored and supported a series of ethnographies of anti-waste protests (Armiero, 2008; Armiero and D'Alisa, 2010; Armiero et al. 2015).

These works strive to dispel stereotypes and accusations of anti-waste protesters as violent, ignorant and misinformed, but also to reconnect these ongoing environmental justice efforts to similar cases in other parts of the world. In addition, D'Alisa and coauthors have drawn attention to

Campania's waste regulations and the agreements that the commissioner made with ABI disincentive recycling. While I discuss this matter in more depth and context in Chapter Four, I want to stress that the economic incentives for municipalities to deliver unsorted materials, coupled with the costs that these administrations incur to send recyclables abroad or to other parts of Italy (Legambiente, 2013) problematize, and debunk the idea of Naples' trash emergency being a consequence of locals' lack of recycling. This mention of globalization acknowledges the similarities of environmental justice efforts around the globe and highlight the role of online resources in forging alliances, solidarities and commonality of repertoires to emerge of such movements. Drawing from political ecology and environmental justice scholarships, including Midwestern and Latin American case studies, these studies hint at- but do not quite address- methodological questions about the role of insider/outsider research (Iovino, 2015). These scholars, in part, further identify ethical and theoretical concerns on how to frame and situate environmental justice in western countries in relation to the growing scholarship focused on the Global South (Armiero, 2013).

Equating what happens in Campania in terms of illegal dumping with somewhat similar instances in the Global South risks overlooking some of the global privileges that Campania's citizenry enjoys. These include the right to appeal to governing bodies of the European Union, but also darker global practices, such as outsourcing the management of household and hazardous waste to ethnic minorities or shipping unidentifiable waste materials to developing countries (See Chapters Five and Six). As Armiero (2013) and Iovino (2008) point out, internet access and social media, besides coordinating activists' efforts, allowed for information on waste treatment to become part of local culture, even among people with low educational levels (Armiero, 2013). These technologies further foster the involvement of scholars and people from abroad or distant places (Iovino, 2008). Commonalities among cases of environmental racism, and emerging environmental justice

movements are indeed a recurring theme in current scholarship, within developing and wealthier societies. However, what I find missing from these studies is a discussion of how global forces which are simultaneously at the receiving and generating ends of environmental injustices, operate in Campania. Such a focus requires that one considers the intersections between global and local inequalities along gender, class and race and to locate Campania's case in the context of exacerbating global inequalities

Although somewhat offbeat and very much distant from Italian environmental historiography, literary criticist Pasquale Verdicchio's notion of Southern Italian post-colonialism might provide a useful avenue to reconsider Campania's relational position in a historical and global context, including North-South inequalities at the national and international level. Verdicchio's (1997) argument is based on archival research of late 18th and 19th century literary and political poetry surrounding the process of unification of the peninsula, as well as diplomatic sources discussing the newborn nation's colonial expansion in Libya and Eritrea. By highlighting the colonialist tone of pro-unification poetry, Verdicchio acknowledges the imperial logic behind the movements of 1848-60, suggesting that the history of Southern Italian underdevelopment can benefit from postcolonial frameworks. At the same time, this framework builds upon the oppression of North African countries and people of color, as an integral part of top-down development efforts into Southern Italy.

By placing Southern Italian societies as simultaneously suffering from, and generating new forms of transnational inequalities, Verdicchio shed some light on the global dimensions of this area's history, and suggests possible frameworks to address present-day inequalities. In the context of this study, this means a) discussing the involvement of migrant workers in Campania's waste crisis, and b) acknowledging Campania's waste crisis as the product of global inequalities and

exploitation, while not minimizing the area's involvement and privileged position vis-à-vis developing countries. Furthermore, by placing inequalities in Southern Italy in relation to both the power of northern regions and to poorer parts of the globe, Verdicchio's arguments effectively undermine the methodological nationalism underlying much of the existing studies of Campania's waste crisis. While confirming that intra-Italian inequalities are certainly not recent, Verdicchio highlights that they have never been a mere local or national question. I will return to these considerations of postcolonial and relational methodologies in the next chapter. The following section elaborates on the theoretical framework underlying my notion of Campania's waste crisis as a global phenomenon.

Theoretical framework

Neoliberal globalization: Waste treatment hubs as re-territorialization

Neoliberal globalization theory is broad and incorporates various perspectives on present-day societies. While neoliberal governance, markets and practices can vary greatly, within and across different regions, the most basic notion of neoliberalism is one where the role of nation-states in various aspects of social life decreases in favor of local/regional and transnational actors and networks to intervene in matters of public life (Hart, 2008). On a smaller scale, neoliberal capitalism implies new notions of personhood, extending to economic actors the rights and duties previously restricted to citizens, but also expanding the role of individual actors in determining their lives, problems and opportunities (Harvey, 2007).

While optimistic approaches to large-scale privatization of public services and reduction of labor laws are still dominant all over the world, extensive scholarship in transnational and globalization studies have critiqued it, on at least two major accounts. First, the aggravating social inequalities and divides - between the Global North and the Global South, but also within smaller

regions (Wallerstein, 2004) challenge the notion that neoliberal reforms can foster social and economic growth. Free market economies have given way to reckless competition and exploitation of natural resources, exacerbating social inequalities between wealthy and developing countries, but also within nations (Mahler and Pessar, 2001; Hart, 2000; Guarnizo and Smith, 1998). Second, while these policies advocate for a reduction of state power, nation-state apparatuses in fact play a central role in producing these allegedly free markets. Authors such as Saskia Sassen (1999, 2000 and 2003), Neil Brenner (2000 and 2002) and more recently, Block and Somers (2014) have highlighted how the deregulation of markets in fact rests on physical, institutional and ideological infrastructures that are still largely determined at the level of national governance: part of such market-enabling infrastructure may, for example, include waste treatment facilities.

Theories of spatial reconfigurations in a neoliberal context share the basic idea that as national governments seek to keep capital flow within the nation, they strategize to diversify the economic appeal of different regions in order to reduce internal competition (Sassen, 2000; Brenner, 2002; Block and Somers, 2014). Some of these strategies include offering tax breaks to economic actors, such as curbing labor protection laws but also environmental regulations (Doherty et al., 2000; Mirafteb, Wilson and Salo, 2015). As these measures create a vulnerable labor force and readily available lands at the level of particular areas, they reconfigure social geographies according to the needs and trends of market forces; by doing so, they are essentially reproducing a capitalist logic of accumulation by dispossession and curbing any notion of redistributive justice (Purcell, 2014). Theories of neoliberal de-territorialization or re-territorialization can clarify the role of nation-states in producing global inequalities across their territories. For the case at hand, two additional aspects of neoliberal globalization are relevant: these pertain to the EU's transnational governance, particularly in relation to the environment, and to the concrete experiences I found at the research site and to the EU's transnational governance, particularly in relation to the environment.

Concrete experiences of Neoliberal restructuring across countries, regions and times are varied and contradictory (Massey, 1994; Brenner and Theodore, 2002; Harvey, 2007). In their introduction to a special issue on concrete experiences of neoliberalism in present-day cities, Brenner and Theodore (2002) highlight how neoliberal “actual experiences of neoliberalism” result from negotiation and contestations between a variety of actors. Free-market ideologies must adapt or make seeming changes in response to damage done by previous waves or structural adjustment plans. Their observations reflect Doreen Massey’s (1994 and 2004) understanding of social changes within a particular region as the outcome of the interplay between internal and external actors, but also Saskia Sassen’s (2000) attention to the role of material infrastructure supporting free market forces in determining concrete, local experiences of neoliberal restructuring.

For this study, a concrete approach to neoliberalism allows focusing various relevant elements; including how these territorial reconfigurations affect everyday lives and livelihoods, in the context of Italy and Campania, but also within the European Union. Here, this approach can be productive on two accounts. First, it draws attention to the role of EU governance, and of the EU as an imagined and legitimizing category, in the contest of anti-waste mobilizations. In Chapter Four, I discuss the role of municipal monopolies for trash collection in the provinces of Naples, which, I argue, are only apparent contradictions to the “ban” of state interventionism and create clear-cut distinctions between those who, by law, can profit from a local green economy of waste and those who cannot.

Although the EU claims and at least in part enjoys the reputation for more “humane” notions of globalization, it is of course a neoliberal organization: as such, it is not surprising to find neoliberally-minded erosions of civil and labor rights among frequent criticism raised against its structure and mission (Doherty et al. 2000). In spite of its democratic ideology, wealthier countries

of central and northern Europe bear substantively more weight in terms of policy-making than Eastern and Mediterranean regions. Many fundamental policies concern the standardization of production and consumption, but also of environmental protections. Authors such as Elizabeth Dunn (2005) and Zsuzsa Gille (2016) have highlighted how the new standards are based on pre-existing practices of wealthier nations and of large industrial groups. Imposing such standards to societies with different economic backgrounds and histories renders this process extremely burdensome, particularly for smaller businesses needing to adjust their expenses to meet such standards (Dunn, 2005). A similar observation can be made concerning the standardization of waste policies. While the European Union Commission intervened in support of Campania's anti-waste movements and formally condemned the actions of the Italian government (European Commission, 2013), the cost of waste treatment it imposes may have compromised the survival of smaller industries. While it would be absurd to blame waste traffic on EU waste regulations, the exclusion of certain business and industrial actors from legal environmental practices is certainly not unprecedented (Barry, 2006). In the following section I return to the issues of environmental governance and EU capitalisms as I discuss the role of ecological modernization theory in relation to environmental justice movements.

Gendered perspectives on ecological modernization and environmental justice

Environmental governance presents neoliberal governance, at the level of nation states but even more so within supranational and international organizations with an apparent contradiction: while the free-labor market principle demands limited state interventions and deregulation of labor markets, the need for environmental preservation calls for stricter regulations across multiple spheres of life (Fagan, 2004). This contradiction, as well as unprecedented rates of human-made

environmental devastation and racism, (particularly in the Global South), are recurring themes for two relevant perspectives for this dissertation: ecological modernization and environmental justice.

Ecological modernization theory emerged in the 1980s with the aim of reconciling modern capitalism with social justice efforts and environmental sustainability (Mol, 2000). The theory proposes that by investing in the development of green technologies and infrastructure, national governments, but particularly the private sector, will be able to generate employment opportunities while tending to the needs of the environment. These developments include renewable energies, efficient buildings and infrastructure, and especially recovery of materials (Fagan, 2004). Ecological modernization theory seemingly reconciles neoliberalism's contradictory relationship with the environment by designating the private sector as a central stakeholder: unsurprisingly, wealthy nations such as Japan and the European Union embraced it somewhat, at least formally (Baker, 2007). At the same time, much of the progress that the green sector has produced in these societies, in terms of toxic waste contamination in particular, is the direct outcome of the outsourcing of these hazards to developing countries, through legal and illegal means (Pellow and Brehm, 2013).

Many EU countries have been quite successful in enlisting public opinions into environmental policies based on the principles of ecological modernization. Such examples include rate increases in domestic and urban recycling in many Central European countries, and the consensus around the morality and environmental soundness of these practices (Fagan, 2004). However, these shifts come with two substantive limitations. First, the green economy, in the EU as elsewhere, has indeed created employment opportunities, particularly in the recycling industry. At the same time, technological limitations, but more importantly, the erosion of labor rights are shaping these allegedly green jobs into low-wage, dangerous and dirty work. Gregson's (Gregson et al. 2015) study of recycling plants in the UK is one such example. Second, while green reforms of

everyday life, in the form of sustainable consumerism and recycling practices may be successful at the household level, sustainable approaches to production and industrial waste management/recovery still lag behind (Schultz, 1998; Doherty et al, 2000; Fagan, 2004). As feminist critics have pointed out, these reforms are thus, environmentally inefficient, while increasing the social and material burdens of domestic labor, both paid and unpaid.

Environmental justice theories appeared in the 1970s to denounce social inequalities generated by, and emerging from environmental devastation, at the global and local scales (Gloud, 1998; Pellow, 2007). While prominent in sociology, this perspective is inter- and supra-disciplinary, as it engages with issues of community health, public policy and social movements (Bullard and Johnson, 2000). Environmental justice frameworks thus, bring together the efforts of grassroots actors with liberally-minded public opinion and intellectuals seeking to denounce the over-exposure of marginalized groups and racial minorities to human-made environmental hazards and devastation (Erns, 1994; Mohai, Pellow and Roberts, 2009). Some of the recurring concerns of this scholarship include the role of modern capitalism as a patriarchal and imperialist regime threatening at once the survival of women, communities in the Global South and the environment (Gould, 1998; Mies, 1998; Shiva, 1989; Bullard and Johnson, 2000; Hanson, 2016, Rocheleau et al. 2003). For the purposes of this dissertation, environmental justice approaches to race and gender are key.

Cases of illegal dumping have played a key role in the emergence of a theoretical, yet flexible and place-specific framework or analysis (Pellow, 2004), particularly in the literature focusing on the United States. Early studies of legal waste disposal and illegal dumping pose questions concerning the relationship between poverty, race and environmental hazards, with Bullard (1990), Bullard and Johnson (2000) and Pellow (2004) highlighting the overwhelming concentration of landfills, dumpsites and incinerators in low-income, African-American majority areas. While the lack of

political representation (real or presumed), coupled with the economic power of toxic facilities in these areas, renders these communities vulnerable to what Miraftab and Wilson (2015) define as “vulture capitalism,” grassroots’ mobilizations do arise, oftentimes without companies or government expecting it (Rocheleau et al. 1998 and 2003). These mobilizations not only challenge the assumptions of inertia that economic and government actors made when deciding upon the location for controversial facilities, but also the discriminatory treatment that modern governments apply to their subjects (Ernst, 1994; Mohai, Pellow and Roberts, 2007).

Indeed, government and corporate actors enjoy much leeway, in terms of co-opting the support of wealthier white citizens and of the scientific communities tasked with assessing the risks of these facilities (Gould, 1998). However, the production of top-down, scientific knowledge is also oftentimes contested by notions of everyday expertise, of nature and of bodies, on the part of affected communities. As I highlighted in a subsequent section, the role of adult women in particular, stands out in medical and social scientific discussion of environmental concerns (Rocheleau et al. 1998).

Discussions of race are for the most part absent from discussions on Campania’s waste crisis, with some authors hurriedly comparing the situation of Southern populations with the ones of African Americans in the USA (Saviano, 2006). However, US environmental justice scholarship has produced extensive studies on the synergy between governing bodies, corporations and criminal actors in producing environmental devastation at the level of low-income communities (Pellow, 2007). These findings resonate with Campania’s case, particularly in the willingness to take risks- after all, waste infrastructure in Campania no longer requires safety checks- but also in terms of assuming a path of least resistance from local communities. Many of the areas targeted for illegal dumping and later, landfills are in fact, low-income and seemingly politically inactive. Other

communities, however, were coming from years of growth and gentrification, in part due to national and regional funding for nearby natural preservation spaces. These alternative, sustainable avenues for development, I argue, played a central role in generating prolonged social movements among Vesuvius communities, but also in the Neapolitan neighborhood of Chiaiano.

The relationship between gender and the environment is a recurring theme in studies of environmental justice as well as eco-feminism, feminist political ecology and development. While reaching across disciplines and methodologies, these studies focus on several issues. These include the disproportional victimization of women in human-made environmental disasters (Shiva, 1989; Resurrecion, 2013; Littig, 2014); the feminization of environmental concerns, i.e. the assimilation of sustainable practices to unpaid reproductive labor (Schultz, 2003; Reed, 2000; Littig, 2014); and women's participation in green initiatives (Shiva, 1989 and 2003; Salleh, 2003; Resurrecion, 2010).

Starting from the former, with the expression “feminization (or housewife-ization) of environmental concerns, Reed (2000), Resurrecion (2010) and Littig (2014) critique those processes by which present-day societies construct sustainable behavior as part of women’s traditional responsibilities to care for others and for the built-in environment: by this logic, environmentalism appears as a natural extension of social reproduction. This perspective is particularly common among feminist critiques, especially in Western Europe, in response to national and EU regulations insisting on sustainable consumerism and recycling as key components of modern and sustainable lifestyles (Littig, 2014). While acknowledging the value of these practices on a micro scale, these scholars take exception to the lack of strict regulations limiting industrial pollution and waste, which cause much more environmental devastation than household recycling or food waste (Hetherington, 2004; Schultz, 1998 and 2003, Littig, 2014). These critics argue that neoliberal governance of the environment (and waste) are transferring the moral and material burdens of sustainability from the

predominantly male C.E.O.s of large industries and retail to women's unpaid domestic work (Bonatti, 2015).

Ecofeminist and feminist political ecologist scholarship emerging from Western universities as well as grassroots activism have discussed extensively the relationship between women or womanhood and the environment, in terms of essentialist and/or spiritual ties, but also in relation to gender structures (Salleh, 2003). These discussions inform scholarship on women's involvement in environmental movements, but also development projects seeking to combine issues of gender inequality with economic growth and environmental devastation (Reed, 2000; Hanson, 2009; Gaard, 2011; Resurrecion, 2010). The most contentious elements in this debate concern the nature (Salleh, 2003; MacGregor, 2011) and politics of the relationship between women and nature (Reed, 2000; Salleh, 2003; MacGregor, 2011; Resurrecion, 2013)

Structuralist ecofeminists and political ecologists have critiqued spiritualist notions tying women and nature for essentializing gender roles, for example by claiming that women's involvement with caregiving work, but also spiritual ties with nature makes them better-suited to tend for the environment than men (Salleh, 2003). While these discourses operating at the level of grassroots' organizations actually make a strategic use of essentialism in the context of resistance to global capitalism (Salleh, 2003), authors like Reed (2000) and McGregor (2011) focus their criticism on academic and development agencies (Resurrecion, 2010) for assuming such a relationship. Reed (2000), in particular, denounces a certain trend within Western-centric development literatures to overemphasize the relevance of traditional gender roles, and of women's oppression, in their studies of development in the Global South. This sexism, Reed argues, is more reflective of the gender assumptions of academics than of real-life concerns of environmentalist (and anti-environmentalist) efforts. Resurrecion (2013) found a similar trend in World Bank initiatives in various countries of

the Global South, and argued that while increasing women's wages, co-opting gendered ideologies of care into the green economy is incompatible with gender equity efforts.

Feminization of environmental protests are a recurring theme in this dissertation, which will be the focus of Chapters Three to Six. In the context of Campania, women's, but particularly mothers against waste movements have become extremely common in mobilizing against both government interventions and criminal organizations. While notions of motherhood may seem intuitive and catchy, as Piper and McGregor (2007) and McGregor (2011) point out, they are not necessarily homogeneous, as are the motives behind activists' (and scholars') rationale for employing them. The presence of maternal movements in a European country, however, bears witness to some "neglected commonalities" between environmental justice movements in the Global North and in the Global South. Nevertheless, the fact that maternal discourses are widespread among grassroots organizations does not imply that the social contexts producing them are similar: rather than assuming that disenfranchised women mobilize around traditional gender identities because they are poor and/or backward, one must investigate the rationale behind maternalism in each specific site.

The literature discussed so far illustrates a number of cases in which women and racial minorities are disproportionately exposed to environmental hazards, or burdened with sustainable labor in Western societies. Building upon this scholarship, my dissertation draws attention to the role and experiences of migrant workers, women in particular, within the politics of environmental sustainability. I analyze the degree to which the increase in urban recycling rates in Naples is dependent on the paid and unpaid contributions of low-wage migrant women working as cleaners and personal assistants in Neapolitan middle class households. While acknowledging the key role that homemakers and women in general play in carrying out sustainable practices, such as recycling and environmentally-conscious shopping, I draw attention to how these new, green aspects of

domestic labor are being relegated to migrant workers. While the outsourcing of social reproduction from wealthier to poorer communities, from the Global North to actors of the Global South, is an established fact in globalization scholarship, the intersection between social and environmental reproduction are virtually absent from transnational migration scholarship. Whereas much of the literature on sustainable practices in European countries depict environmentalism as the domain of liberally-minded middle classes (Marres, 2013), I highlight how, and why, such practices are rather the outcome of precarious living conditions that immigration and labor regimes generate.

Transnational migration

The literature discussed so far highlights existing gender and racial inequalities in relation to issues of environment and sustainability. In this section, I illustrate the relevance of this intersection from the perspective of transnational migration scholarship, particularly in regards to women's labor migrations. Although this broad scholarship is yet to establish a link between the realms of social reproduction and environmental sustainability, their awareness of the challenges, routines and opportunities available to migrant workers, women in particular, are key to understanding the conditions under which women participate in recycling efforts in Naples.

On a macro scale, Naples and the South of Italy in general have become immigrant-receiving regions relatively recently, with the 1980s boom of the service industry (Lutz, 2009). Unlike Western European countries, migration to Mediterranean Europe in the present day involves a larger number of women than men, possibly because of the lack of industrial hubs coupled with the expansion of the service industry (Ambrosini, 2013). These women-majority migrations follow a similar pattern to what Sassen (2003) has described as gendered component of survival circuits, referring to the growing number of women born in disenfranchised regions seeking paid labor outside the home-

many times, abroad- in response to the economic disruption that Structural Adjustment Programs⁵ (SAPs) brought to their communities.

Ehrenreich and Hochschild have argued that neoliberal markets, as they engage migrant women in relations of care with children (and seniors) in wealthier regions, deprive sending societies of their physical labor and skills, but also their families of their emotional labor, which is thus, transferred to more privileged people (Ehrenreich and Hochschild, 2003). While the macro-structural analysis of the care chain literature is very prominent, the psychological aspect of this theory has met with some resistance, particularly on the part of feminist scholars (Levitt and Lamba-Nieves, 2011; Yeates, 2012; Raghuram, 2012). Nicola Yeates (2012) in particular has critiqued much of the care chain for conjuring a theory based on expanding the results of qualitative studies done with predominantly Filipina/o workers in the U.S. and Europe (Parrenas, 1989 and 2003; Anderson, 2000) to other host societies, periods and populations. From a methodological standpoint, Raghuram (2012) critiqued the overwhelming attention given to the micro-level aspects of migrant women's domestic and reproductive work, which places so much attention on the emotional component of their work, as well as their roles as caregivers in multiple contexts as well as the informal nature of labor arrangements. While family relationships and informal arrangements remain an integral part of migrant women's lives in a host society, Raghuram (2012) argues that these migrations take place under specific social institutions. These include welfare regimes but also private agencies, immigration brokers, entrepreneurship and any other experience that migrant women have, beyond the realms of providing care and remittances to their families, and care to their employers. This plethora of actors, institutions and experiences surrounding the lives of migrant women, in part, disrupts the image of a care chain to provide a more complex idea of the economic,

⁵ These are a series of large-scale free market economy reforms that the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund imposed upon developing countries as a condition of loan eligibility.

institutional (i.e. public) and material circumstances emerging and enabling these migration experiences.

While continuing to focus on migrant women's domestic (and care) work in Naples, I make the argument for one to consider a) that the domestic work that these women perform includes sustainable practices, and b) how neighborhood relationships shape these practices as empowering or oppressive parts of their day. While considerations of how domestic workers can strategize around outdoorsy chores, such as taking out the garbage or grocery shopping, to network with fellow migrants exists in care chain studies (Pande, 2012), Naples' complicated trash collection and recycling schemes extend the scope of this networking to involve host society actors as well.

Migrant domestic workers' efforts to recycle in their homes and in those of their employers, is revealing of a series of working arrangements and assumptions underlying domestic labor in Naples. These include, first and foremost, notions of who performs the work of household sustainability, and under which circumstances. In particular, I discuss how people decide and relate to waste in their home. Who decides what to waste and what to keep, re-use or re-gift? Who sorts, packages and transfers waste and recyclables? The involvement of migrant workers in this chore further reveals how non-white Italians experience street life in Naples, with some of them employing the time outdoors for a short and much needed break from their charges, while others hurrying or working around it for fear of street harassment and accusations of littering. These considerations lead me to conclude that while sustainable practices are imagined as the prerogative of privileged groups, there is much of outsourcing of green labor to disenfranchised migrants, not only at the industrial level (Gregson et al. 2009), but also within households.

Finally, by highlighting the efforts of a group of migrant workers in enabling sustainable practices in the host society, my dissertation begins to deconstruct recent theories of ecological

economics portraying present-day immigration regimes as incompatible with sustainability and environmental preservation (Reese, 2006; Ropke, 2006). These theoretical frameworks argue that large flow of migration from developing to wealthier countries, the US in particular, pose a threat to the availability of natural resources worldwide, as the revenue that migrants remit risk spreading unsustainable consumer practices to developing countries. In addition, Park and Pellow (2011) have denounced the inherent racism of a similar kind of discourse, which is nonetheless popular among economic elites identifying with environmentalist movements. Park and Pellow (2011) have highlighted how these elites depict the economical habits and lifestyles of Hispanic and Latino migrant workers, who generally do not have the resources to afford green consumerism, as “environmentally unsound” and as a “threat to natural landscapes.” While green economy is nowhere near reaching a solution for massive challenges of the 21st century, such as emissions, global warming and energy and material renovation, with this dissertation I draw attention to how what little green practices do exist, these are the outcome of the work of migrant labor.

CHAPTER TWO: STUDY DESIGN: GLOBAL CONTEXT AND CRITICAL ETHNOGRAPHY

This dissertation examines the emergence of new forms of gendered agency and oppression in the context of environmental practices in my hometown, Naples. Much of the preliminary research, which I discuss in Chapters One and Three, draws newspaper articles published in large national and regional headlines, as well as smaller local press. As these sources rarely discussed issues of gender to the crisis, and outright ignore questions of race and ethnicity, most of this dissertation relies on ethnographic fieldwork conducted with environmentalist and pro-immigrant organizations as well as with middle-and working class women of different nationalities.

Methodological frameworks establishing connections between global and local scales, as well as conducting field research in a familiar context have gained prominence, at least in part thanks to theoretical contributions of global ethnographies (Burawoy, 2011) and critical ethnographies (Pillow, 2003). Both methodologies draw attention to the process of conducting qualitative research in shaping the concrete outcome of ethnographic work, such as a polished essay or chapter. Global ethnographies in particular highlight the theoretical implications that seemingly mundane, local practices contribute to theoretical frameworks in various social sciences (Burawoy, 2011), while critical ethnographies strive to provide a space of academic legitimacy for the inevitable contamination of data that researchers' positionalities bring to their research (Pillow, 2003).

The chapter is organized as follows: first a review of the literature on global and critical ethnography; following, I describe my research instruments, including interview and observation protocols, and the adaptations I made to the field plan. In the last part of the chapter, I draw from my ethnographic fieldnotes to offer some examples of the most relevant relationships and at play in

the course of my field research. These excerpts illustrate how different positionalities shaped my access and interactions with informants and relevant sources.

Materiality and the Global Scale

Global ethnographies understand the micro level, including everyday realities and peoples' meaning-making practices as active components of macro-scale phenomena, such as political economies, technology and social movements (Burawoy et al. 2000; Gille, 2016). This move breaks away from a long-standing tradition of conflating scale with level of analysis, which place agency and the ability to influence theoretical and concrete processes uniquely in the realms and perspectives of the macro-scale institutions and processes (Gille, 2016). As such, global ethnographies define the realms of everyday life and seemingly mundane practices as actively embedded to global forces. Far from being mere reflections of larger forces, micro-level actors such as individuals, communities, habits, and even non-human entities thus play an important role in shaping, resisting and enabling global processes. Some examples of this more complex relationships include the practices and discourse that social movements deploy at a grassroots level (Blum, 2000; Klawitter, 2000) as well as the contradictory politics of environmentalist efforts based on the private sector and deregulation (Gille and O'Riain, 2000). More recently, Miraftab (2016) relied on global ethnographies to analyze how systematic dispossession in developing and in wealthier countries is reshaping gender, ethnic and race relationships in seemingly isolated rural areas. All of these studies understand the global problem of environmental degradation as the emergence of neoliberal governance and of the concrete realities, including victimhood and resistance experienced by different people and communities. Although these perspectives do not overshadow the oppression and suffering that global processes bring to growing numbers of disenfranchised groups, their consideration of

grassroots agency as generative of global processes and epistemologies offers a promising perspective on present-day social movements.

Global ethnography's focus on the empirical and micro level takes into account the role of materiality, non-human actors, and everyday practices in generating global phenomena and inequalities. In this context, the political nature of laws and regulations seeking to define how societies interact with non-human actors -including food, fuels, and pollutants - emerge from considerations of how materiality escapes the boundaries of institutional definitions. The politics of regulating these material entities, including food products and industrial byproducts stand to highlight the inconsistencies and politics of safety regulations in transnational contexts, including the one of European Union regulations (Gille 2016).

The generative role that micro-scale actors play in a global context, but also the attention to the realm of material entities underlying global ethnographies allow me to address key aspects of this dissertation, including the multidimensional relationships that informants entertained among themselves, with the Italian state and with the European Union. By focusing on issues of materiality, global ethnographies provide a framework to address on-going speculations on the potential outcomes that illegal dumping as well as the sighting of landfills and incinerators may have on the health and economy of local communities. In the light of the rather unknowable composition of the wastes dumped, hidden and burnt in the outskirts of Naples, a focus on materiality can draw attention to the politics of risk-placement on the part of government and corporate entities, but also to the ones of mainstream media. Such politics of risk-placement are key to understanding whose voices and whose concerns have become, and can become part of public discourse on the waste crisis, in what role, and through what means.

Global and critical ethnographies have developed somewhat independently, the former being more recent and closely tied to academic sociology and the latter more interdisciplinary. However, both approaches argue that mundane, material and everyday practices and considerations are generative of theoretical perspectives: as such, these approaches share a critique of allegedly objective, top-down macro analysis.

In the case of critical ethnography, the realm of the concrete refers predominantly to the researcher's presence in the field and the role that is played in process of producing qualitative research (Pillow, 2003). Focusing on the process by which researchers conduct qualitative studies means making a place in academic writing for the various identities, choices and concerns shaping field research, including data gathering and publications, but also fieldnotes and memos. From this perspective, researchers' positionalities - in their site and vis-à-vis informants (De Vault, 1999) but also within an academic contest (Vanderbeck, 2005) – indeed influence, or in the words of Dwyer and Buckle (2009), “thoroughly contaminate the data”; however, such contamination represents a constitutive and important part of the research process, rather than a limitation.

Claiming a productive role to “data contamination”, critical ethnographies have criticized the following aspects of mainstream ethnographic research. First, a limiting, not to say dismissive, approach to positionalities resulting in either summaries of a researcher's demographic characteristics (Pini, 2004) to extensive, self-centered and apologetic essays (Pillow, 2003). Second, an ethnographic habitus of describing the field research in terms of the researcher's power, success and control, over research subjects and of the site itself (Vanderbeck, 2005). While not looking to dismiss social hierarchies between generally academics their informants, this approach risks

marginalizing the experiences of minority scholars, as well as women, in favor of a White heteronormative narrative (Vanderbeck, 2005). Finally, critical ethnography scholars like Marjorie De Vault have suggested that scholars make a room for unpolished, fragmented and contradictory quotes in their analysis. While seemingly less appealing than eloquent interview quotes, a degree of hesitation or inconsistency is in fact part of everyday life and conversations (De Vault, 1999). This observation is particularly relevant in the case of ethnographic interviews discussing daily private habits and practices, including household chores (De Vault, 1999), personal safety (Stanko, 2005) and in this case, household recycling.

Study Design, Adjustments and Unexpected Findings

This dissertation begins with a history of Campania's waste crisis and follows with an analysis of how environmental and economic burdens shaped women's lives in the contexts of political activism, work and everyday life. The data collection for the former part began in the spring of 2013, with secondary sources and publicly available data. These include newspaper articles appearing in national newspapers, as well as smaller pieces published on online newsletters and blogs; unsurprisingly, the latter media enjoy more response from community organizations and activists. These sources are indicative of broad political discourses surrounding Campania's waste crisis, from the perspective of political elites and of various segments of public opinion. While larger newspapers centered on government spending and interventions, smaller headlines and blogs became a preferred, and at times only, avenue for activist groups to push their claims forward. This analysis further exposes a systematic lack of concern for the plethora of women's groups appearing on Campania's public scene since 2006 in opposition of illegal dumping and select government interventions.

Following this first stage and having published a preliminary article on the topic in *Capitalism, Nature and Socialism*, I turn to fieldwork methods to engage with the concrete realities that Campania's prolonged waste crisis entailed for different actors, particularly women, as their experiences in particular seemed surprisingly absent from media coverage. During my six-months trip to the site, during which I focused predominantly on Naples' greater area, meaning the city of Naples and its provinces, although I took care to invite participants from other townships as well. By incorporating the villages and townships in Naples' provinces, I was able to reach diverse cross-section of experiences, in terms of informants' narratives and of participant observation. Although many anti-waste groups have emerged in other provinces of Campania, such as Salerno and Caserta, have a strong territorial basis, their activism brings them to travel to Naples quite frequently, for demonstrations as well as for meetings and assemblies.

Naples' urban sprawl features much of the urban inequalities afflicting most present-day metropolises. The glittering downtown areas and green gated communities down by the coast where many of the migrant women I met work in are just a few miles away from two large slums inhabited mostly by local Romani communities. The back streets of the most scenic and touristic historical neighborhoods are tightly packed with dark and humid dwellings for low-income locals and migrants alike, giving way to incredibly diverse, yet clearly segregated neighborhoods. Although the goals and strategies of activist groups organizing in Naples differ from the ones of smaller towns and villages, I found that affiliation and membership to different anti-waste groups is not necessarily mutually exclusive, with various activists being involved in two to three groups at the same time. These multiple memberships allowed me to interview activists on their multiple affiliations, including communities that are more distant. While many grassroots' organizations mobilizing in towns outside of the Naples province enjoy a strong basis in their communities, their activism brought

them and their groups to Naples quite often, for the purposes of assemblies and meetings with fellow activists but also for public demonstrations and protests. Particularly between the months of September and November 2014, many anti-waste groups had planned a series of public demonstrations around Naples. These demonstrations took place on a (nearly) bi-weekly basis, through a large-scale effort that some informants referred as “our own Hot Autumn”. These frequent protests gave me the opportunity to meet and follow-up with informants in preparation and following such actions, although for security reasons, the former were not always open to the greater public.

Key moments include a massive protest in Salerno⁶ on September 27, following a proposal by the regional governor Caldoro to install a new incinerator in the area; following, a large march in Naples on November 7, which ended in a series of violent clashes with police forces. These protests were both large events counting green activists of various groups, from clean water (Acqua Pubblica) movements to anti-incineration and Zero-Waste organization. As I learned in follow-up interviews, these two protests may have had similar membership, but maintained very different approaches and intent. The march in Salerno took place on a beautiful Saturday afternoon, early in the autumn many activists brought along their families and children. Demonstrators paraded through the scenic streets of the city’s historical downtown area playing local folk music, which they stopped now and then to chant a slogan. While several police cars followed along and in front, they kept their distance. As I learned later, one of the goals of this demonstration was to discredit the mayor of Salerno, the conservative De Luca, in the eyes of his electoral base, predominantly liberal middle-classes whose favor he had gained by renovating the scenic downtown streets where the demonstrations took place. Other demonstrations, such as the ones taking place in the cities of

⁶ Campania’s second largest city

Naples and in the township of Acerra, sought media coverage at all costs; both ended in violent clashes with police forces.

Apart from these frequent protests, participant observations of everyday waste practices took place in several different neighborhoods, particularly the crowded Garibaldi or Naples' Railway Area, Chiaiano, a working-class village in the hilly outskirts of Naples, the residential Colli Aminei as well as the three adjoining touristic districts Historical Borough, Chiaia and San Ferdinando. Although I reached out to various activists and groups, the ones I established a stronger relationship with include the Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan and the ChiaiaNo Landfill.

While reaching out and participating to events organized by various groups, the ones I was more in touch with include the ChiaiaNo Landfill, the Campanian Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan (Campanian Citizens) and the Regional Committee Coordinating Refuse (CoReRi). Through protests, town hall meetings and public events, I was also in touch with the Comitato Terra dei Fuochi, the Volcano Mothers and the Volcano Phoenixes. In Table One, I list the political orientations of these different groups. Here, it is interesting to note that while some of these groups have strong ties to a particular site, others support small-scale efforts, projects and research that activists carry out independently in their communities and workplaces. The former includes the Chiaiano neighborhood for the homonymous precinct, the Vesuvius townships of Terzigno and Boscoreale for the Volcano Mothers and to an extent, the Phoenixes. The latter group involves the Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Management Plan (Campania Citizens), the Regional Coordinating Committee of Refuse (CoReRei) and to an extent, the Terra dei Fuochi Committee. With the partial exception of the Terra dei Fuochi Committee, most of the localized groups are formed by predominantly low-income and working class; faced with the sighting of toxic facilities in their neighborhoods, some of these groups have engaged in more

radical forms of civil disobedience such as somewhat violent protests and occupations. Most of the activists affiliated with intra-regional groups, in contrast, tend to include middle or upper-class professionals, and a few of them engage with official party politics. While they criticize extensively and consistently Campania's waste laws, many (though not all) tend to work within its limitations. These different attitudes towards the law, but especially the intersection of class and ethnic identities of low-income groups from Southern Italy explain much of the hostile critique that working-class groups received from national governments and press for their insurgent politics.

Historically, environmentalist discourse in Italy have either been associated with fascist or at least far-right politics (Armiero and Von Graaf, 2013). Since the mid-1980s however a green consciousness has become part of the environmentalist and leftist politics of parties such as the Green Party (*I Verdi*) and, more recently, Left, Ecology and Freedom (*Sinistra, Ecologia e Libreta'*, *S.E.L.*), but also of the more established Democratic Party. With some notable exceptions, such as Naples' mayor De Magistris, these parties have provided little support to Neapolitan anti-waste movements. However, since 2012 the MS5 has provided extensive support and resources, particularly to left-leaning segments of such movements.

Table 1: Summary of Considered Groups and Their Claims

<i>Group</i>	<i>Politics</i>	<i>Main demands</i>	<i>Site</i>
Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan	Leftist majority MS5	1)Reform of the 2008 Regional Waste Plan	Campania
Regional Coordination of Regional Refuse	Leftist majority Declaredly apolitical	1) Reform of the 2008 Regional Waste Plan	Campania Pozzuoli and Pianura neighborhoods
Terra dei Fuochi (Land of the Fires)	Right wing leadership	1)Decontamination 2)Preventive health care for the community	Caivano township (Naples) Campania

Table 1(cont.)

	Politics	Main demands	Site
Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan	Leftist majority MS5	1)Reform of the 2008 Regional Waste Plan	Campania
Regional Coordination of Regional Refuse	Leftist majority Declaredly apolitical	1) Reform of the 2008 Regional Waste Plan	Campania Pozzuoli and Pianura neighborhoods
Terra dei Fuochi (Land of the Fires)	Right wing leadership	1)Decontamination 2)Preventive health care for the community	Caivano township (Naples) Campania
Everyone's Parents/ Postcards' Mothers	Catholic Moderately right-wing leadership	1)Decontamination 2)Preventive healthcare for the community	Caivano township (Naples) Campania
Chiaia No Landfill	Leftist majority (MS5)	1)Decontamination 2) reform of the 2008 Regional Waste Plan 3)Achieved: closure of landfill	Chiaiano neighborhood (Naples)
Volcano Mothers	Leftist majority	1)Closure of Landfill in the community 2) Reform of the 2008 Regional Waste Plan 3) Involvement in community waste management	Terzigno and Boscoreale (Naples province)
Volcano Phoenixes	Leftist majority	1) Reform of the 2008 Regional Waste plan 2) Closure of community landfill 3) Supporting survivors of domestic abuse	Terzigno and Boscoreale (Naples Province) Campania

Recruiting and interviewing anti-waste activist proved to be a relatively straightforward process. The negative publicity that national media and government propaganda provided to most of Campania's anti-waste movements was such that many welcomed the opportunity to share their experiences and struggles in the context of academic research and responded favorably to my efforts to reach out, whether this happened via email, at protests or through snowball sampling. Recruiting migrant workers however was more challenging. One of these is a Neapolitan office of Caritas Migrantes, a subdivision of the large Catholic charity Caritas, which specializes in assisting migrants and conducting research on issues of migration. Caritas employees advertised the research project and put me in touch with foreign-born workers interested in the project. Although only about half of the people expressing an interest in the project eventually committed to an interview, a few of the ones who did introduced me to friends and relatives whom they thought may be available for an interview. To broaden the outreach of this project beyond the overwhelmingly Catholic population served by Caritas, I recruited additional informants through the organization Yalla Napoli, which is a public NGO assisting incoming migrants and refugee on issues of housing, fluency in Italian and integrating to Italian society in general. This organization also gave me access to their library and provided me with materials on recent immigration to Campania.

By the end of the field research, I had conducted in-depth ethnographic interviews with 32 respondents, 16 of which are foreign-born and 16 Italian, and over 50 shorter conversations. To ensure anonymity, I removed all identifying information from my notes and transcripts, and refer to informants with a pseudonym. In average, interviews with Italian informants, women in particular, lasted just a little below two hours, while foreign-born domestic workers generally could give me about one hour. Interview notes and transcripts were coded based on open coding and selective focus coding. Although I considered employing a life-story approach in this dissertation

(Constable, 2010), the presence of public figures disclosing details of their private lives among the study participants, suggested a limited use of this methodology.

Italian informants include anti-waste activists and pundits as well as government officials and a rather heterogeneous group of women identifying as homemakers, including stay at home mothers but also women who run their households while holding a job outside the home. While the nationality of the foreign-born informants varies, all of them had been living in Naples for at least one year though the average length of stay was approximately 6 years. Each of these informants provided insights on their experiences working in Naples for an average of three jobs each and at least two neighborhoods in addition to the areas surrounding Piazza Garibaldi and Piazza Cavour, where most migrant domestic workers maintain a shared flat with co-nationals for their days off and for spells of unemployment.

Commonalities in the research protocols

When designing the study, I had prepared separate interview questionnaires for domestic workers and anti-waste activists. Although distinguishing these broad groups of informants was useful for recruiting purposes, informants' everyday experiences converge on issues of migration, gender and environmental sustainability to a greater degree than I had anticipated. First, a few migrant women living in Naples for several years were eager to discuss the city's waste politics and criticized extensively the mainstream narrative of the "trash emergency" as confined to the 2006-2008 period and to urban Naples. In addition, because of Italy's rapidly ageing population and home-based welfare system, many anti-waste activists, even ones identifying as working-class homemakers, employed or at least interacted with a migrant domestic worker within their extended families, particularly for elderly care purposes. Many anti-waste activists thus contributed to this research by

sharing their experiences as domestic workers and employers of domestic labor. In these experiences, the pressure to manage multiple spheres of life, including family, politics, work and increasingly, extended family appears overwhelming. Here, it might be interesting to note that very few of the Italian women participating in this study could agree to meet me on Thursday afternoon, which traditionally is a half-day off for domestic workers. Unsurprisingly, Thursday afternoon was when I completed most of my interviews with migrant workers, and, for the same reason, it was also the busiest day for the NGOs I worked with.

There are two more factors explaining a substantive intersection between everyday experiences of environmentalism and of migration. First, several Italian informants have a history of temporary or long-term migration in their own families. These stories include recounts of high-skilled professionals working in embassies and firms in North or South America and the experiences of college students under the Erasmus or Leonardo initiatives, but also more down-to-earth consideration of economic crises and limited professional opportunities, particularly for high-skilled women. The narratives of these journeys placed the current state of affairs, in Italy and in Naples, under a very critical light, but at the same time gave informants the chance to express some empathy towards incoming refugees and migrant workers, for their arduous journeys but remembering the dismay and cultural shock they experienced abroad.

Second, some of the activist organizations providing support to anti-waste efforts at the community level are also involved with citizenship and immigration reforms; as such, some of these groups have adopted the pro-immigrant rhetoric of other social movements. Furthermore, in an earlier ethnography of anti-waste protests in Naples, Armiero (2008) found how among Catholic informants' involvement with missionary efforts in African countries contributed to their ability to mobilize as a community once in Italy, and in this case, reflect upon global inequalities. Finally,

environmental consciousness in many informants carried a wide-ranging global mode of thinking, including the risk of corrupt regimes hiding problems of waste contamination, and not solved through democratic processes and technological advances. A working-class mother and full-time activist in Chiaiano left the interview with these parting words:

“It is so important that we solve this the right way, otherwise next thing you know they’ll be dumping out all of this rubbish in Somalia or in some other poor country” (Interview with Kayla, September 9 2014)

In July 2016, Campania’s regional government came under international scrutiny when the Coalition Marocchine pour la Joustice Climatique⁷ began mobilizing against the arrival of 2500 tons of urban solid waste from Campania’s landfill in Taverna del Re to a cement factory a few miles from El Jadida Harbor (Huffington Post, 2016; Mouwal, 2016). In addition to Moroccan civil society, the Lands of the Fires but also a few representatives of the Italian government condemned this agreement. Campania’s governor De Luca denied that his office had ever approved of such plan and condemned the operation as unlawful. In spite of the disavowal of the Italian government, the risk of illegal trafficking between Italy and Morocco persists, and De Luca remains under investigation for multiple charges of corruption (Del Porto, 2016).

Shifting positionalities in ethnographic interviews

Existing scholarship on critical ethnographies define researchers’ positionalities as dynamic relationships emerging from particular interactions with informants as well as sites (Bondi, 2009). While these relationships shift, scholars such as Pini (2004), and Dwyer and Buckle (2009) clarify some of the more relevant relationships shaping ethnographic interviews and observations, as they emerge and shift through time, practice and in the course of conversations. Because I interviewed a

⁷ This is a Moroccan coalition of over 200 between environmentalist and civil society groups

broad cross-section of Campania's population, including government officials and CEOs of local NGOs as well as professional and working-class women, what follows is a broad overview of some of the major factors shaping my access and interactions with informants. I will also return to this issue in substantive chapters.

Many of the "migrant" women participating to this research identify as Neapolitan -though not necessarily Italian. Although I had tailored specific questions for different groups of informants, based on their relationship with social reproduction and their nationalities, these interviews to address how the relationship between gender and environment is affecting various spheres of life, including social movements, workplaces and family. In practice, this means listening and observing how Neapolitan families go about waste on a daily basis- how much recycling takes place, and who is charge of these tasks. Because some of these questions are somewhat personal or controversial, as they ask about family habits and workplace concerns and can – in many cases did- touch upon immigration regulations - going into the field I was expecting at least some informants to have questions, or even concerns, about participation. Particularly with anti-waste activists, this was largely not the case; however, foreign-born informants –Neapolitans and not- generally had more questions and, as I explain below, a more ambivalent understanding to their participation in the study. In order to establish professional relationships, but also trust between informants and myself, I relied in part to the assistance of NGOs and grassroots' organizations. However, having an active presence on social media was also important. About half of the participants asked to see my page on Facebook, I believe to get a clearer idea of the political scope of this project, or my general attitudes towards immigration and environmental politics.

Being an insider and an outsider with Italian women

Dwyer and Buckle (2009) have redefined insider/outsider research, i.e. ethnographic fieldwork in a community the researcher either identifies with or holds a substantive affiliation with as a more complex “space between” the similar and diverging affiliations of informants and participants. Particularly when interviewing Italian women, domestic workers and anti-waste activists, the interplay between shared and diverging identities played a key role in determining access and trust to informants. Many Italian-born participants volunteered their homes for the interview and in certain cases volunteered to show me their neighborhoods and the sites of their mobilizations, sharing relevant stories of their struggles. However, participating in an ethnographic research about Campania’s waste crisis also yielded some doubts, particularly among informants unfamiliar with, or skeptical of qualitative methods. One person in particular, “Marlene”, was very adamant about her reservations.

Before our interview started, Marlene had quite a few questions for me about my fieldwork, who I was working with in the United States and if I had any affiliations here. She seemed a bit more open to the project when she heard that my academic advisor studied an incinerator in Hungary. Eventually she admitted that she had agreed to talk to me, because she viewed me as “a young woman trying to make a career abroad”, in spite of previous negative experiences with scholars and low opinion of academia in general (...). In spite of these concerns, Marlene agreed to what turned out to be a two-hour interview, and introduced me to two fellow-activists. (Researcher’s Journal, December 7, 2014)

As the excerpt above mentions, Marlene worried about the power dynamics at play in ethnographic research and had some reservations about participating in academic studies on Campania’s waste crisis. Her concerns emerged after some interviews she had given in the past became part of research projects supporting a local leftist party’s support of incinerators, albeit with several restrictions - an outcome she was not aware of when she agreed to those interviews. Marlene’s refusal to engage with political research draws attention to a core concern for anti-waste movements in Campania. As the table on page 11 shows, distinct activist groups make very similar claims. Although these similarities allow ample room for collaboration, solidarities and multiple

membership across different groups, activists hold fiercely different views of the ideal relationships between social movements and party politics. While some activists of the Volcano Mothers and of the Campania Citizens embrace the possibility of working within an environmentalist political party, others, like the Volcano Phoenix⁸ and the CoReRi find this incompatible with their political responsibility as social movements. These disagreements on the role of social movements and civil societies, in the eyes of a few informants, were just as important as opposing party affiliations.

In spite of her reservations on academic research, as an advocate for gender equity Marlene recognized she had the power to help me - a younger Neapolitan woman -, conduct my own academic research in my hometown, and not tag along or do the heavy lifting for a professor's new book. The fact that she agreed to help me on those grounds speaks to my identity as an international student, which locally yields more credibility than working for a national university, but also to the idea England (1994) provocatively calls "researchers as supplicants", which acknowledges informants' power to consciously make or break a study by agreeing (or not agreeing) to participate. As an expatriate, returning home for research meant enjoying a double privilege, the one of studying abroad, but also local communities' approval by seeking to maintain ties with my communities of origin. This positionality as an insider and outsider to my research site, especially with respect to older Italian women as informants may have thus provided me with a better access to informants compared to researchers working from a higher degree of insiderness. While this was not the case with Marlene, many Italian informants with children (or nephews) close to my age group were also interested in hearing about my life in the United States and following the interview asked if I would be willing to talk or help them look for study abroad opportunities and exchange programs. While I

⁸ Disagreements over the role that the Volcano Mothers should entertain with local administrations led a small group of activists to leave the group and form a different association, the Volcano Phoenix. This group is open to men and women and defines itself as a charity organization raising awareness over environmental concerns and women's health and domestic violence.

agreed to do so, usually I did not hear back for several months, as these younger professionals were still navigating the decision to move abroad at the time of the interview.

Another issue emerging in the course of my fieldwork with Italian-born anti-waste activists entailed the extent to which my research could sustain their cause in the short term. Having received extensive criticism from national and regional media, many activists strive to rehabilitate their actions in the public eye. For this purpose, the support of journalists and columnists is critical. While I never made a secret of my environmentalist/feminist approach, I was also very clear about not having a network with the national press, and of an expected delay in a book publication. However, the general timeline of my publication plan this did not seem to trouble informants. Most of the activists I reached out to were open to participating in the research, even if it was only for my academic credentials or a book in a distant future.

Compared to anti-waste activists, migrant domestic workers and Italian homemakers displayed a greater hesitation towards the research. Beginning with the former, while they maintained a rather friendly attitude towards me and oftentimes repeated Marlene's notion of "helping a local young woman", two issues made carrying out these interviews more challenging. First, the fear of appearing xenophobic in front of a researcher, a concern that, I believe, may have pushed a few informants - particularly ones in favor of more restrictive immigration policies - to measure their words quite carefully, especially in the beginning of my relationships with them. Particularly informants supporting restrictions on immigration or labor rights for migrants, as well as ones employing migrant workers informally, began interviews by sharing stories or anecdotes of monetary gifts and support they provided to a migrant domestic worker, such as permission to use their internet connection and landlines, borrowing money to offset debts or the covering expenses of family emergencies. However, as interviews progressed, two relevant issues emerged with a

certain frequency. First, racism and xenophobia, generally directed towards one particular ethno-national group, feelings that informants rationalized through a previous negative experience with one or two people. Second, with very few exceptions, most employment arrangements involving migrant domestic workers are extremely informal, even in the case of documented workers with a regular work contract. While migrant women were very open about this issue, Italian women more reluctantly admitted registering migrant domestic workers with social security services under a lower-paying professional category compared to the job they actually employ them to do. Under this scheme, a live-in worker charged with home cleaning and personal assistance of a senior citizen would receive a contract for part-time home cleaning, which entitles a lower stipend, fewer benefits and less paid leave. For this reason, many migrant women whom the NGOs listed as “domestic workers” were actually carrying out what according to Italian labor laws were in fact two jobs, personal assistance and home cleaning.

While engaging with informal practices may have made research subjects wary of a pro-immigrant expat asking questions about how their families went about household chores, it also provided some insight into Italian women’s struggles to provide domestic work, childcare and personal assistance to ageing relatives. Most of them either manage such chores on their own, or outsource to a domestic worker but very rarely receive help and support from other family members. In some cases, these xenophobic sentiments and hostilities emerged in the emotional context of women dealing with the deteriorating health conditions of a loved one. Because these issues are extremely common locally, many informants expected that, as an insider to Italian society, I would understand their concerns and the bitterness it caused, towards their families and sometimes their employees, and as such were open to sharing – or perhaps they needed some time to vent and put their experiences on record, regardless of my ideological background.

Interactions with foreign-born informants were also amicable, though generally not as extensive as the ones with Italian-born women. In part, this may have had to do with these informants’ limited time off, particularly for ones holding a part-time job outside of their main employment. However, it is not surprising that gaining access and trust from this broad sub-population was more challenging compared to Italian-born informants, given widespread anti-immigrant and charitable sentiments towards migrants in Italian society. For this reason, during the recruitment process and in the course of the interviews I found myself answering numerous questions on the scope of the study and on what participation would entail; however, few informants seemed surprised that as an expat, I would be interested in issues of migration.

Most of the interviews took place between July and September 2014, and a few more in December. These scheduling arrangements, but particularly the relative ease with which informants were able to meet me in July show a common employment pattern for many migrant women in the area. Most migrant domestic workers in Campania work live-in or full-time as home keepers and personal assistants for semi-independent seniors (Marra and Miranda, 2014); in many cases, their direct supervisors are the adult children of these seniors (Lutz, 2007). While these jobs typically include two half-days off each week, during the month of August many families leave town and arrange for these personal assistants to work additional hours with their ageing family members, leaving the house as little as possible. Knowing in advance that through the whole month of August, they will be spending much of their time “off” indoors, many domestic workers explained that it is relatively easy for them to obtain from their employers a few extra hours off in July and September.

Some of the methodological and political limitations of a rigid approach to insider-outsider research became painfully obvious during my meetings with foreign-born participants. Several of my informants have lived in Campania longer than I have, and have built close ties with fellow migrants, but in some cases also made friends with Italian people and migrants from other countries. Stories of their children's schooling in Italy, of weekends spent in the company of Italian friends and of favorite locations in the city contrasted sharply with me as a "God Given" citizen who nevertheless lacked a commitment to returning home upon completion of her degree in the U.S. The final words of an interview I had with "Roberta", 42, originally from El Salvador but in Naples for 22 years provide a striking example of this friendly yet conflicted relationship between informants, migrancy, citizenship and myself:

"Maybe things would be better for everybody in this town if more people took the time to ask us. But I wish you had not found me as an "immigrant". For the government, I will never be Italian; but I am Neapolitan. Perhaps you could include that in your research, too".
(Interview with Roberta, July 23 2014)

Roberta's quote draws attention to an additional aspect of my interviews with foreign-born women. While seeking to dismantle the stereotype of migrant women as helpless victims, some informants also approached participation to the research as an opportunity to make a statement about some of the problems and difficulties they face on a daily basis – whether they pertained to the research project or not. While these concerns vary, the contractual informality I described above, together with restrictive immigration policies recur overwhelmingly.

Inequalities related to my citizenship and socio-economic status were somewhat mitigated by age differences, between informants and myself but more importantly between potential employers and me: in the context of Campania's economic concerns, my generation is not yet one of potential employers, if not for very rare exceptions. As my field notes show, the tone of our conversations

were rather colloquial, with informants very rarely addressing me as "Ms." and much more as "honey"- a habit that is perhaps as common in Southern Italy as it would be in the South of the US, which may seem odd in comparison to the professional language scholarly writing. A few asked about my life in the United States, and they mentioned the emotional trauma of being far away from their families and communities as something we would have in common. Speaking of their earlier jobs and memories of Naples for example, a few would comment along the lines of “perhaps it is the same for you in America”. Older informants spoke of being away from their children and grandchildren occasionally commented something like “Your mother probably knows how sad it is (to be away from her grandchildren)”. While I had not intended to draw a parallel between my situation as an international PhD student in the US and the ones of my informants, I did not deny the similarity when interviewees brought them up. These comparisons and affinities appeared particularly on two levels: an emotional one, and in relation to the choice to move abroad temporarily. Here, some remarked how even a low-wage job in our current position was more profitable than the alternative in our hometowns. Others also mentioned how some of their employees’ adult children (or grandchildren) were expats "like yourself", or were in Naples but unemployed.

However, the exclusive nature of Italian immigration policies emerged very frequently in the course of these interviews. “Migrant” informants were much more familiar with the sites I was studying than I was. Although part of this research focused on migrant women’s experiences of harassment and street violence, the relatively high rates of hate crimes against women in many neighborhoods pushed a few particularly involved informants to ask about my field research and make suggestions for my personal safety, both among migrants and Italian-born informants. Discussing her neighborhood, which she spoke highly about in other contexts, Monica, a Tunisian-

born was very skeptical about conducting ethnographic interviews in her neighborhood, and suggested that I rely more on participant observations.

“Walk around and look around honey, if you must, but try to do some shopping, like everyone else⁹. Don’t try to strike up conversations about the garbage situation, just walk your way and don’t draw attention (to yourself)” (Interview with Fatima, July 10 2014)

Although most parts of Naples are somewhat pedestrian-friendly, incidents of street harassment against women in general, including ethnic minorities, are extremely common. Mindful of the role that criminal organizations play in illegal dumping, but also of general concerns for pick-pocketing and minor aggressions in certain districts - particularly against people perceived as outsiders - Fatima provided some insight on how to go about ethnographic fieldwork in her neighborhood without running any unnecessary risks. Monica's concerns for personal safety reflects a process that Kulik and Wilson (2003) understand as a rather common gendered aspect of fieldwork, namely informants worrying about the well-being of female scholars. Although Kulik and Wilson’s explanation is a valid one, here I would like to draw attention to two additional issues.

First, a xenophobic and heteronormative male gaze is at play even in more diverse, crowded and pedestrian-friendly districts in shaping how women of ethnic minorities can experience public spaces.

(Around Garibaldi Square) Catcalls are extremely common but in the context of crowded spaces, most women I know and observe tend to ignore them and walk on. This is nothing new really, if women were to pay attention to catcalls in Naples, we would not get anything done. The only exception is when they happen at intersections or when it is hard to move around quickly. This afternoon (5:30 pm) I was waiting for a green light on the north side of Garibaldi Square; a woman with a shiny blue and beige hijab was standing next to me, chatting with her son- a boy who could not have been older than four. While we were waiting for the light to turn green, two Neapolitan teenagers stopped in the middle of the

⁹ This neighborhood is lined with a series of small stores selling fresh groceries and sundry products at lower prices than most supermarkets; because it is close to a subway station, it is quite common for people from other parts of town to shop there.

intersection and started yelling insults in our direction- but besides a few swear words, I could not make out everything they were saying, the crowd and traffic drowned most of that out. The lady turned and walked away in the opposite direction, hastily chatting with the boy to distract him. I counted to three, checked the light one more time and walked away too (Researcher's Journal, November 30 2014).

Incidents such as these are a matter of everyday life in a many crowded locations, including parts of Naples, although in this particular districts, depending on the time of the day I counted as many as four per hour. This particular district however is one of the few where low-income ethnic minorities, including refugees and migrant workers, spend their leisure time – although women are more likely to walk around, perhaps carrying a beverage, compared to men, whom generally sit on park benches. Following Fatima's advice, but also common knowledge of public spaces in Naples for example, in many neighborhoods I had to adjust to conducting participant observations while walking around rather than from a fixed point.

Discussing incidents in the context of an ethnographic study involves addressing two concerns. First, it risks further marginalizing foreign-born women by constructing them as victims – a label that many of the women involved in this study work hard to dismantle. Second, accounting for the researcher's presence in documenting forms of harassment and violence implies moving away from a long-standing academic practice of researchers constructing themselves as in a position of power and control, over the sites and the informants. Although this approach has received extensive criticism, Vanderbeck (2005) argues that being upfront about one's vulnerabilities in the course of field research still risks undermining the credibility of the research – a problem that can compromise the legitimacy of junior scholars in general and can create a particularly troubling obstacle for ones identifying as ethnic and sexual minorities, or women.

In this sense, a critical ethnography perspective becomes a useful tool to approach this kind of “data contamination” as one providing a degree of thickness to the study and not a mere

limitation of the research - and the researcher. In the case of research in Naples' Railway area for example, a few foreign-born informants described how:

"Thugs and burglars used to be a problem for me, when I arrived. But now not anymore. I know who they, I don't do anything to hurt them and they leave me alone" (Interview with Regina, July 24 2014).

The fact that spending more time in a neighborhood and forging ties locally would imply facing less street violence sounds reasonable. However, my interpretation is indeed shaped by a blue tote bag with the logo of one of the organizations I worked with in that neighborhood. The director of the organization gave me this bag (plus a handful of pins and bumper stickers) upon our first meeting and casually mentioned that how her staff used that bag a lot on the job. Spending time in that neighborhood, but also observing staff members I realized how those gadgets had the "miraculous" powers of reducing street harassment and making the neighborhood overall a little friendlier. Finally, although some participants hesitated to discuss whether they felt safe carrying out recycling tasks in various neighborhoods, on occasion they would return to this issue towards the end of the interview, when I asked if they had any suggestions for the next steps of the research. While answering these questions, informants provided more insights about which parts of town they find problematic in terms of personal safety and how they go about managing these concerns around their homes and places of work. Oftentimes, their insights came in the form of advice but also through personal anecdotes – as insiders to the city. By doing so, they established themselves as experts on the city, thereby rejecting any notion of otherness – and victimhood - that Italian society assigns to them.

CHAPTER THREE: MOBILIZING AROUND MOTHERHOOD? ESSENTIALISM, FEMINISM AND CATHOLICISM IN CAMPANIA'S ANTI-WASTE MOVEMENTS

In Chapter One and Chapter Two, I introduced Campania's waste crisis as the outcome of neoliberal processes such as the creation of technological zones across the European Union and of top-down territorial reconfigurations. In particular, I have drawn attention to the national government's plans to finance a waste-treatment hub in the area as a case of neoliberal governance, distancing myself from previous scholarship arguing uniquely for a case of inefficient and corrupt bureaucracies. I have also mentioned how the more established national newspapers supported these plans and criticized extensively the opposition that local anti-waste movements tried to organize.

In this chapter, I return to the questions of media propaganda and public discourse. Specifically, I discuss how women's movements, particularly mothers' groups, intervened to debunk this media propaganda. I begin by discussing newspaper coverage of the waste crisis and the protest to highlight how two distinct groups of mothers, the Volcano Mothers and the Postcards Mothers, made a strategic use of their identity as working-class Neapolitan mothers to make their claims appealing to national public opinion. By doing so, not only have these groups drawn attention to the role of criminal organizations, but also to international industries and the Italian government's involvement in the emergence of Campania's waste crisis. Furthermore, I argue that the strategic use of an essentialist identity as a concerned Neapolitan mother helped these groups gain traction and support within local civil societies, overcoming the obstacles that these women face because of their gender and relatively low class extraction. Following, I discuss some of the broader implications of motherhood-based politics for Campania's anti-waste movements. Based on in-depth interviews with women involved with larger and more diverse anti-waste groups, I suggest that those maternal identities are not necessarily beneficial, let alone empowering, to female activists in general, but particularly to professionals and women with political ambitions. This comparison between the

emancipatory and oppressive outcomes that traditional gender and ethnic identities yield for different women in Campania can broaden our understanding of how neoliberal waste governance is reshaping gender and class hierarchies within local civil societies.

This chapter draws from theories of neoliberal governance (Brenner, 1999; Sassen, 2002), in addition to environmental justice studies concerned with the intersection of gender, race and class inequalities in shaping exposure and resistance to environmental hazards (Ernst, 1994; Schultz, 2003; Gutbertlet, 2005). This framework allows me to situate the waste crisis as both the product of neoliberal inequalities and as an institutional framework exacerbating local inequalities along the lines of gender, class, ethnicity and nationality. In addition, I further rely on the work of subaltern studies (Spivak's, 1987), eco-feminists (Carlassare, 1994) and feminist political ecologists (Rocheleau et al., 1998) to discuss the seemingly traditional understandings of motherhood underlying women's mobilizations (Piper and MacGregor, 2007; MacGregor, 2013). This framework speaks to various concerns: First, feminist activists and journalists denouncing governing bodies, mainstream media and police forces for ignoring, silencing and physically repressing women's experiences with waste in Campania (*Rifiuti e Uomini che Rifiutalo le Responsabilità*, 2008; Zagaria, 2011). Second, by analyzing empowering and oppressive narratives of women's activism, this chapter discusses the role of gender in present-day civil society, particularly in terms of women's efforts, discursive (Carlassare, 1994) to politicize the private domain (Bru-Bistuer, 1998; Armiero, 2014). Finally, by situating the empirical case study in the context of neoliberal governance, this research links women's narrative of oppression and resistance to global forces and local circumstances.

Gender in environmentalist struggles

Grounded experiences of environment-related reterritorializations are a key issue for the studies of the social relationships generating, but also emerging from waste, including everyday administration,

politics and disasters (Gille, 2009). While the gendered nature of such experiences has been on the research agenda of environmental justice since at least the 1970s, eco-feminists and feminist political ecologists have reflected specifically on gender roles and women's concrete experiences of such problematic. The over-accumulation of toxic waste in Campania is consistent with a global trend of over-exposing poor communities and ethnic minorities to environmental hazards such as industries, landfills and chemical plants (Ernst, 1994; Beck, 2002; Armiero, 2008). This practice reflects a capitalist logic of accumulation by dispossession, but also an assumption that certain marginalized groups are less capable of mobilizing and resisting (Gould, 1998; Mohai, Pellow and Roberts, 2009). Top-down re-territorializations thus, rely heavily on governing bodies and economic actors' ability to coopt expert knowledge, thus, presenting environmental concerns as technical, rather than political, matters (Mukerji, 2010), a logic that oftentimes undermines grassroots' attempts to refute such claims (Salleh, 2003). Reflecting on Campania's waste crisis through this broad lens can help situate women's grassroots efforts in relation to gender relationships, but also class disparities in various contexts, including governance, civil societies and local communities (Alvarez, 2000; Mies, 2007).

Knowledge production is a key concern for social movements and environmental justice scholarships. In the context of environmental justice, de-politicizing environmental matters discredits the experiences, knowledge and concerns that grassroots actors may have. Feminist critics further argue that the marginalization of non-expert knowledge silences the daily experiences that communities at large, but particularly women, have of pollutants, thus allowing environmental degradation to exacerbate gender inequalities (Leach, 2007; Alaimo, 2008; Shiva, 2009). This happens through pollutants and hazards that damage women's health more than men's (Schultz et al., 2003), but also in terms of resource management and additional burdens on domestic labor and women's work (Rocheleau et al., 1998; Salleh, 2003). A diverse body of empirical scholarship

denounced several circumstances in which environmental sustainability becomes part of women's unpaid labor, as volunteers or as homemakers (Schultz, 1993; Miraftab, 2004; Gutbertlet, 2005).

Within environmental justice and development scholarship, concerns for the well-being of their families and communities recur as main reasons for women's decision to become involved with environmentalist efforts and struggles occurring in the private sphere and in the context of social movements. Empirically grounded studies in both eco-feminism (Carlassare, 2000) and feminist political ecology (Gaard, 2011) indicate that health related concerns are indeed central to women's groups organizing around environmental concerns. For instance, it is common for such groups to connect their efforts to the work of social reproduction, such as ensuring a clean and sanitary environment for their families or volunteering to improve living conditions in their neighborhoods (Bru Bistuer, 1996; Bellows, 1998; Miraftab, 2004). However, the underlying association of traditional gender norms with environmental preservation, at the material and theoretical level, is controversial. Such ideology creates, yet constrains, women's engagement with the public sphere (Bellows et al., 1998) and risks reinforcing essentialist notions of womanhood (Gaard, 2011). Feminist scholars engaging with subaltern studies have counter-argued that deploying a seemingly traditionalist discourse on gender roles can be strategic to both mobilizing (Spivak, 1987) and dismantling patriarchal narratives (Carlassare, 1994; Gaard, 2011). Finally, Reed (2000) and McGregor have raised epistemological questions to this approach, highlighting that the emphasis on gender norms, motherhood in particular, may be the result of scholars' assumptions more than activists' actual goals, and practices.

According to media reports, existing scholarship, and findings from my own ethnographic interviews, women mobilizing against toxic waste, landfills and incinerators in Campania define their activism in response to the threats these pose to their families, pregnant women, and their

communities. Women's groups have successfully turned their everyday experiences of a polluted environment into claims for just governance, through their traditional roles of caregivers for sickly children and family members. Their claims for sanitation and alternative waste management strategies deconstruct not only capitalistic accumulation by dispossession, but also male dominance over their territories. Here, I discuss the emergence of women's anti-waste activism in Campania and the role that gender identities, motherhood in particular, play in determining their efforts and challenges. I draw particular attention to the ambivalent role that maternal discourses play in activists' strategies: empowering at a level of public discourse, yet not necessarily empowering within an activist movement, nor at the level of family life.

In the following three sections, I analyze narratives of Campania's waste crisis appearing in three of the largest circulating newspapers publishing local and national news: these are the center-left newspaper *La Repubblica*, *Il Corriere della Sera* and *Il Mattino*. To focus on issues of waste in Campania during the 2008-2013 period, I performed an advanced search on the online archive of these headlines crossing year of publication, location of the reports, and keywords such as "Trash Emergency," "Waste Crisis" and "Waste Protests." At the end of this initial research I was able to identify the key actors involved in the politics of waste in Campania and the crisis issues produced by a press catering predominantly to urban middle classes. Given that these articles rarely made even a passing mention to women's involvement with the waste crisis, I performed a secondary search, which also included the words "women" and "mothers." Since this search revealed more information on two particular women's groups, *Postcards Mothers* and *Mothers of the Volcano*, I looked for their websites, blogs, Facebook pages, and video and press releases. I begin this section with the issues that mainstream newspapers treated as central to Campania's waste crisis before comparing these institutional narratives with the voices of activists. Following, I integrate this media data with in-depth semi-structured interviews and participant observations with activists from these

and other women's groups, interviews that integrate, and at times contest, what is a dominant narrative of motherhood in the main press.

Mainstream narratives of the waste crisis

Between September 2008 and 2013, the main themes that the media discussed concerning Campania's waste crisis were government spending, inefficiency or corruption of state bureaucracy, and infrastructure. Throughout this period, flash news denouncing accumulation of urban waste in the street also abounded. Issues of toxic contaminating lands and groundwater appeared in 2013 in a conjuncture of events including the publication of a health report attributing the growth in mortality rate observed in the area to lifestyle choices rather than exposure to toxic waste as well as the aforementioned confessions of former mob leader Carmine Schiavone (Sannino, 2013).

Government spending and contamination

The initial analysis revealed a recurring concern among commentators and readership for the financial costs of the crisis, particularly in terms of government spending; this finding is rather unsurprising in the midst of the Great Recession. Some of the most debated issues included a series of job openings in the waste disposal sector, costs associated with different energy plants and landfills, and the price for shipping regional waste abroad or to neighboring regions. All three newspapers reported that inappropriate infrastructure causes additional expenses in the management of urban solid waste by either wasting labor or by imposing trash shipments.

Writing for the national edition of the newspaper *Il Mattino*, de Crescenzo (2012) refers to Campania's waste management as a "15.000 Million Euro Waltzing out of our pockets" (De Crescenzo, 2012). The ballroom metaphor gives a satirical accent to the author's criticism of the regional administration, which she accuses of honoring union contracts to the point of hiring, and

paying, waste operators before completing the facilities they would be working in (i.e. paying workers before they could begin working).

According to Raffaele Del Giudice, the CEO of the company in charge of waste collection in Campania (Azienda Servizi Igienice Ambientale), such expenditures “Could be avoided if political tensions weren’t keeping the plants from functioning or being ready” (DeMarco, 2013). Del Giudice further specified that the lack of facilities for where to sort urban waste was preventing trash trucks from unloading, putting the whole city at risk of new emergencies- “A situation that people’s lack of civility (i.e. recycling abilities) only makes worse. International shipments of waste however are still more affordable than inter-regional ones, roughly 170s versus 190 Euros per ton” (La Repubblica, 2013 a.). Similarly, La Repubblica’s (Sannino, 2013) coverage of a press conference on the matter revealed very strong tensions and sentiments among Naples’ urban middle classes. These tensions surfaced in September, when the mayor, De Magistris, decided to “transfer” (i.e. fire) his waste management consultant Rossi after he refused to hire twenty-three more waste operators.

Unlike the previous administration, none of the politicians or technicians that the press interviewed in 2013 explicitly voiced their support for incineration projects, with Mayor De Magistris siding in favor of international shipments and the vice mayor speaking of the virtues of compost plants (Sannino, 2013). Emphasizing their choice to ship waste abroad shows a concern for anti-incineration protests in the peripheries. However, the press continues to associate the expression “trash emergency” or “crisis” to the threat of uncollected waste accumulating in residential neighborhoods rather than the more complex issue of on-going toxic contamination in the peripheries (De Rosa, 2012).

Issues of toxic waste contamination and of its impact on human health appear in mainstream media coverage of Campania’s waste crisis, though not as prominently as questions of government

spending. Prior to the publication of Schiavone's confessions, this topic came under public scrutiny on two distinct occasions: an interview with the regional commissioner for land reclamations and a visit from the minister of health to the township of Aversa. The media described a series of small press conferences and private interviews taking place in Commissioner De Biase's office. According to *Il Corriere del Mezzogiorno*, Mr De Biase "compares the toxicity levels in the township of Giugliano to Chernobyl's accident. Rather than land reclamation, the whole area needs a sarcophagus" (Russo, 2013). Articles discussing De Biase's comments do not mention any statement regarding the impact of toxic contamination on the local population's health. The latter issue emerges shortly afterwards, when Health Minister Balduzzi and a team of medical experts traveled to the city of Aversa and presented a study finding "No correlation between the high cancer mortality rates in Campania and burning of toxic waste. (The latter) are more likely to reflect culturally-driven poor health behaviors, such as high smoking rates, as well as a high presence of hepatitis C" (Sardo, 2013).

These declarations generated a series of demonstrations and protests, particularly in Aversa, under the leadership of the Lands of Fires general committee. *Il Corriere della Sera* and *La Repubblica* discussed the event quite extensively. In the former case, such coverage focused on how the question of cancer mortality in relation to illegal dumping was a controversial matter at the governance, as well as at the grassroots level, with "(Balduzzi) being accused of carelessness" (*Il Corriere della Sera*, 2013). *La Repubblica*, on the other hand, presents a more sensational depiction of "protestors attacking the car where the minister and his team traveled" and "accusing the minister of lying" (Sardo, 2013). A subsequent article on *La Repubblica* features De Magistris siding with the protesters, inviting "Balduzzi to return to Naples, telling the truth this time" (*La Repubblica*, 2013).

Women at the Protests

The problem of toxic waste contamination in Campania's peripheries became part of a 2013 mainstream discourse. This occurred when Health Minister Balduzzi and a team of medical experts organized a press conference in the town of Aversa. Unsurprisingly, Balduzzi's declarations came across as offensive, patronizing, and unacceptable to various activists and communities (Esposito 2013; Sardo 2013). Numerous articles covering the press conference discussed the protests and unrest accompanying the event in very critical and mocking terms. *La Repubblica*, for example, presented a sensational depiction of an angry mob, with a group called Volcano Mothers waiting for Minister Balduzzi, and of subsequent attacks on the cars in which the minister and his team travelled (Sardo 2013). The article makes no further mention of Volcano Mothers or any other organizations participating in the protest. Rather, it focuses on a one man yelling insults at the minister, thus, sensationalizing someone who may have been a fringe actor in the protest at the expense of more organized groups (Bail 2012).

Ethnographies of Campania's waste crisis (Armiero 2008, 2011), alternative newspapers (Puglia 2013; Brancaccio 2013), and images accompanying major newspaper articles (Rifiuti, Molotov Lungo la Strada per Terzigno 2010) show women's groups as central and well-organized protesters whose acts of civil disobedience are not necessarily violent (Armiero 2008). In contrast, mainstream newspapers' focus on the efforts of austere and authoritarian male politicians engaging with the minute technicalities of government spending and waste infrastructures produces a narrative that reproduces gender and class inequalities. The offices and officials involved with waste in Campania are non-elected and lack personal ties with the territory, further adding to the distance between political and activist efforts.

The Volcano Mothers did not receive more than a few passing mentions in the national newspapers. Of the approximately 150 articles published on Campania's waste crisis by the main

newspapers analyzed in this section, in 2013 alone, less than ten mentioned the Volcano Mothers in their written texts, although a few outlets included snapshots of the organization's picketing. In 2013, however, one group in particular made the headlines of regional newspapers quite frequently, and on occasion, the national news. While the group identifies with a gender-neutral denomination, Everyone's Parents' Association (Associazione Genitori di Tutti), journalists, politicians and everyday people refer to them as the Postcards' Mothers. Within Campania's environmentalist efforts, this is the first group where women from working-class rural areas managed to receive positive portrayals in mainstream media, and at least formal support by political authorities. A closer analysis of the group's favored discourse, and its portrayal in national newspapers, can illustrate the gendered nature of its strategies and its recurring presence in the media, clarifying some of the reasons for this seemingly preferential treatment.

Postcards for Better Governance

The group commonly identified as Postcards' Mothers became somewhat prominent in the media in early 2013. Comprised of mothers of cancer-ridden or deceased children, in August 2013, the group began working on a series of postcards showing images and stories of sick and deceased children in the media (Marconi 2013). As the excerpt below exemplifies, the postcards included photos of the children and their rooms, as well as short messages about them—their favorite school subjects or hobbies, their personality traits, their age when they passed away—and stated that these kids could have represented their communities and all of Italy.

“Alice A: Rhabdomyosarcoma- three years forever. I loved dancing and would have been so talented, had they allowed me (to live)” (Associazione Genitori di Tutti, 2013)

The quote appeared beneath a picture of the late Alice, in this case, a seemingly healthy two-year-old with blonde girl with pigtails and a big smile. These postcards appeared in all of the largest national newspapers and during several demonstrations, eventually reaching the hands of Pope

Benedict XVI and the President of the Republic, to whose Neapolitan origins the group had repeatedly appealed. Later, they became part of power-point presentations that activists presented at town hall meetings and at the school, as part of their public outreach. Although the president eventually agreed to meet with a delegation and promised his support, the publication of Schiavone's testimony only a few weeks after the meeting reminded the public that Napolitano had been Minister of the Interior when such depositions were placed under state secrecy. According to critics, this alone put Napolitano's integrity into question (Graziani 2013).

Among the various grassroots groups protesting illegal dumping in Campania, Postcards' Mothers seem to be the most successful in terms of obtaining mainstream media and politicians' attention. Part of their efforts and engagement with ruling bodies enjoys the active support of Caivano's local parish, with rector Patricello keeping the group in touch with President Napolitano and other political figures (Demarco 2014). While favorable media coverage of these efforts on the part of catholic figures suggest that at least locally, the Roman Church in general is supportive of Naples' anti-waste movements, this perspective may be misleading. Activists affiliated with the CoReRi, the ChiaiaNoLandfills and the Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste plan reminded me multiple times that it was the local Curia who sold the local Cave Del Poligono to the Civil Protection agency in 2008, for the specific purpose of building a large landfill for unsorted materials. During my fieldwork, the Bishop of Eboli used regional newspapers as well as social media to encourage protestors gathering outside of Acerra's incinerator to return home so that their actions would not halt the regular functioning of the plant. These incidents, as well as the clergy's opposition to anything other than peaceful protests, compromised their legitimacy in the eyes of various informants.

Some of the key elements to the Postcards' Mothers success include feelings of sympathy for their losses and/or struggles as caregivers of cancer patients, but also their seemingly apolitical discourse. Media portrayals of these mothers place them in private spaces, such as their living rooms or their deceased children's bedrooms. Descriptions of their struggles are laden with feelings of anguish and despair, with headlines such as, "The mothers cry in pain, don't abandon us Mr. President" (Terra dei Fuochi, Patricello e le Mamme da Napolitano 2013) and "You knew everything Mr. President, and did not do a thing about it" (Lettera Aperta al Presidente della Repubblica 2013). Other articles described mothers' "Silent protests, with everyone holding on to an image of somebody they lost to cancer," as well as the tragedy of how they had unconsciously poisoned their bodies and the ones of their children, just by breathing and preparing food" (Marconi 2013).

The association's official website, Genitori di Tutti (Everyone's Parents) presents a slightly different image of the Postcards' Mothers. First, although the gender-neutral Everyone's Parents' (Associazione Genitori di Tutti) appears as the official denomination, activists are aware that the greater public knows them as "Postcards' Mothers." Indeed, all of the activists figuring on the website are women. Second, although testimonials of their deceased children comprise the most notorious of their initiatives, there are others. Through their website, the group collects a catalogue of resources including videos, songs, and fliers to educate the public about Campania's toxic waste contamination as well as civic and environmental values. Comparing mainstream media coverage of Postcards' Mothers' activism with the group's own statements shows that the group does not actively portray itself as one of helpless victims, but rather, advocates for better governance and change from within existing institutions. This is particularly evident in an open letter to President Napolitano and the Pope:

“We are the Postcards’ Mothers, the mothers of the “fighting angels.” We live in a region that has been used as a dumpsite for half of Europe by the criminals and businessmen who have de facto sentenced us to death.... We posed in the postcards seeking help and the truth, and to alert of an increase in neoplastic diagnoses in our communities. We demand to know: were you aware of all of this, Mr. President? ... We still have hope and want to believe in the State.” (Lettera Aperta al Presidente della Repubblica 2013)

In the excerpt above, the Postcards’ Mothers reference the confessions of Carmine Schiavone implicating the international trade in industrial waste: these confessions, which denounced the presence of nuclear sludge from Germany buried in illegal dumpsites in Caivano, and questions Napolitano’s legitimacy and honesty. The Postcards’ Mothers’ activism blends traditional gender roles with Catholicism; working together with the local parish. They engage in dialogue with high-ranking politicians, but do not identify with a political party: rather, the group is built on the shared experiences of mourning a child, and on a shared Catholic identity. The Group’s website, in fact, describes this volunteer organization as follows:

“The founding members of the group “We, the Parents of Everyone” share the unearthly pain of having a child in heaven (...) from a land devastated from illegal dumping and industrial waste. Together they decided to devote themselves to denouncing what is happening, what has been happening for thirty years and to the protection of Campania’s children, by way of protecting the environment and a right to life. Under the guardianship of our fighting angels¹⁰, we strive for a culture that puts children ahead of everything, ahead of personal interests, profits, individualisms and egotisms. We do this for your children, for our children, for the children of the future” (Associazione ONLUS Noi Genitori di Tutti, 2013)

The Rector Patricello, who chairs the Postcards’ Mothers’ parent organization Everyone’s Parents, defines the group’s mission in Catholic terms, that of a “bridge-building mission.” Postcards’ Mothers however speak more concretely of their outreach as seeking to spread the alarm for health and environmental conditions in Campania beyond the limits of political boundaries.

¹⁰ An expression that this group uses to indicate activists’ deceased children

Taking their political claims beyond the realms of existing parties resonates with the low credibility and unpopularity of most governing bodies in Southern Italy (Corona and Fortini 2012). Given this widespread mistrust for political leadership, articulating social justice claims through the language of motherhood, loss, love for a community and religious vocation can thus, establish the movement's credibility far more effectively than a class-based claim, or a clear-cut political affiliation.

With the help of Catholic institutions such as the local parish and Rector Patricello, the Postcards' Mothers have gained access to prominent political figures affiliated with diverse parties. These include former President Napolitano, of a far-left leaning, former regional president Caldoro, from the right-wing party, and more recently, Laura Boldrini, former President of the Deputies' Chamber. All of them have offered various statements of support and promised varying degrees of interventions; in spite of these promises, the Lands of the Fires website (and nowadays, applications) continues to denounce criminal organizations for illegal dumping and arson against their dumpsites.

At the level of local civil society, the Postcards' Mothers have gained the attention of local entrepreneurs and high-ranking university professors, as well as at least a degree of sympathy from other anti-waste groups and movements, as illustrated by the two excerpts below. In an article titled, "Patricello and the mothers of the Lands of the Fires (are) more credible than political parties and syndicates," leftist journalists Ilaria Puglia and Marco Demarco reflected upon the aggravating ineptitude by political parties to prevent and solve Campania's waste problems.

"The women of this land and the words of this one priest (Patricello) have been more effective and more piercing than political parties and syndicates. Once again, old politics has proven itself inadequate. The winners of this story are everyday people, and families. Hope is winning over cheats and corrupt (officials) with their suits and ties" (Puglia, 2014)

The excerpt above translates the title of an article appearing in *Parallelo41*, a newsletter that caters mostly to far-left politics and that has been one of the main outlets for the group *Volcano Mothers*. While *Parallelo41*'s audience may or may not embrace a Catholic ideology, the newsletter, nonetheless, made a statement of support to the *Postcards' Mothers* and Patricello's efforts and joined them in condemning governing bodies

The excerpt below is taken from fieldnotes I took at a public event where Tina Zaccaria, one of the *Postcards' Mothers* main spokespersons, made a presentation alongside local entrepreneurs and public officials. Her intervention focused particularly on the plight of parenthood in her community, through which she advocated for government interventions in Campania, specifically in Caivano, but also for a broader national reform of labor rights for parents.

“Tina Zaccaria, a spokesperson from the *Postcards' Mothers* sat down, dimmed the lights and spent the first 5 minutes of her presentation and in silence showed images of the postcards that her group had sent to President Napolitano. Slide by slide, she showed the audience the picture of a late child in her neighborhood, followed by a short caption describing the child's personality, hobbies and the type of cancer they contracted. I imagine that most people in the audience were already familiar with their stories, as a reproduction of the postcards had appeared in all of the major newspapers. However, the images were indeed striking; several people in the audience silently shed a few tears. After her slideshow, Zaccaria turned the lights back on and prepared to engage with the speakers in her panel. Most of her fellow panelists were government-affiliated pundits and had already concluded their presentations. Most of their interventions had been laden with complaints at how in spite of their best efforts, the Italian state apparatus and the nature of cancerogenic cells made it extremely challenging, not to say impossible, to intervene swiftly in support of the Land of the Fires. After Zaccaria's presentation, however, their tone changed drastically. Through a series of questions, each of them reminded the audience of the on-going efforts and recent achievements of their offices. These efforts, that according to one panelist in particular, were surely to prevent further tragedies “like the one we just heard from Doctor ¹¹ Zaccaria” Before he could get to the next sentence, Zaccaria interjected: “I am not a doctor- I am a mom. And as a mom, I am telling you that the children in my neighborhood are dying from diseases that are only common in heavily industrialized areas. We live in the countryside! And as a mother I am telling you that it is impossible to cure our children with the current Italian labor laws. We need money and time to take our children to hospitals in Rome, Genoa, Milan...yet we because we need to take so much time off, we are currently at

¹¹ The word “doctor” in Italian refers to MDs, as well as anyone in possession of a bachelor's degree.

risk of being laid off.” Her remarks generated a small applause in the audience, with quite a few - women in particular- whispering to each other praises about Zaccaria’s strength and matter-of-fact approach to environmental and health politics.

By presenting herself as a mother, speaking clearly and concisely, Zaccaria managed to make her concerns heard by downtown Naples’ upper classes, who generally tend to be quite diverse in terms of political opinion, but also a very closed-knit group that is typically unresponsive to concerns from rural peripheries. In addition, the excerpt above draws attention to certain relevant aspects of the Postcards’ Mothers activism. While the group is clearly willing to engage with government representatives, Zaccaria does so by bringing in critical, if constructive feedback to pundits and representatives. The request for government assistance shown above intertwines with a sharp commentary of the shortcomings of the current administration. This factual and straightforward, yet constructive criticism departs somewhat from the highly emotional “pleas” and “despair” that newspapers used to describe this group. In addition, the reaction to the representative addressing her as “Doctor” is remarkable. While the co-panelist’s use of the term may have appeared as a ‘gracious” concession he made, not knowing the details of Zaccaria’s educational background, Neapolitan feminists have called this habit out as an affirmation of class power on the part of someone with a higher socio-economic status. By refusing to be called “Doctor,” Zaccaria implicitly claimed that her being a concerned citizen and mother gives her just as much legitimacy to be on that panel as health pundits and environmental administrators.

Volcano-like Motherhood

The Volcano Mothers is another example of a group of local women organizing against the waste crisis based on an idea of motherhood. The group has been active since 2008, when various communities living on the Vesuvius, particularly the towns of Boscoreale, Terzigno and Boscotrecase, began mobilizing against the installment of two landfills within the natural caves of

Mount Vesuvius National Park. In principle, the Volcano Mothers and the Postcards Mothers share several goals and practices, such as claiming a mother's duty to protect her children and community from the environmental and economic damage caused by the prolonged waste crisis. However, the central focus and mobilization strategies of these two groups differ significantly. The Postcards Mothers criticize but also collaborate with governing bodies in addressing the environmental crimes and toxic waste contamination that criminals associated with local Camorra have brought to their community. Whereas Volcano Mothers have drawn attention to the problem of Camorra groups infiltrating with regional waste management, the group's main goal is to prevent the national and regional government from installing additional landfills and incinerators in the area.

While Volcano Mothers are well-known locally, between 2008 and 2014 they received little coverage in the main national newspapers; the few existing articles focus on their participation in protests and demonstrations and are very critical, describing their actions as the ones of rowdy – not to say violent – protestors. For example, La Repubblica's coverage of Balduzzi's trip to Campania describes how “the minister was greeted by a group of ‘volcanic moms’ (quotation marks in the article) and an angry mob” (Sardo, 2013). However, they have received extensive and more favorable coverage in smaller left-leaning, online newspapers, such as *Parallelo41* and *Napoli Today*. Both of these newspapers have published articles written by supportive journalists and, in certain cases, from activists themselves. In these articles, Volcano Mothers have been fierce in their criticism of the regional government and of the Waste Commissioner's office, which they accuse of failing to protect the environmental rights in their communities and of disregarding the interests they hold as women. For example, Anna Brancaccio, a key figure in Volcano Mothers, describes the groups as “Mothers who scream their pain and demonstrate their anger from the bottom of the ‘mountain,’ while being subjected to the indifference of men” (Brancaccio 2013 a).

In spite of such an explicitly feminist statement and of the support that Volcano Mothers enjoy from left-leaning newspapers, the group does not identify with any one political party. Rather, activists define themselves as a “diverse group of women” in terms of socio-economic status and political views (Puglia, 2013). The personal histories and biographies that group members shared with the writer and social-justice activist Cristina Zagaria, in fact, attest to a wide range of ages and work status, including several homemakers but also a few schoolteachers and lawyers. As of 2011, the group counted about fifteen stable members and a much larger number of sympathizers and allies, particularly within the townships of the Vesuvius. A closer look at this group’s discourse can further clarify gender dynamics in southern Italian politics. In terms of activism, Volcano Mothers’ repertoire is quite broad. The group has engaged in collaborative journalism in *Parallelo41*, in outreach and educational activities, in schools and other community spaces but also picked potential landfill sites and crossed law enforcement barriers during protests and demonstrations (Zagaria, 2011). Beginning with the former, Volcano Mothers activists and sympathizers publish regularly in *Parallelo 41*. These articles present motherhood as a central feature of the group’s identity, as shown in both manifestos and biographical excerpts on collaborators, as is their criticism of the government.

“We formed our association during the most recent Waste Emergency, when the state- and I repeat, the State (*lo Stato*, i.e. the national government)- opened a landfill in the heart of the Vesuvius National Park, a landfill that collects mostly toxic waste, hidden underneath urban refuse. And, as if this wasn’t enough, the State was planning to open a second landfill (in the area), the second largest in Europe. We are mothers: as such, we don’t make promises but take action. It is through this uncontainable strength, which only a woman, only a mother, can have, that we have come together to protest state ecocide (*ecocidio*) (...) What has the State done so far? It produced undemocratic laws that deny our rights and trample over our dignity, favoring the appetites of national and international industrial lobbies. It has supported incompetent and corrupt administrators, and left the Camorra to devastate our lands by burying and burning toxic waste on these territories. It has militarized these territories and sent police forces to beat up harmless citizens and the elderly, as if we were ruthless criminals, allowing the actual criminals to deposit poisonous substances in our lands.” (Brancaccio 2013 in Puglia 2013).

In the quote above, activist Anna Brancaccio refers to the discovery of toxic wastes in Cava Vitiello during an inspection from representatives of the European Union, but also to a series of violent clashes between anti-waste activists and law enforcement in previous years. While Brancaccio does not deny that Volcano Mothers may have been involved in acts of civil disobedience, she highlights how their activism is part of their moral obligation as mothers to protect their communities, from the camorra, but also from a state apparatus that is at best inept.

Although Volcano Mothers do not explicitly link themselves with religious representatives, elements of Catholic religiosity recur rather frequently in the group's public demonstrations. While this public display of religion derives in part from activists' beliefs, references to Catholicism also provide a political appeal. First, the area of the Vesuvius, particularly the town of Pompeii, has a strong religious appeal for pilgrims visiting the Shrine of the Virgin of the Rosary in Pompeii. Many Catholics in Campania are devoted to the Virgin Mary, particularly in the area of the Vesuvius. Two times per year, in May and in October, pilgrims and believers from all over Campania gather around the sanctuary in a religious holiday celebrating Mary and this particular shrine. Volcano Mothers have participated in these events by blending in their prayers and advocacy signs, reciting English-language psalms like "Nobody listens to us, the Virgin Mary helps us." The local press quickly picked up and covered these psalms and prayers (Chetta 2010), aiding Volcano Mothers' outreach effort even beyond the large crowd gathering in Pompeii from all of Campania. The choice to use English is further testimony of the area's touristic appeal, for which activists argue, the installment of two large landfills would jeopardize. Elements of Catholicism were also present in some of the group's less peaceful demonstrations. During their picket lines, for example, many protesters held rosary beads in their hands, for comfort but also in the hopes of deterring police brutality. A snapshot of

two armed police officers dragging away a middle-aged protester holding a rosary rapidly went viral on social media, but never made it into any newspaper larger than an online newsletter.

Turning to the group's involvement with protests, Volcano Mothers have contributed to a series of occupations seeking to prevent military and trash collection trucks from reaching the caves Sari and Vitiello, which the National Civil Protection and the Office of the Waste Commissioner had selected as sites for two large landfills. Both caves are located within Mount Vesuvius National Park (Zagaria, 2011). In spite of their limited number, the topography of the area is such that even a small group of protestors could theoretically block the narrow mountain road leading to the park. As local newspaper outlets testified, the protests in these relatively isolated communities implied violent clashes with law enforcement agencies, with one side denouncing police brutality against picket holders and others accusing the protesters of setting fire to (empty) trash collection vehicles. These picket lines continued, on and off, between 2008 and 2012, when the waste commissioner's office gave in to local and EU pressure by aborting the landfill plan in Cava Vitiello and limiting the use of the Cava Sari landfill to a collection point for inert materials from local communities (Viale, 2010).

According to mainstream newspapers, Volcano Mothers do not hesitate to take a confrontational attitude towards the police and state authorities, even within the context of peaceful demonstrations. As Belardo (2013) described, security guards and representatives themselves worked hard to "keep the Volcano Mothers out of town hall meetings" by instructing security not to keep them at the door. While many other groups have accused different right-wing representatives of a similar move, the Volcano Mothers are the only ones to have accused right-wing parties as well as representatives of MS5.

In spite of their difficult relationship with law enforcement and political authorities in general, it would be reductive to define Volcano Mothers' activism uniquely in terms of verbal and physical clashes with state institutions. For example, the group has also organized peaceful demonstrations where families could learn to reuse and recycle materials within the household, as in their "Recycle & Play" event (Zagaria 2011). This effort was an outreach activity, but also a direct response to allegations made by government officials— that local populations do not recycle enough. According to the biography of the Volcano Mothers' biography, this initiative was meant to bring the community together, demonstrate the community's commitment to environmentalist practices, and spend a day outdoors together—enjoying local foods while learning about recycling. Upon organizing this event, activists had two main concerns: their children, whom an activist told Zagaria, "deserve to know why we are never home and order pizza (for dinner) every night," but also police officers, with the mothers sneaking some of the food to the young officers patrolling the event, behind their lieutenants' backs (Zagaria, 2011). By blending in traditional foods with modern recycling, activists were reinforcing a common sense of community, if not small-town Southern Italian ethnicity. Although the event was well attended and proceeded smoothly, with police forces maintaining a friendly, if detached, attitude towards activists, government plans to expand the Vesuvius landfills remained intact; just a few weeks later, as garbage trucks sought to move into the area, the Volcano Mothers' picket resulted in a violent clash with police forces.

It is quite common for anti-waste groups to volunteer in outreach programs in schools, and in certain cases, to test independent collection of recyclables in their communities. The Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan, as well as the CoReRi (Regional Coordination of Refuse), have engaged in similar activities. Postcards' Mothers also support environmentalist outreach in schools, particularly educating children about issues of sustainability and legality. These initiatives rebuked the state's accusation that these communities do not know or do not care enough about

recycling; however, while Armiero (2013) finds that in general, Campanians of all ages and occupations are indeed well-educated on environmental issues, pilot recycling schemes are rarely successful, at least on two accounts. As an activist from the Campania Citizens explained, these local grassroots-driven recycling plans were independent from official trash collection systems, meaning that they preceded recycling facilities in the region. Through these programs, activists helped families learn new habits of recycling and generate data in support of their communities' ability to sort household materials. However, other than encouraging governments to invest in modern forms of waste disposal and renewable energies, these pilot projects had no significant environmental impact and quickly lost traction in the neighborhood. When municipalities failed to implement adequate recycling schemes, and more importantly, prohibited anyone who is not a registered trash collector from handling urban waste, social movements could not offer long-term solutions nor intervene to improve recycling behavior. The case of the Volcano Mothers, however, is exceptional in this context, as their outreach contributed to Anna Brancaccio's nomination to the administrative board of the local trash collection company. While Brancaccio's appointment resulted in several members of the Volcano Mothers leaving the organization, it is the only case where a local anti-waste group was able to participate in the local waste administration.

In the shadows of the Postcards' Mothers

The groups discussed thus far have relied on their expertise as homemakers and mothers to garner a greater degree of support for their community's causes, at the level of public opinion and, in the case of Postcards' Mothers, with government officials. While these groups rely strategically on an essentialist discourse, their mobilization and activism has generated a space for working-class homemakers to voice their concerns as members of local and national civil societies, a result that is quite rare in recent Italian history. While their use of essentialist gender roles has empowered them

in many ways, the popularity of this discourse, particularly as articulated by the well-connected Postcards' Mothers, has generated a particular kind of public discourse on women's environmentalist activism—the mobilization of Catholic mothers, generally homemakers, concerned for their families' well-being. While popular with conservative circles, these three elements - motherhood, illness and Catholicism -have raised concerns among different activist groups, such as CoReRei, , the Campania Citizens and the ChiaiaNo Landfills. Based on semi-structured interviews, I draw attention in the following section to activists' concerns and reluctance at being associated with maternal anti-waste movements, but also to alternative, more causal and relational ways in which activists identify as anti-waste mothers.

One of the first issues to emerge in the course of my ethnographic interviews was a certain preemptive defensiveness or concern among female informants of being associated with Postcards' Mothers and their association of environmental activism with maternal concerns and with the loss of loved ones. Joanne, a Neapolitan informant in her sixties, made this issue very clear when I asked her when and under what circumstances had she become involved with matters of waste in Campania.

“I have always been concerned with sustainability. I do not have a deceased or sick relative story; the kind you hear about everywhere in the media. It is an issue I always found important and cared about, so during the big crises, 2008 especially, I attended meetings and some protests, to keep myself informed and to express my dissent.” (Interview with Joanne, September 2014)

Although at that point of the interview I had not mentioned the Postcards' Mothers efforts, nor had yet spoken about families, Joanne's response highlights how pervasive a discourse on tragic and maternal motivations for activism have become, in mainstream media and at the level of public opinion. It is thus striking that she felt compelled to clarify her positionality in anti-waste movements in relation to notions of mothers' activism. In addition to media campaigns led by such

groups, concerns about public health in Campania were also rather pervasive at the time, particularly after the Order of Family Doctors and General Physicians (Marconi, 2015) declaring their intention to initiate a large study of health outcomes for local populations.

None of the women I interviewed expressed outright criticism or opposition to the Postcards' Mothers. However, many took issues with their Catholic and politically conservative allies, including regional governor Caldoro and the activist and blogger Angelo Ferillo. For example, Cheryl, who is herself part of a group of mothers within the larger organizing of the ChiaiaNo Landfills, explained the following about her group:

"We feel their (the Postcards' Mothers') pain, because for a mom, I cannot imagine a greater tragedy than losing a child. However, I do not want our efforts to be linked to a Catholic movement. Patricello may be mobilizing against toxic waste in Caivano, but it was the Curia who sold the caves in Chiaiano to Bertolaso¹² and the Civil Protection, so they could build their (toxic) landfill there. Still, we have to learn to make do with the allies we can find, so even I went to a demonstration where we all held votive candles. Although (as an atheist) I did not like it. Another time (demonstration) we did not go, it was with Ferillo and we heard he opened up (the event) to Forza Nuova (a neo-fascist group). Then we (ChiaiaNo Landfills) said, no way" (Interview with Cheryl, October 2 2014)

The very visible involvement of Catholicism with anti-waste protests, particularly in the province of Naples, is uncomfortable but unavoidable for many movements. This tension is particularly evident among liberal women and in the areas of Chiaiano and Acerra, whose territorial struggles clashed, in several occasions, with the involvement of religious figures. In Chiaiano, the local curia had sold a large plot of land that the Commissioner's Office meant to use for a landfill for unsorted materials; in the case of Acerra, the bishop of a nearby town, Eboli, had politely criticized the protests and controversies surrounding the incinerator for the accumulation of urban waste in his township (Giornale del Cilento, 2014).

¹² In 2008, a newly re-elected Berlusconi government appointed Guido Bertolaso, former head of the Civil Protection branch of the National Army, as the last Waste Commissioner in Campania. He maintained his position in the military throughout his mandate in Campania.

While being critical of the political alliances and relationships that the Postcards' Mothers entertain, Cheryl is not critical of the group itself, nor of motherhood-based politics. While her group, ChiaiaNo Landfills, is a community based, co-ed organization, it is quite common within this movement to refer to activists like Cheryl – homemakers with children- as "the mothers." This group's use of the term offers an alternative perspective on motherhood in anti-waste movements, one that is logistic and relational, with much fewer political meaning than what the Postcards' Mothers and the Volcano Mothers employ. I encountered the latter frequently, particularly in casual conversations, and relates predominantly to age and work status.

I met with Cheryl and seven other activists from the Chiaiano Landfill movement around 9:00 am, outside the train station in Piazzale Tecchio; we walked together to the main square, about half an hour before the demonstration was scheduled to begin (...). Upon introducing me to her fellow activists (and neighbors), Cheryl remarked that "It is only us, the mothers here today, everyone else is at work or home studying (referring to college-age children)" (...) Sometime later in the day, Lisa, another woman from the ChiaiaNo Landfill movement walked up to me and with a big smile, handed me a cup of coffee. When I thanked her and asked if I could pay her back, Lisa laughed but nearly snapped back at me: "Don't you dare. I am a mom!" (Researcher's Fieldnotes, November 7 2014)

Here, the main reason for activists bringing up their maternal identity is a relational and logistical one: as environmentalist protests are not labor strikes, the relatively more flexible schedules of homemakers with adult children can become crucial to the survival of a movement. Lisa and Cheryl, for example, identified their groups as "mothers," first in relation to the other activists in the ChiaiaNo Landfill group, who could not attend the event, and later, in relation to me and to the cultural expectation that one not take money for food or drink from a younger person. While the logistics of the movement brought homemakers of various ages to spend more time together, and although they identify as "mothers," this in itself does not imply maternal politics.

A sympathetic attitude towards Postcards' Mothers was widespread among most anti-waste organizations in Campania, including ones who were somewhat critical of the ideology surrounding

the movement. While the ChiaiaNo Landfill movements maintained the possibility of working with more conservative anti-waste groups, on occasion, members of the CoReRi and of the Campania Citizens were very critical of local media for exaggerating the pervasiveness of maternal activism among women in Campania. I recruited Elizabeth, an activist from the CoReRi, after reading a short interview she gave to a leftist newspaper. The article, which we discussed in the course of our meeting, was rather short and provided a quick sketch of Elizabeth as an activist and concerned mother. When I mentioned this to her, the reaction was striking:

“Oh, that interview” Elizabeth smiled and shook her head a little bit. “I spent about 40 minutes on the phone with the journalists. I gave a very detailed explanation about the proposed solutions for waste management in Campania and the limitations of what the government was suggesting (the current waste management plan). Towards the end (of the interview), they also asked me about my son and if the current environmental degradation makes me worry for his future. Well- *of course* (emphasis where her tone of voice increased), I love my son. But that was what, one minute maybe, one point (item), out of a pretty long interview, forty minutes, I told you. Yet all they cared to publish about was ‘Oh-my-baby!’”. Elizabeth laughs a little bit and mockingly holds her hands over her womb. “You see, this turns activism- women’s activism in particular- into a gut feeling or an emotional reaction, and I don’t agree with that. Waste is an empirical and political matter.” (Interview with Elizabeth, 9/12/2014)

In the quote above, Elizabeth is criticizing not so much the activists who mobilize around motherhood as much as journalists and media for extending the traumatic and emotional undertones of the Postcards’ Mothers to all women’s anti-waste activism. Elizabeth felt that such a move would delegitimize the political and technical rationale of her claims and contribution to the CoReRi, which she described in very scientific and political terms. During our meetings, we talked extensively about the Italian economist Carla Poli’s seminars on biomechanical waste treatment and of renewable energies, but also of the politics of different environmentalist parties, such as the MS5 and the Left, Liberty and Ecology (SEL). Elizabeth highlighted that while she discusses these issues regularly with the press, journalists rarely bother to publish those remarks and instead blabber incessantly about her being a politically-active working mother driven by the love of her son.

The excerpts above have various themes in common. First, they reflect conversations that took place during the first fifteen minutes of the interviews, where activists discussed the origins of their involvement with anti-waste movements in Campania. Informants took this particular circumstance to distance themselves from the mainstream narrative of gender, motherhood and sustainability brought forward by Postcards' Mothers' becoming a media phenomenon. Second, although anti-waste activism, even within co-ed groups, relies significantly on the input and participation of women, many of them mothers, there is a certain hesitation and resistance to maternal activism, particularly among liberal women with a stable, paid job.

Finally, although public discourse, and certain circles, are welcoming of women's maternal activism, the time commitment that Campania's prolonged waste crisis is demanding of activists is not necessarily compatible with their family life and obligations. The excerpt below is from a former activist, a working mother discussing why she had decided to cut back significantly on her social activism:

"I toured schools all over Italy and gave presentations on Naples' waste crisis and on sustainability. I would get home really late and sometimes have to stay up until 2 or 3 in the morning preparing the slides. If anyone called saying there was an important event, I would leave work and go. This had some repercussions, as a personal relationship of trust is key, in my line of work (...). After a while, I also found out that my marriage was on the line (...) and some of my oldest friends went through major life-changing events and did not tell me about it, because they felt I was too busy or I was just never there. It was like falling off the clouds. I was full of energy and thought I had everything under control, but then I realized all these things were happening, with me hardly noticing. Which is why I cut back on a lot of my social activism. I still attend meetings sometimes, but I am devoting much more time and energy to my family now, and to my practice." (Interview with Jamie, 12/07/2014)

Volcano Mothers' Recycle and Play event had a double agenda, a public one but also a more intimate one, where mothers who had been dedicating less time to their families felt that it would be good for them to see them concretely working for a better future. Prior to this quote, Jamie had explained how she and her husband were of the same opinion about Campania's

waste politics. At the same time, her growing dedication to the cause had significantly jeopardized her personal and professional life. Although the motherhood narrative is creating a discursive space for homemakers to become involved with politics, Jamie's experience points to important limitations with this perspective:

“I had all of these big ideals and all this energy, but apparently, my friends and even my work colleagues- people I have known all my life- thought I was doing it for myself, for my own advancement and publicity. It made me think they did not know me at all”

Jamie's words indicate that although she understood her activism as part of her commitment to her community at large, the mere possibility that career reasons were involved was largely unacceptable to her inner circles. By doing so, Jamie's comments highlight a central concern with the use of maternal narratives in the context of women's activism, (i.e. that it is selfless, done in service of families and communities, and not for personal gain). This perspective complicates the notion that an essentialist identity can be used strategically for women's empowerment purposes, indicating that a maternal discourse can indeed help certain groups gain recognition, but only as long as it is not part of their professional, personal or political ambitions.

Motherhood in Campania's Environmental Protests

How is Campania's waste crisis reshaping gender roles at the levels of civil society and public discourse? The case of the mothers' groups discussed in this chapter reveal that a strategic use of essentialist gender roles can open new possibilities for some groups of women to participate in political discourse, specifically middle and working-class women in rural peripheries. Both groups have organized and constructed their groups' narratives around the political expertise on waste and community health with which their role as mothers have provided; at the same time, the central focus of their mobilization have been landfills, incineration and toxic waste, touching only indirectly

upon gender inequalities. In the case of the Volcano Mothers,' their confrontational response to national and regional governments have granted them little, and very critical, media coverage. At the level of the local community, however, their efforts have met with sufficient consensus to be incorporated into the local administration. In the case of Postcards' Mothers, media coverage of their activities has been much more extensive and supportive, revealing a positive relationship between them and socially conservative stakeholders, such as right-wing politicians and the Catholic Church. While critical, this groups' approach to anti-waste mobilization does not intend to generate a space for activists to participate in local politics. It does, however ask that governing bodies recognize the knowledge and experiences of their community, those of mothers in particular.

While this strategic notion of essentialism has yielded successes for both groups, the existence of maternal waste politics in Campania's public discourse does not necessarily guarantee a space for women in general to engage and participate more substantively in the political realm, nor does it necessarily provide a space to address gender inequalities. The interviews with Joanne, Elizabeth and Jamie make this particularly clear, one by showing how maternal ideologies were in fact obfuscating a highly-educated and politically minded woman's efforts, and another by revealing the fragility of the myth that environmental activism have a space for women's experiences and know-how. Jamie's case also shows the presence of a maternal, women-friendly narrative in the public domain clashing with the everyday social norms and expectations that families and primary networks can place on women, one that is not particularly open to their political and social engagement. Finally, the use of maternal identities among the ChiaiaNo Landfill movement shows that while many different women identify as "mothers," even in the circumscribed context of grassroots activism in Campania, these identities have many different meanings, not all of them strictly political. While the activism of Chaiano's mothers is not a maternal one, as homemakers and stay-at-home mothers of adult children, the relatively flexible schedules allows them to play a central

role as organizers within social movements in general but particularly within local environmental justice efforts.

Reed (2000) and MacGregor (2013) have argued for a more nuanced understanding of gender roles in environmentalist movements, particularly in relation to the ways in which communities experience environmentalist concerns, and also in terms of the specific goals that a group may seek to obtain through a maternal narrative. Following these principles, the strategic use of essentialist identities on the part of women's movements is somewhat empowering of women mobilizing against the sighting of toxic hazards in their communities. It is much less empowering, if not outright oppressive, of women advocating for a more environmentally-sound governance, at the national and regional levels. While empowering in discourse, in practice, the presence of maternal narratives of politics do not necessarily create a space for women's political involvement. In this sense, the experiences of Volcano Mothers and Postcards' Mothers draw attention to the intersection of maternal and Catholic politics in outlining spaces for women's participation to civil society, either as respectable victims (Ridgeway and Smith-Lovin, 2001) or as insurgent feminists.

As of 2014, the Postcards' Mothers initiative has grown into a larger, co-ed organization supporting the families, parents in particular, of cancer victims and survivors in the town of Caivano, northeast of Naples. While this remains a Catholic association that does not formally endorse any one particular party, the mothers remain among its most popular spokespersons, as revealed on the association's website. The Volcano Mothers group gained some supporters and split into two groups (D'Ambrosio, 2012). One maintained the original name; although activists uphold a similarly outspoken and irreverent rhetoric against the Italian government they are also working more closely with their towns' waste administration. In 2013, the pro-Democratic Party mayor of Boscoreale appointed Anna Brancaccio, one of the group's leading figures, to the Administrative

Council of Ambiente Reale (Real Environment), the public company in charge of garbage collection in the municipality; Brancaccio was one of three councilpersons (Carotenuto, 2013). While the idea of operating from within was welcome by the majority of the group, many of the original founding members, including former president Venere Stanzione, resigned and left Volcano Mothers, concerned that working with local politics would delegitimize their effort as a social movement. These former Volcano Mothers formed a new group, the Volcano Phoenix, a volunteer organization that mobilizes around environmental concerns but also around traditional feminist themes, such as women's health and intimate partner violence. The new group entertains positive relationships with local Catholic figures, who, for a time, provided them a space to meet survivors of IPV. While the majority of its members are women, this is a co-ed association enjoying support and sharing membership with other organizations such as the CoReRi and the Campania Citizens.

CHAPTER FOUR: SUPPORTING THE GREEN SECTOR WHEN GARBAGE IS PRIVATE: VOLUNTEERISM, ENTREPRENEURIALISM AND MONOPOLIES

In the previous chapter, I have discussed the emergence of maternal narratives among the environmentalist segments of Campania's anti-waste movements: while reinforcing essentialist division of labor and gender roles, I have argued that a strategically essentialist use of these narratives is a key reason for working-class women in rural peripheries to gain political visibility, in their communities and beyond. Here, I turn to the environmentalist practices that activists carry out in their daily lives, in their homes and workplace. These interviews draw attention to some of the less visible strategies they employ to further their anti-waste cause, and to how women intertwine their commitment to waste reduction with their personal and professional lives.

Campania's prolonged waste crisis has challenged many committed activists with finding a sustainable balance between their activism and their families, but also their jobs. Economic and employment concerns are particularly crucial to many informants, as the waste crisis overlaps with the financial recession and with the implementation of austerity measures. Here, I examine participation in environmentalist movements, as well as workplace and entrepreneurial efforts, while also taking into account informants' opinions of their work-life-activism balances. What new opportunities are becoming available, specifically to women, through environmentalist practices and expertise? What specific workplace challenges do women seek to overcome through environmentalism? How do informants understand and define their sustainable efforts in relation to their occupational status?

These questions draw attention to how anti-waste practices are part of various strategies that women employ to resist disempowering social structures and institutional arrangements across multiple scales, including governance, communities, families and workplaces. Many of these

oppressive structures transcend environmentalist concerns and reflect local culture, economy and religion. Other challenges however emerged, or at least exacerbated in the context of Campania's waste crisis and, I argue, the particular mode of neoliberal governance in place for this area. This chapter engages critically with on-going debates on the role of environmentalism in promoting women's agency, in the context of a relatively peripheral area of the Global North. In particular, I situate women's agency in environmental efforts in terms of everyday work and of social reproduction, rather than in terms of public discourse on women's relationships with the environment underlying much scholarship and propaganda. By doing so, this chapter further contributes to critical feminist readings of heteronormative gender roles within a discourse on sustainability and development.

The Symbolic Empowerment of Municipal Monopolies

Existing scholarship on neoliberal waste governance draws attention to how the privatization of public services, including trash collection and waste treatment, reinforces social inequalities by neglecting low-income neighborhoods. In these context, disenfranchised groups but particularly women have taken on unpaid volunteer work to keep their neighborhoods and communities clean (Miraftab, 2004), but also to initiate small-scale recycling groups in the community (Hanson, 2015). Although these instances represent efforts to counter oppressive governing and environmentalist regimes, these studies highlight how neoliberal privatizations of waste services outsource the work of providing a safe and sustainable environment from governing bodies to the private sector, and from the latter to women's unpaid work.

The case of Campania differs from these to the extent that trash collection and road cleaning services are strictly public services managed by the public company Azienda Sanitaria Igiene Ambientale (ASIA), of which Naples' municipality is the sole shareholder (ASIA 2016). While the

service is public, the politics of this company have strived to exclude grassroots organization from participating, even as volunteers, to trash collection and recycling activities in the township of Naples. In addition, the company operates under the privatization of waste and refuse, which renders the company the only entity that can lawfully manage waste materials since the leave consumers' homes or businesses. In other words, while the service of trash collection and street cleaning is public service, waste materials constitute the company's private property. This alternative mode of privatization of waste rather than waste collection represents an atypical experience of neoliberal governance (Brenner and Theodore, 2000), in that it limits the involvement of volunteer groups, but also independent entrepreneurs from engaging in service provision, for profit but also as community services. In addition, the 2011 legal provisions criminalizing independent transportation of waste materials (that I have described in Chapter One) and equating illegal transportation of waste in a private vehicle with illegal dumping further deter third parties from handling waste materials, even for the purposes of reuse and recycle. This institutional framework is atypical in the context of neoliberal waste governance, as it exonerates the private entrepreneurship, civil society and, to an extent, private citizens from the responsibility to deal with their wastes, beyond sorting materials for recycling in select neighborhoods. The consequences of this regulation are economic and political, as this framework hinders their opportunities to organize neighborhood initiatives but also to profit from waste reduction.

In order to discuss the empowering and disempowering aspects of the concrete experiences of neoliberal waste governance in this context, three theoretical frameworks in particular are key. First, as mentioned in previous chapters, the possibility of generating equitable forms of economic growth through environmentally-friendly jobs, by which international and national institutions lay out concrete frameworks for environmentalist opportunities to benefit particular groups, including women and ethnic minorities (Resurrecion, 2013). While this approach gains popularity, particularly

among (neo)liberally-minded international institutions, both Resurrecion (2013) and Miraftab (2004) warn against conflating symbolic empowerment with material, neoliberal forms of oppression. From both theoretical and concrete perspectives for example, these two authors warn against the production of a gendered discourse of sustainability and work in the absence of concrete avenues for upward mobility. Specifically, these studies refer to policies and investment seeking to co-opt women's work into sustainability agendas either as volunteers, i.e. praiseworthy but unpaid labor (Miraftab, 2004) or as lower-wage workers (Resurrecion 2013).

Apparently, Campania's waste regime departs from the neoliberal privatization of public services that these studies criticize; however, limitations on legal involvement with neighborhood waste and cleanliness does not necessarily correspond to inaction on activists' part: rather, it shapes the contexts in which informants decide on the kinds of action they are willing to engage. To better understand how the decision making process on action and inaction take place, Reed (2002) suggests focusing on two understudied aspects of environmental movements: the rationales behind inaction, and groups' relational position within a particular context. This means broadening our understanding of agency to incorporate instances in which grassroots' actors – women in particular – decide not to mobilize or become politically involved in a particular issue, but also to the political value they give to everyday practices, even in the context of official inaction. The choice participate in environmental preservation in fact intersects with broader politics of a particular locality, but also with concerns for the local economy and their own financial well-being, considerations that can lead many, but particularly low-income communities in rural areas, to lean towards inaction and/or opposition to environmentalist and nature preservation efforts.

In spite of this regulatory framework, many activists are claiming authority and leadership in promoting initiatives seeking to green the practices of their workplaces. These initiatives are both outreach efforts for their groups' causes, but also represent creative and sustainable ways for women

to obtain recognition and visibility in their places of work. In spite of these advantages, these efforts rarely yield significant economic returns, begging the question of how much sustainable practice in the workplace depend on women's unpaid work.

As I return to in this chapter and in the following (Chapter 5), the role of volunteer and unpaid work underlies an important concern with ecological modernization theory. While the latter suggests that through public and private investments in the private sector, European societies in particular would be able to generate employment and wealth while absorbing the externalities of capitalism (Mol and Spargaaren, 2007). Although the investments in the green economy in Italy have been relatively high, at least until 2014¹³ (UNEP 2016), these investments pertain predominantly to solar energy. With regards to the EU Waste Directives, Campania's case in particular is struggling with waste reduction efforts. In chapters One and Three, I have discussed how municipal governments are actually paying to export household recyclables abroad, or to other regions. By focusing on the role of volunteer and unpaid labor, I draw attention to how everyday forms of environmentalism- or perhaps, a greening of social reproduction – can take place through disenfranchised labor. While the environmental returns to this green work might be positive, the availability of a precarious workforce can allow firms, households and other workplaces not to invest in sustainable technologies while still “greening” themselves. These observations further highlight a common limitation of sociological approaches to sustainability that over-emphasize the role of technologies in reducing the labor needed to carry out both social reproduction and sustainable efforts (Mol and Spargaaren, 2007).

¹³ According to the Frankfurt School UNEP Collaborating Centre, as of 2015, Italy invested less than one billion in renewable energy; this figure represents a 21% decrease since 2014, and a much more drastic shift since the 35 billion of 2011. A similar trend is unfolding in Germany, where investments in renewable energies dropped to 1.3 billion in 2015.

Following Reed's methodological points, in this chapter I address Italian women's challenges and agency in relation to their environmentalist efforts based on the practices that they implement in various spheres of life, including social movements and civil society, but also workplace, entrepreneurship and family. By doing so, I highlight how changing aspects of gender relationship in one realm may influence, positively or negatively, other aspects of life. The narratives that I discuss below reveal a close relationship between environmentalist ideals and action and upward mobility within the workplace, but also possible conflicts and tensions within primary networks. By focusing on the practices of anti-waste mobilization, this chapter expands on the forms of agency that become available to women within green ideologies and within the more environmentally conscious segments of Campania's civil society. As I illustrate, the presence of a motherhood-environment link among green movements, but also at the level of certain workplaces, yield diverging empowering or oppressive circumstances for different informants. While some of these differences reflect socio-economic and class considerations, the narratives reveal a more intricate picture of the many factors shaping women's involvement with social movements.

Conducting more personal interviews

This essay relies on the insights and narratives of women I interviewed in the provinces of Naples and Salerno between July and December 2014. The semi-structured ethnographic interviews included topics such as how and when the respondent had become involved with anti-waste movements as well as the initiatives and practices they implemented as a consequence of their environmental ideology. All of the informants cited in this study were living in Campania at the time of the interview, with some of them commuting between urban and rural areas, for work and family reasons. With the exception of two, all of the women informing this study held a stable paid job outside the home: of these two, one is a homemaker and one was actively looking for work after

losing her previous job at social service agency. The age of the informants ranges between early thirties and early sixties. Two informants identified as single, eight as married or in a domestic partnership. Of these, seven have children, most of which are teenagers or young adults. Politically, most of these groups identify somewhat with radical leftist ideologies, although about half of them do not endorse any particular political party. The movements I am drawing mostly from are anti-waste groups such as the Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan (*Cittadini Campani per un Piano Alternativo dei Rifiuti*), the Regional Coordination of Refuse CoReRi (Coordinamento Regionale dei Rifiuti) and the ChiaiaNo Landfill (ChiaiaNo Discarica). Education levels are relatively high, with all informants having a high school degree or higher. Recruitment strategies involved tracing activists through their public profiles and in the context of anti-waste protests, followed by snowball sampling. Although there are a few tensions between the organizations that I mention in this paper, relationships between activists are generally positive and created a productive environment for snowball sampling. As I carried out this particular procedure, I solicited the more well-known activists to think of possible informants among less known fellow activists, in order to achieve a broader understanding of how participating to a grassroots organization changes daily life, beyond the one portrayed by public figures in the local media.

In general, I felt rather well received by informants, who were open to the idea of a research project focusing on women but also very supportive of a younger woman's work, particularly in the backdrop of the ramping unemployment rates among my cohort. Unlike other chapters, some of the informants cited in this chapter include younger people and professionals of both sexes; all of them have at least a Bachelor's degree, and some a post-graduate degree. Two of these younger informants and I are alumnae of the same college, which made it a bit easier for us to connect in the course of the interview. Some of the quotes I discuss in this chapter are drawn from a second

interview or following a prolonged email exchange on the scope of the project, meaning once a certain degree of trust or comfort had been established previously.

The following narratives begin with an outline of the context for women's activism in relation to the legal and political framework underlying waste in Campania; following, I engage with the specific challenges that activists face in the workplace, due to gender inequities but also the recent austerity measures and to the waste crisis. Following, I discuss the relationship between activism, personal life and work emerging from those narratives. As I show, the relationship between gender and sustainability is conflicting and depends on the political and economic implications.

Narratives

Garbage is Private

In 2013, Environment Minister Corrado Clini gave a town hall meeting in the Economics campus of Naples' Federico II University on the topic of government efforts to overcome the waste crisis; various informants attended this talk and shared videoclips on social media and YouTube. During one these recordings, Simona Pucciarelli, one of the key organizers of the movement Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan, challenged the minister with a series of questions on the legal framework in place to guarantee regular waste services in the region. Standing up to present her points, Pucciarelli addresses the Minister but often shifts her gaze from the speaker to her personal notes, to the audience and to the camera.

“First of all, we must remove all statutes of limitations from environmental crimes (...). A family in Acerra, they had been cultivating their plots for centuries; with the damage the Camorra did to them, they will not be able to do that anymore (...) Then, if we want to talk about making new laws, shall we- why can't we- write a simple little law for a deposit-refund system?” The crowd cheers. Clini fumbles and tries to interrupt her questions.

Pucciarelli's suggestion of establishing positive incentives to recycle in Campania sheds light on a recurring source of exasperation among anti-waste activists. Exhausted by governing agents' describing locals as "uncivilized" and "uneducated" for failing to recycle effectively, Pucciarelli, and many others, challenged the validity of government interventions to increase recycling, in the face of little infrastructure and incentives, such as allowing retailers to collect clean, empty containers, or small cash incentives for delivery of certain reusable materials.

Actually, we had this kind of project going on for a short while. I think it was 2011. It was working quite well – you know, university students, mostly the ones from out of town, would deposit their bottles and obtain cash vouchers to exchange at the post office. The money was really not much, but you know, life in the university area is not that expensive, with the few cents they would get, they could make up the cost for a meal or two¹⁴. But then they stopped that – garbage is private pretty much, it belongs to A.S.I.A. Nobody else can manage it (Interview with Kelli, July 7 2014)

Kelli, a former activist in the Campania Citizens, struggled to hide her frustration as she thought of a valid initiative being discontinued, seemingly with no reason. Although this initiative was quite small-scale, Kelli believed it represented an important step in the direction of sustainable waste management. UK environmental agencies for example had lauded deposit-refund systems as effective means of increasing recycling habits and environmental awareness, particularly in cities; additional evidence from the United States suggests that these programs can also help disenfranchised groups in society earn a little money (Gowan, 2009).

Kelli's comments on the lack of a deposit-refund system came as a surprise. Just that morning, I had observed a middle-aged Neapolitan woman and a boy walk through the streets of downtown Naples holding a large recycling bag, picking up empty water bottles poking out, or spilling over from small landfill bins lining the street and heaved it to a recycling station, just a few blocks, to the neighboring district's plastic container. As of July 2014, recycling services in that neighborhood were limited to dry clean materials, and only in select streets. I mentioned this to Kelli and asked whether

¹⁴ As of 2010, a ticket for a full meal in a university cafeteria or partner restaurant would cost about 2.50 Euros; certain street foods in that same area would sell for roughly one euro.

this also constitutes a violation of waste laws. Neither the woman (nor the boy, who could not have been more than ten) had the gear of municipal ecological operators, and the time of the day did not correspond to one of recyclables or trash collection.

“I think that we should be thanking them! In a perfect world, we would also pay them for it. But by law, they are not waste operators, so they should not be doing that. The garbage is private, once it's out of your house, it belongs to ASIA. It (this situation) is such a disaster”

Restricting the handling of all waste and recyclables to designated trash collection companies in principle is not unprecedented: what is surprising here is how extensive these restrictions are and the unexpected challenges they posed to everyday efforts of waste reduction and recycling in underserved districts.

In spite of these limits, these regulations did meet some support, even from environmentally conscious people. While the principle of cashback for containers and in general more ground-up participation to recycling schemes would be welcome, many feared that a system of incentives could become a Trojan horse for further illegal dumping. In addition, some were concerned of this incentivizing people to look through garbage bins in search for recyclables, a possibility that to some meant mostly a health hazards, particularly for low-income children and homeless persons, or anyone becoming injured while handling garbage without the appropriate gear. Others reiterated this concern for people rummaging through garbage bins, particularly on the part of the Romani groups living in Naples.

“I agree that government agents should focus on industrial waste practices, and on the big picture more than on urban recycling (...). Urban recycling is good and all, but it is mostly a matter of city aesthetics. However, once there is a recycling bin, it is not admissible that one searches through garbage and recyclables like that, pulling stuff all over the place again. This is a problem with the Romani in particular, they are doing that in more neighborhoods now. They go through that rubbish with hooks to pull out meal scraps and electronics, copper mostly, and then sell this filth Sunday morning, in the Via Marina scraps market”. (Interview with Claude, July 9 2014)

The quote above reveals both skepticism at on-going government interventions to reduce waste, which, this particular informant – a highly educated man in his early 50s – found to be little more than window-dressing measures and lip service to EU regulations. More importantly, Claude’s words draw attention to a widespread hostility and mistrust for Romani groups living in the outskirts of Naples and the fear that they would disrupt urban redevelopment efforts. Given the increasing hate crimes and widespread hostility towards Romani that many in Italy, including Naples, feel, the provision prohibiting spontaneous cleaning up of streets becomes more palatable to the greater population, particularly middle classes. This concern for an ethnic minority being involved with illegal handling of waste - on their own behalf or as bottom-of-the line workers for the Camorra – is a recurring concern for Neapolitan public opinion. These beliefs echoes the sentiment behind both A.S.I.A and Repubblica sharing YouTube videos featuring “immigrant” men standing by in desolated streets and highways, collecting trash bags from cars driving by in exchange for one euro or two (Repubblica, 2014). As I highlight in the following chapter (Chapter Five), these sources and observation indicate concerns for low-income or disenfranchised ethnic minorities becoming complicit to *ecomafias*, or, at best, exploited.

Centralizing collection and all handling of refuse and recyclables in the hands of A.S.I. A’s municipal monopoly poses several challenges to the initiatives of anti-waste groups and to the ones of individual activists seeking to live, and establish a greener lifestyle.

Gina’s family is originally from a small town about one hour away from Naples; although she has been working in a law firm downtown for several years, she still visits and helps to run her grandparents’ farm, making at least one trip per month to the countryside. During one of those trips, just a few months before our meeting, a police patrol had stopped her for a random security control and discovered she was carrying two containers of compost materials in her trunk. Gina had explained to the officers that she was planning to carry the compost back to the farm and use it as fertilizer; however, they still charged her with illegal transportation of waste and intent of illegal dumping, both of these criminal offenses in Campania. Although the law interpreting illegal waste transportation as intent of illegal dumping had been repealed in October 2014, Gina was scheduled to appear in court a few

weeks after our meeting. While the repeal, and the limited amount of material she was carrying made it very likely that the charges be dropped, she was still putting together documents proving her ties to her family farm¹⁵.

Gina did not provide any specific details as to when she was stopped, nor if she thought the officers who stopped her meant to retaliate against her for organizing large-scale demonstrations in her hometown a few years before. Assuming that the officers had acted in good faith, the underlying law they referred to prohibited private citizens and entities in Campania from carrying their own refuse to a different location for the purpose of reuse and recycle; anyone caught transporting waste independently is thus presumed to be about to dump it illegally. By doing so, this law makes it virtually impossible for activists and communities affiliated with both urban and rural areas to establish networks or partnership carrying to transfer compostable materials from urban households to agricultural areas. Given scarcity of compost plants in Campania – as of December 2014, A.S.I.A was still not collecting compostable materials from several neighborhoods, including Gina’s- these laws are preventing people from reducing waste production, whether it is in the context of a private household initiative or through a cooperative. To make matters worse, in the absence of recycling facilities, Legambiente’s senior staff had highlighted how municipalities with high recycling rates were forced to draw from their own budgets to ship the sorted materials abroad or to a different region:

Here in Campania we are looking at the paradoxical situation where we “punish” those municipalities increasing their recycling rates, because they have to pay to transport their materials to other nations or regions, which would make incentives to reuse and not generate waste to begin with more palatable. (Interview with Carla, October 5 2014)

Centralizing all waste-related matters into the hand of the same municipal monopoly, in the absence of recycling infrastructure is a controversial move: according to some, it seeks to counter ecomafias and allegedly widespread “littering”; according to others, “It just means that there are a few big

¹⁵ Gina seemed convinced that by proving she was on her way to a family farm, she would have convinced the judge that she actually still had a use for the materials as a natural source of compost

businesses demanding to profit from these monopolies.” Symbolically, these regulations sought to exonerate citizens from having to deal with handling waste and dirt, at least on a public sphere. At the same time, limiting opportunities to engage, publically, with neighborhood maintenance as public figures and social movements, a move that hindered activists’ efforts to resist the disruptions that the waste crisis was causing in their everyday lives, but also to contradict hostile propaganda by presenting themselves as environmentalist groups.

“Just think of a place like Piazza del Carmine, right behind the landmark neighborhoods, with that beautiful church – of course tourists want to see it. Earlier this year it was completely covered in garbage, all the time, the A.S.I.A Company hadn’t cleaned it in ages. So, I began organizing to have it cleaned up- I contacted volunteers and the local authorities and A.S.I.A to get the authorization; because A.S.I.A has the monopoly over waste and street cleaning in the city, you cannot do that without consulting them first. So everything was ready and set, but the night before our (clean-up) event, A.S.I.A went in and cleaned up the square. They made us activists, me in particular, look like idiots in front of our volunteers- they were wondering why we made such fuss and made them come out if the square was clean. Del Giudice¹⁶, the CEO of A.S.I.A. did publicly thank all of us- particularly me, for volunteering, but I got very angry at him” (Interview with Caitlin, September 20 2014)

Caitlin, a Neapolitan tour operator, spoke at length of the challenges that Campania’s waste crisis and management problems were causing not only to agricultural communities but also to the city’s image and, not the least, tourist economies. As locals, and anti-waste activists had little confidence that government agents would be able to solve the problem, many groups sought to organizing cleaning-up initiatives and pilot household recycling projects to revamp the image of the city from the negative propaganda it was receiving. These efforts sought to strengthen community ties and help the city recover, emotionally and financially, from bad publicity. However, informants described how these initiatives were far from welcome to the

¹⁶ Del Giudice is one of the key informants in the documentary *Beautiful Country* (Calabria and D’Ambrosio, 2007), one of the first films ever to denounce Campania’s waste crisis. While his appointment to A.S.I.A. was initially viewed as a victory by most grassroots’ organizations, he abruptly ended most of his outreach shortly afterwards, disappointing and angering many activists.

local administrations, which feared being discredited but also sought to reinforce a strict monopoly of trash collection, even when the company's was struggling to provide reliable services across town.

Excluding grassroots organizations from contributing to reduce-and-recycle efforts may have been an unintended consequence of a law and regulation seeking to centralize and improve services in the city. However, these regulations also pose limitations on which social groups can legally enlist waste – including recyclables and dirt – into their political networks. While activists like Gina or Caitlin struggled to gain access to waste even for the purpose of recycling and cleaning, A.S.I.A for example can easily post informative videos to social media, displaying proper and improper ways of recycling.

Garbage and Work

The interview with “Caitlin” draws attention to a growing hostility between designated ecological operators and anti-waste activism and to the damages that Campania's waste crisis brought: to the local economy and to the image of the city and its' people, nationally and abroad. As a tour operator, both of these concerns were key for Caitlin, who had seen the flow of tourism decline since 2008 and is used to receiving disparaging treatment from colleagues from other parts of Italy, particularly from the north. Since the crisis, it have become even more challenging to convince tourists groups and agencies to include Southern Italy, particularly Naples, in their itineraries.

“When you reach the city by bus, you get off the highway, one of the first things we would encounter would be huge heaps of garbage, sometimes sitting, sometimes burning, so I would think to myself “Here we go, that is the first sight that international tourists get of my city, confirming whatever racist rumor heard before. As if it wasn't already hard enough to convince tourist agencies to arrange for tours to come down to Naples, most just do Rome, Florence, Milan and Venice, few organized tours go anywhere South of Rome. It is really awful to think of Naples appearing like this”. (Interview with Caitlin, September 20 2014)

As mentioned before, the media scandal erupting around Naples “Waste Emergency” dealt a heavy blow to the local economy, particularly emerging industries such as high-end crops and tourism. In Caitlin’s experience, the latter already suffers from heavy competition, if not outright discrimination, on the part of tourist agencies and tour operators from Northern regions; the lack of a proper trash collection system and low recycling rates only reinforces stereotypes of Naples as a dangerous and dirty city.

Discrimination on the part of northern Italian and government elites is very common among narratives and experiences of Naples, particularly on the part of highly mobile younger people working as professionals all over the country. However, it is only over the past ten years that a generation of highly mobile graduates of Southern Italian origins have started speaking of these instances in terms of racism against Neapolitans and South of Italy, at an institutional level but also on the part of coworkers, fellow students and neighbors in Northern Italy. In some cases, even public figures like Roberto Saviano have taken to draw on the experiences of Black Lives Matter to give words to experiences of institutional discrimination. Others, like Caitlin, take a language of racial discrimination to distinguish between the history of Southern Italy as a colony and the problems of the present day.

Caitlin’s interest in the state of Naples’ landmark monuments reflects her environmentalist ideology but also a concern for her professional life. Reinforcing the flow of tourism coming to Naples, and establishing Naples a more popular or viable destination for organized Italy tours in fact would reinforce her economic standing but also provide her with more professional opportunities. Furthermore, rumors of the waste crisis contribute to a generally hostile climate towards Naples and Neapolitans, an issue that Caitlin encounters every now and then. In her experience, fellow tour

operators from northern Italy do not hesitate to denigrate the city or its inhabitants in front of tourist groups or Caitlin.

“I was guiding a group of Canadian tourists from Naples to Milan, and my colleague from Milan calls and begs me to delay the tour because she is late, she needs to pick up her niece from school before she meets us. I said ‘Okay, I’ll have the driver make another highway stop’, and stalled the tour for about half an hour. When we get there, she welcomes the group to Milan by saying “Milan is the city where people work hard and run the economy. Rome rules (the country), and Naples sings and squanders.’ I pulled her aside after that and told her to thank the heavens she had come across a “good-hearted Neapolitan” but that next time she needed a favor, she could go fuck off and take her niece with her. She (my colleague) stared at me like I was from another planet. But it was nice, at least, that a Canadian lady called her out on what she said, she pointed right at me and said ‘This young lady is from Naples and she had been working very hard’ ”

While experiencing similar micro-aggressions does not necessarily underlie a critical perspective on how migrant workers and asylum seekers in Italy, Naples in particular, the disparaging treatment that many of these relatively young professionals receive from their colleagues and supervisor in Northern regions pushes many of them to look abroad for safer space to work or network, or at least, validation. In her experience, fellow tour operators from northern Italy do not hesitate to denigrate the city or its inhabitants in front of tourist groups or Caitlin. Of course, many of these tensions and problems are rooted into historical and institutional inequalities expanding well beyond the garbage emergency. The waste crisis and the negative publicity it received, nationally and internationally, did however exacerbate those accidents. As Jamie, an upper-class Neapolitan business owner and activist in the Campania Citizens movement explained,

“The so-called ‘fine’ Naples (upper classes) only started to give a damn about the whole waste situation when their kids (adult children) working in Milan or in the North started to be treated like crap because they are from Naples, people looked at them like they were uncivilized brutes from some other planet. Before that, they were just sitting there, self-entitled, expecting the government to clean up after them and not caring about the contamination of peripheral areas.”

Caitlin’s case exemplifies how anti-waste activism touches upon multiple spheres of life, including ideology and territorial attachment, but also professional opportunities and

workplace relationships. More than a net economic or professional gain, by mobilizing Caitlin is trying to counter the damage that the waste crisis can bring to her line of work and professional opportunities, as well as a reflection of her social and political ideologies. Her involvement with green initiatives does not provide her with additional income; however, by resisting environmental contamination Caitlin is also seeking to address possible economic setbacks. Although Caitlin is actively involved with these practices, with a political and conscious approach, these practices of resistance she is engaging with result in her carrying out unpaid work of sustainability, on behalf of and in spite of municipal services. Rallying volunteers to clean up a square and sort through various materials left there to litter it is an example of these practices. In addition, in the previous chapter (Chapter Three) I have described neighborhood recycling initiatives.

Engaging with anti-waste movements and efforts has led many activists to implement greener practices in multiple spheres of life. While some of these efforts are geared predominantly to the public sphere, such as attending marches and meetings, blogging and making appearances on local media, also other, less spectacular practices go on at the household level and in the workplace. While such practices are less spectacular than a demonstration, they take up a substantive part of informants' lives, and endure (or become routinized) over time. Because sustainability and waste reduction has gained legitimacy as a moral and necessary act, particularly in the context of Campania's waste crisis, many informants discussed instances in which they try to implement greener practices within their workplace. As the following interviews show, these efforts are integral to informants' commitment to reducing waste, but they also generate professional and leadership opportunities for them in their place of work. In the context of Southern Italy's receding economy

and of pre-existing glass ceilings¹⁷, these opportunities are becoming vital to many women's job stability and satisfaction.

Adrienne is a tenured teacher in a professional school in the province of Salerno and a member of the Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan. A civil engineer by training, she has worked as consultant with the Ministry of the Environment in Naples for a few years; more recently, she has joined three associates, all of them women, in a small part-time activity seeking to promote, design and patent sustainable products. Throughout our interview, she spoke of her environmental efforts in close relation to her professional experience. Warning me, with a smile that her story was going to be a bit convoluted ("Bear with me, I am an engineer!"), she spoke of her unexpected career as a schoolteacher.

"I graduated (with a BS) from mechanical engineering in Naples in 1982 and applied for a position at the local plane manufacturer. Although I officially passed the interview and met all of their requirements- they even wrote down I was qualified for the job- they still wouldn't hire me, because I was a woman. I would have had to work night shift, supervising teams of up to thirty male workers, and although I told them I felt confident to do it, they still would not hire me. A few years later, a relative of mine started working for that firm and went through the personnel files, he saw that on paper, I should have been hired and convinced the firm to interview me again. But still, they did not offer me a job. In the meantime, I could not just stay at home and live at my family's expenses, so I was looking for pretty much anything. My sister, she was a schoolteacher and convinced me to file the paperwork, and I was hired immediately. I have been a teacher ever since, I teach chemistry and physics, that is how I make a living."

Although her title as a tenured high school professor had guaranteed her financial stability for many years, the recent financial recession had resulted in substantive budget cuts in the public sector,

¹⁷ According to the World Economic Forum, in 2016 Italy's Gender Gap ranked 50th out of 167 countries (following Colombia and preceding Bahamas by only a few decimal points), indicating a growing participation of women to the paid workforce. However, this same dataset places Italy as 109th of 167 in a ranking of wage equality per similar work.

threatening Adrienne's financial stability. Just a few months prior to our interview, the school Adrienne works for had merged with another professional institute in the same neighborhood.

"I have been seeking to establish a partnership between the Environment Ministry, the local School System and the local waste bureau in promoting sustainable behavior in the community. Using schools as education and information hubs for students and for their family- we can really help establish a better communication between the realms of technical expertise, the political reforms taking place through the school system and educate people about sustainable lifestyles. After all, if I send a pamphlet at home with each student, I am reaching out to an equal number of families. Currently, I am also trying to build in an environmental studies thematic module within existing curricula, meaning incorporating some environmental studies discussion into each existing subject that we teach in the schools, so a chemistry professor would teach about waste and sustainable energy, arts and crafts instructors can talk about reusing materials, and literature professors can select a short story, and so on. This has been a little bit difficult, as the school I currently work for has merged with another local institute but in theory a few colleagues of mine would be on board."

All of these efforts on Adrienne's part reveal her dedication to reinforce the role of environmental studies and sustainable lifestyles through higher education, but also opportunities for her to stand out in the context of the local school system, which currently has to deal with budget cuts. These efforts are thus helping her establish herself within the school, but also helps her feel more satisfied with a job that she had taken on reluctantly. For similar reasons, Adrienne is working with three female associates in a self-funded freelance entrepreneurial initiative trying to design and patent recyclable commodities, such as compostable packaging for food items. At the time of our interview, she and one colleague of hers were particularly excited about a compostable pizza foil that they had presented at a local fair and received a local prize for, although the patenting process was still in place. When I asked how this small-scale, women-only partnership had begun, her immediate response was "Out of desperation", which in the context of a socially pessimistic society could be taken at least in part to be a joke.

"I have many ideas, and so do they, but not all of them are feasible (...) so we check in with each other, and of maybe ten projects that I pitch, my associates- one of them in particular,

she is an architect- will okay one or two, and we move along trying to make it happen. But it is very difficult, when you don't have a lot of capital to invest. That is why we try to pitch small things, like compostable food foils (...). We presented them at a community event"

Adrienne and her associates tried to design small, inexpensive products, for everyday use in homes and in local businesses, such as restaurants and grocery stores: this is part of their efforts to implement sustainable practices at the level of everyday life, but also to offset costs of designing it. In the case of their food foils for example, local restaurants and paper shops were interested enough in the idea to supply them a handful of free materials, while the local municipality offered to cover for part of the labor.

This idea of freelance entrepreneurship or simply trying to patent sustainable products and materials is not exclusive to women's activism, as engineers and architects operating on local firms have also invested in similar projects. Informants describe these efforts as well-received, particularly on the part of their employers, who viewed these environmentalist efforts as zero-cost opportunities for their firms to expand, or at least become greener; however, many informants encountered difficulties in obtaining public funding for this projects, particularly from national and regional government agencies. They highlighted difficulties with ministries and the slowness of state bureaucracy as a much greater obstacle than access to capital, labor and materials.

Chris is a Neapolitan architect in his fifties who self-identifies as an architect and activist. During our first interview, he explained how he had been struggling for months to patent a sustainable compound with similar properties to carbon fiber, but easier to disassemble and re-assemble for reuse and recycling

"I have met with local representatives of the ministries of environment and tourism. We talked, for more than an hour and they seemed truly interested in the project, but do not have funding available for it. Now, two things can happen. I could wait, and risk another entrepreneur or larger company snatching the idea from me, it is not that complicated to

design. But alternatively, I could go offer it to some private corporation abroad, and I don't want to. When I asked him why not, Chris replied "I mean, eventually I will have to but why would I? This product was designed here, by experts from here and we realize it here, using a local workshop. Why would I want to take it abroad, if I can help it? Why not have it be recognized here, and be part of the city's recovery?" (Interview with Chris, July 8 2014)

Although Chris enjoys a better access to resources and expertise compared to Adrienne, his case further shows the struggles in obtaining funding on the part of professionals and freelance entrepreneurship. Both Adrienne and Chris described how "waste" and "sustainability" were now common buzzwords in any public funding application; however, they both highlighted how in practice this was little more than lip-service fashion, as the opportunities for research and development with regards to sustainability – be it of luxury goods or of everyday household objects – was still very limited. Freelance entrepreneurship, particularly small scale, struggles to grow, in part due to lack of funding but also because of the massive centralization of waste management into municipal monopolies, which limits the extent to which these entrepreneurs can access and reuse recyclables as prime materials.

The cases discussed so far illustrate the efforts of activists implementing or building in sustainable practices within their workplaces. The following case provides insight into women's experience with the green economy as a productive ground for creative entrepreneurship, particularly in agriculture and small-scale farming for luxury products.

Joanne is involved with the Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan. She participates regularly in their meetings and in some of their demonstrations, but focuses most of her activism in experimenting and blogging about living a zero-waste life, which in her case, includes refusing to burn (let alone incinerate) leftover materials and refuse to consume or employ anything made of plastic,

"Even if it means embarrassing my teenage children by sending back a disposable bottle of water in a restaurant and demanding that they either use glass bottle or bring me a pitcher of tap water." She said with a smile. (Interview with Joanne, September 9 2014)

Rather than engaging with large demonstrations or with cleanup operations, Joanne believes in implementing ideals of sustainability in her professional life, an idea that culminated in her purchase of a farm in 2014, a farm where she

“Sustains and supports the growth of herbs and fruits that could grow there almost spontaneously, and diversifying myself from the neighbors. We make saffron, aromatic and therapeutic herbs and in the laboratory I also make soaps and hydrating lotions, using all local materials and using recyclables materials for the packaging. It is an exciting new project (...) but it is also difficult to overcome century-old habits of throwing things away, or worst, burning them. It took a while, for me, to have my assistants (agricultural workers) on board. For years, for example, people have been burning leaves and underbrush, when in fact as they decay, these materials leave a very fertile soil underneath them”.

Alongside the agricultural work, Joanne is also participating in an artistic initiative with one partner in Naples, not unlike Adrienne. The organization is predominantly artistic and much of the work they do has charitable purposes, although some of their activities provide a supplemental income.

“When a friend of mine proposed we start our own association and decoupage laboratory, I agreed, but conditional on us reusing materials. Our association’s goal is to educate different publics to reusing materials for arts and crafts, as well as for agriculture. We have taught classes and seminars in various schools, from Naples to Acerra, both on commission and as volunteers.”

The way that Joanne incorporates her drive for sustainable practices in her everyday life includes forms of advocacy, such as blogging and joining in meetings of an anti-waste group, but also employs environmentalist principles to provide uniqueness and visibility to her small farm.

Considerations of environmental sustainability are thus assisting her in establishing a business in the backdrop of an economic context that offers few work opportunities, even to a highly-educated and multilingual woman.

As mentioned before, an attention for the environment is not new to Joanne, who began attending the Campania Citizens for an Alternative Waste Plan meetings in 2008; as other informants

however, she remains quite wary of parties' involvement with waste in Campania as a way to exploit the region's waste issues for their membership drives.

“I do think that the MS5 are the only ones offering valid solutions to the problem of waste, but I am not too keen on them”

Many environmentally conscious informants support the MS5, in certain cases, in spite of their dislike for the party's populist undertones. The alliance between this party and Campania's anti-waste movements began in 2010, when the party started reaching out to Campania's anti-waste movements and endorsed their claims for a zero-waste economy and against any form of incineration or “thermal-valorization”. This strict opposition to incineration, which is unique to this party, attracts many environmentalists, who also acknowledged how their cause benefitted from the resources that the party offered them in terms of audience and spaces at rallies. At the same time, many, like Joanne, expressed concerns about their populism and their shift from a new, underdog party and social movement to electoral politics that the movement undertook after their surprising victory that landed them in parliament in 2011.

Work, family and the environment

So far I have highlighted some possibilities and opportunities available to women participating in anti-waste efforts in Campania, particularly in relation to their work lives but to an extent, also within civil society. Now, I discuss how anti-waste activism, be it in civil society or in the workplace, reflects upon family structure and relationships.

Caitlin self-identifies as single and does not have any kids; however, as she narrated her passion for environment and drive to community organizing, she made frequent references to her nuclear family and the support she receives from them, her parents in particular.

When I was growing up, every now and then my mother and our neighbors would drag waste disposal bins to the middle of an intersection, and she would push them there until the trash

pickers would come and clean up our neighborhood (...). As for my dad...well both my parents worry about me a bit, of course but he keeps a binder with all the articles about me in the media, even if it's just a small local newsletter, he will want to keep it.

Caitlin described her family as one of working-class background, but also a source of inspiration and support in her many environmentalist endeavors. However, women employed outside the home, mothers in particular, spoke of the relationship between family and environmentalism in very different terms.

Adrianne, a schoolteacher and freelance entrepreneur, offers some insight on the interference of patriarchal structures underlying professional and personal development opportunities. When I asked if her participation in environmentalist movements had affected her personal and family life, Adrianne hesitated a moment and answered:

“When I am not at work, I cannot be outside the home much, because of...certain serious problems in my family... somebody needs to be home all the time. So instead of going out with friends, I use the time for the environmental outreach. I let my husband know I have a meeting so he can arrange being home. When the Campania Citizens meet at the Naples Britannique (a mid-range hotel in 17th Century Villa), I attend the meeting but then when they go for a pizza afterward, I have to come back. So that is what I do, instead of things like going to the cinema or eating out with friends. I think I haven't been inside a theater in years. Still, being active, and doing this research has allowed me to cultivate my interests and seek stimuli – even the interests that I could not follow professionally. It has been like a liberation, I would have lost my mind at home all the time otherwise” (Interview with Adrianne, September 30 2014)

As the quote shows, although Adrianne has a very full work life, family concerns keep her home most of her free time; she engages with environmentalist movements and projects as an alternative to leisurely activities, to leave her family life relatively unchallenged. Home life considerations also pushed her towards working from home, to the extent that she can, on the projects she designs for her group's freelance activities.

In the case of Joanne, the proprietor of a small organic farm, her family had undergone substantive changes in the course of a few years, seeking to compromise among different people's needs

“I moved to the property but come to Naples for a few days each week, my sons live here. My husband is working abroad at the moment, so he can’t really mind that I am not home much; my kids occasionally complain a little (that I moved), but it doesn’t make any sense for them to move, they go study in Naples.” (Interview with Joanne, September 7 2014)

Although Joanne’s kids are both adults, a family arrangement where a mother commuting every week for work is extremely rare, even among upper-class and highly educated people with stable internet access and the possibility to travel frequently. However, Joanne explained this arrangement in close relation to her ideal of sustainability, clarifying that

“A sustainable lifestyle means to respect everything and everyone- nature and the environment, but also other people, including the needs, aspirations and happiness of those you love” (Interview with Joanne, September 7 2014)

Conclusions

What empowerment opportunities are emerging for Italian women mobilizing against waste in Campania? Is the woman-environment nexus turning out to be empowering or oppressive for them? In this chapter, I discuss concrete experiences and challenges of a neoliberal form of waste governance seeking to reshape a region’s economy towards the waste sector: because the latter effort is largely a top-down effort on the part of a national government seeking to reconfigure a region’s economy, this case presents several elements that are atypical of neoliberal governments. These include establishing a monopoly for garbage collection but also policies and regulations that, intentionally or not, undermine the sustainable efforts of volunteers and activists seeking to contain waste production and help keep neighborhoods clean.

The exclusion of grassroots’ actors from urban maintenance and cleanup relieve communities from the burdens of trash collection and neighborhood maintenance, a duty that the monopoly establishes safely in the hands of local governance. This move rehabilitates the image of a local administration with a history of waste mismanagement, while preventing grassroots organizations from claiming leadership and independent participation in sustainable urban practices,

a move that many groups sought to embrace, for political and economic reasons. In addition, by limiting the extent to which civil societies and private actors can engage with waste management, the municipal monopoly in 2014 limited the extent to which communities could actually resist the waste crisis affecting their neighborhoods and workplaces.

As a concrete experiences of neoliberal governance (Brenner and Theodore, 2002) municipal monopolies have a disempowering outcome on participation to sustainable practices, in this chapter I have highlighted several ways in which private citizens and groups find ways to engage with sustainability. As Reed (2000) suggests, environmentalist action (and inaction) are rooted into the existing political, economic and social concerns of a given place. The people whose experiences inform this chapter have different experiences and different reasons to engage with sustainable waste activist. Ideologically, all of them identify as environmentalists; economically, all of them were concerned with the possibility of unemployment or bankruptcy, due to the financial recession, to the waste crisis and to the both of them.

Environmentally friendly practices and activism in this chapter are deeply intertwined with multiple spheres of life, and with broader social concerns; the extent to which environmentalism – and particularly women’s environmentalism – is acting as an avenue for empowerment is controversial. Environmentalism is indeed a way in which one can counter economic concerns arising from the recession, from austerity politics, from the waste crisis and the intersection of these. While the work of greening a city or a workplace can help activists gain recognition in their particular circles or community, very seldom do these efforts come with economic gains or recognition for their cause from governing bodies. On a personal level, environmentalist efforts require that activists strategize to make room for them in their busy lives, an effort that seems to be much less burdensome for women in non-traditional families.

As the empirical material illustrates, it is common for the activists I studied to merge their environmentalist ideology with personal projects, at the level of civil society but even more so in the workplace. A strategic use of expertise and connections to anti-waste movements appears to be a preferred and promising avenue for women to ensure continuity of their jobs, if not a chance at upward mobility in the context of a gender-segregated market (particularly for older women) and of a staggering economy under pressure from austerity measures and the recent financial recession. Notions that women are better suited than men at caring for the environment, combined with the moral authority that recycling and sustainable consumptions have acquired are thus, in a way, supporting women's workplace initiatives and provide legitimacy to the visibility that activists acquire in such a manner. At the same time, these efforts take place in the absence of substantive investments in the green sector (2014), and rather rely on women's unpaid efforts. Because many women with a bachelor's degree in virtually any field can find work as teachers, particularly ones that graduated 20-30 years ago, teaching about sustainability is relatively easy to incorporate in everyday work practices. In addition, freelance entrepreneurship is becoming an increasingly common context for environmentalist activists to invest and experiment. While this strategy is indeed present in the narratives of female and male informants, in the case of women it tends to reflect smaller, self-funded projects complementing a different line of work rather than something that is built-in an existing career and with somewhat more secure sources of capital.

Although a plethora of opportunities thus seem to be emerging in the context of paid work, the data further shows how such opportunities affect informants' availability to carry out work or tasks related to other aspects of their existence, oftentimes requiring them to sacrifice other opportunities or to take on new burdens. Adrienne's case is emblematic, as her involvement with anti-waste movement takes the place of her personal and leisure time, due to family constraints. While her story is consistent with notions of a patriarchal society demanding that the bulk of

domestic labor and family concerns fall upon women, the experiences of other informants challenges the notion that such traditionalist family structures are ubiquitous and unchanging.

Less traditionalist family dynamics inform the workplace choices and political activists of some informants, particularly Caitlin and Joanne, participating in alternative family structures. Caitlin, who self-identifies as single and doesn't have children, enjoys ample support from her family of origin as she carries out clean-up initiatives but also marches and demonstrations, highlighting that not all effective working-class activism necessarily revolves around motherhood. Joanne's family renegotiated traditional family roles, allowing opportunities for economic growth, education and sustainability, at the costs of living apart at least for a few days a week. Their highly unusual and in many ways privileged position hardly makes a norm or an average; however, Joanne's discourse proposes egalitarianism in the family, across gender and age lines, as a core aspect of sustainable lifestyles, drawing attention to the threat that Schultz (2003) argues, a largely male-dominated consumerism has on families and the environment.

CHAPTER FIVE: OUTSOURCING ENVIRONMENTAL REPRODUCTION: RECYCLING AS A CHORE FOR MIGRANT CARE WORKERS

In the previous chapter, I illustrated how many Italian-born activists are implementing environmentalist practices in their places of work, pursuing at once their green agendas while seeking to cope with the job precariousness emerging from the 2008 recession and to pre-existing glass ceilings. Although the imposition of a strict monopoly of trash collection and the lack of public funding for green entrepreneurship are limiting the political and economic gains that many activists seek, taking on the work of making a workspace more environmentally friendly are helping many activists, women in particular, maintain job stability in spite of potential layoffs and cutbacks. While informants gain personal satisfaction and possibly, a degree of visibility in the workplace, these efforts reveal activists' agency as much new forms of exploitation. Activists' ability to negotiate a precarious labor market contrasts sharply from the amount of unpaid work they need to do to obtain this stability – unpaid work that subtracts time and energy from personal interests and leisure time, particularly in the case of women. In this chapter, I expand on the debate of recycling and the workplace by examining the experiences of migrant domestic workers in Campania. Specifically, I seek to address the extent to which Italian families outsource, rather than perform the most burdensome and tedious aspects of recycling and draw attention to how migrant women experience such chores. What challenges do they face in carrying out household recycling? What are the working conditions underlying such practices? What, if any, unexpected opportunities do they seek by entertaining their own and their employers' wishes to recycle- or not to recycle?

By highlighting the role of underpaid, or outright unpaid labor in performing environmentally-friendly duties, I expand upon the discussion I introduced in Chapter 4 concerning the role of global dispossession in the green sector. This chapter seeks to establish stronger

connections between transnational migration literature, particularly (though not exclusively) the global care chain, with environmental sociology's concerns for migrant workers' over-exposure to toxicity as well as for the feminization of environmental concerns. Because they pertain to both the realms of domestic and professional life, migrant domestic workers' experiences with recycling provides a more nuanced and race-based analysis of feminist work on women's unpaid efforts in recycling and sustainable consumerism. If recycling, as other household chores, becomes an additional instance of "dirty" or "demeaning" reproductive work that Italian families outsource to a disenfranchised workforce, in this case the global outsourcing of social reproduction is expanding to include environmental sustainability, or perhaps, reproduction. Likewise, instances of migrant workers becoming the dispossessed labor force tasked with the manual labor of sustainable practices, at the domestic and at the professional level, ecological modernization theory fails to account for global dispossession of neoliberal labor markets, at a macro scale but also in the domestic sphere.

Many of the arrangements and conditions underlying the recycling efforts I discuss in this chapter highlight exploitative conditions that members of the host society impose upon low-income, foreign-born women. At the same time, the emerging narratives are certainly not mere stories of exploitation and victimization: relying on waste as both a relational material and an ethnographic artefact, in this chapter I also draw attention to how migrant women, particularly live-in domestic workers, strategize and relate to public spaces. These include the areas where they formally reside (and spend their days off) as well as in their employers' neighborhoods. Through a series of ethnographic interviews, I highlight how migrant women manage to contain the risks of street crimes and harassment with the urgency to build a secondary social network in these communities:

although both issues seem to be part of these workers' routines, they have received surprisingly little attention in current immigration scholarship.

In the following sections, I begin by outlining the theoretical debate I seek to connect in this chapter before providing more detail on some of the challenges I experienced while carrying out this segment of the field research. Following, I provide detailed accounts of how migrant domestic workers experience, engage or disengage from recycling tasks in different neighborhoods, but also depending on formal and informal labor arrangements. I then move provide a broad overview of some of the aspects of migrant women's experiences that emerged during the interviews in addition to the issues related specifically to waste and recycling.

Bridging the gap between private and public environment: migrant domestic workers and recycling practices.

As shown in previous chapter, managing household wastes in respect of the law and of environmentalist regulations is a contentious issue in Campania. While most segments of civil society agree on these principles, tensions rise between governing bodies, trash collection companies and community members as to which actors should be required or at least allowed to participate to such activities. Amidst these debates, all of which assume and emphasize the importance of increasing domestic recycling rates is a key element Campania's environmentalist agenda, both in terms of quality of life and in terms of meeting European Union standards. While existing regulations and policies emphasize the private ownership of waste materials once they leave the household, less attention has been given to how families go about the domestic waste cycle: according to Evans (2004), this includes decision-making activities, such as what to use, reuse, gift, sell or dispose of, but also preparing and sorting materials for disposal. Overlooking this micro-level

administration of waste on the part of policy makers and civil societies has been a common concern for feminist scholarship since at least the 1990s. Authors like Josepa Bru Bistuer (1996), Irmgard Schultz (1992) and more recently, Bette Littig (2004) argued that recycling schemes implicitly rely on women's unpaid labor, a term by which these authors assume to work of homemakers or mothers. While their considerations remain relevant, particularly in the context of working-class households that generally do not employ paid domestic workers, in this chapter I turn to a broad concern for globalization scholarly. These include the outsourcing of undesirable work, including social reproduction, to disenfranchised segments of society, particularly low-income migrant workers: in this case, this means focusing on the role of domestic workers in carrying out domestic recycling as part of the household chores they are paid, or merely expected to carry out.

The global outsourcing of social reproduction is a growing and multi-scalar phenomenon that relies on but also generates connections between near and distant places, such as migration chains and labor markets crossing national boundaries. Some international development organizations maintain an optimistic outlook on this process as one generating wealth and development options for low-income communities, through migrant workers' labor remittances (De Haas, 2010). Others, myself included, have drawn attention to the global dispossessions underlying such networks, including the disappearance of labor rights and welfare systems under structural adjustment programs, but also gender and racial inequalities enabling the exploitation of foreign-born workers (Muniandy and Bonatti, 2015; Miraftab, 2016). Here, I highlight how this broad phenomenon is emerging and what its implications are in the context of Campania and Naples.

Southern Italy is a relatively recent destination for low-wage labor migration. While its central geographic location and widespread informal sector have made it an appealing point of entry, particularly for undocumented migrants and asylum seekers, the area's relative poverty compared to

Northern Italy and Central Europe (D'Alisa et al. 2012) has made it a common transit destination, rather than a place of long-term settlement (Strozza, 2013). The arrival of a more stable immigrant population coincides roughly with the area's shift from a short-lived industrialization period to the service industry. This economic shift, together with widespread transnational Catholic networks have rendered Campania a growing destination for women's labor migration: as of 2013, women from a variety of countries made slightly more than 50% of the region's population of migrant workers (Marra and Miranda, 2013). In addition to having a relatively high percentage of women, the labor market for low-wage migrant workers is also highly segregated along gender lines, with women working service jobs -predominantly domestic labor- in urban areas and men finding seasonal employment in rural areas, in agriculture and construction (Ambrosini, 2013).

In terms of immigration policies, Italy maintains very restrictive a restrictive immigration policy, particularly for non-EU migrants, and *ius sanguinis* notion of citizenship (Schuster, 2005). While the nation lacks an official guest worker program, the availability of work visas and legal immigration statuses are contingent upon employment, meaning that in most cases immigration papers are renewed on a yearly basis. While legal entry to the country is restricted to EU nationals and to those who already have a labor contract, the Italian government has historically offered a possibility for employers to regularize undocumented workers roughly every two years. Existing scholarship suggests that by doing so, policy makers tend to define and advertise these amnesties specifically in relation to migrant domestic workers (King and Zontini, 2000). This practice of designing a restrictive immigration policy only to make frequent exceptions underline what I call a "*politics of regular exceptionality*" allowing Italian employers to regularize select employees while enjoying the market benefits of a large disenfranchised pool of potential workers. Politically, this

practice allows governing bodies to appeal to the anti-immigrant sentiment of many conservative voters while reaping similar market benefits to one of a temporary migration regime.

As work contract tend to be short-term, De Maria Harney has recently drawn attention to how the binary documented/undocumented migrants, as well as notions of upward mobility for longer-terms migrants are flawed, or at least do not apply in the case of Italy. Interviewing predominantly male migrant workers in the Naples area, De Maria Harney (2007) and Maurizio Ambrosini (2013) have drawn attention to how migrant workers experience periods in which they lack legal status. These concerns, which many of my interviewees also faced, contradicts the findings (and assumptions) of migration scholarship and politics showing how time is in a way on the side of undocumented migrants residing stably in the same country for many years in a row. De Maria Harney's study shows how over time, many labor migrants are offered increasingly precarious and shorter-term labor contracts (De Maria Harney, 2007).

Global care chain literature has consistently criticized immigrant-receiving societies for lacking a serious reconsideration of traditional gender roles in the family (Parrenas, 2000; Romero, 2010). Existing studies highlight how more and more women enter the paid labor force, without a redistribution of care labor in the family; simultaneously, neoliberal reforms are consistently reducing the care-related services that nation-states used to offer in terms of social security, family leaves and welfare benefits (Ehrenreich and Hochschild, 2003).

In the specific context of Italy, these neoliberal shifts imply two central concerns. On the one hand, the financial crisis of 2008 and following austerity measures are pushing many families to reduce their spending on domestic work. At the same time, the country's rapidly ageing population and homecare-based welfare systems are contributing to a growing demand for affordable personal

assistants and caregivers to semi-independent seniors (Lutz, 2006; Schuster, 2005). By homecare-based welfare system, I refer to the availability of care subsidies of roughly 500 Euros a month for semi-independent seniors to invest in paid help or to help family members assisting them make up for lost wages. These subsidies, but also the lack of facilities for assisted living are providing the bulk of employment opportunities for migrant women - particularly older, Catholic women (Anderson, 2000).

As I return to in the discussion section, while these personal assistance jobs can trigger a visa, there remains a high degree of informality in terms of the work arrangements between employees and employers, by which the work of personal assistants and home cleaners merge under one contract and one stipend. The precarious living and working conditions emerging from Italy's politics of regular exceptionality further hinder women's upward mobility in that the necessity to secure a visa restricts employment opportunities to full-time domestic work. While the presence of low-wage women available to live in the home of semi-independent seniors allows the host society to maintain the notion of a traditional, family-centered culture by which ageing relatives live in their homes, while adapting to present-day labor markets and cultural practices. In addition to reproducing these cultural practices, I highlight how the migrant workers' labor is also enabling new cultural practices, including recycling.

Methodological note

In this chapter, I draw from 30 semi-structured interviews with migrant domestic workers but also with various Italian informants such as homemakers, families employing migrant women and environmentalist activists interested in discussing issues of migration in the course of our interviews.

The migrant women cited in this chapter are from a variety of countries, including Georgia, Romania, Kyrgyzstan, Tunisia, Cape Verde and Nigeria; because some of these immigrant communities in Naples are very small, in text I refer to the broader geopolitical area that they were born, to guarantee anonymity. Most of the migrant women are the first person in their family to migrate to Europe; all but one are married with children and three are grandmothers. All migrant-born informants lived in Naples for at least one year and were fluent in Italian and/or English. I began recruiting informants with the aid two NGOs working on issues of immigration; I recruited additional informants through snowball sampling. When interviewing migrant women, my positionality may have hindered informants from discussing exploitative working conditions, or circumstances preventing them from recycling. Methodologically, I tried to account for this by working on interview notes as collaboratively as possible with informants, within their wishes and/or scheduling constraints. I shared the interview guidelines well ahead of the interviews, and made time for informants to ask questions about the research, or even personal ones if they wished. Because I work abroad, a few informants assumed I was at least somewhat immigrant-friendly. Finally, in most cases there was a considerable age gap between informants' employers and myself, a detail that may have allowed migrant women to speak a little more freely. While these efforts and relationships do not obliterate my identity as a Neapolitan woman, many informants were rather adamant in describing the various circumstances getting in the way of their recycling habits, as well as their employers' perspectives on the matter.

Interviews began with questions about migrant women's job descriptions and, for Italian informants, their working arrangements in the informants' home. Subsequent questions addressed division of domestic labor within households, particularly recycling and other green practices such as green consumerism in the context of current and previous jobs. These questions were greatly helpful

in guiding informants to reconstruct their experiences of recycling in Naples' sensitive context in connection to domestic labor arrangements.

Discussing matters of waste with foreign-born workers is informative various aspects of their lives. These include working conditions and professional obligations, the level of public services provided in their relatively low-income neighborhoods but also broader considerations of their experiences of public spaces, as taking out the garbage or recyclables represents an opportunity for migrant domestic workers to step outside of their employers' home. While not directly related to Campania's waste crisis, migrant women's experiences with public sphere in Naples draws attention to two issues in particular. First, their efforts to establish secondary support networks, particularly in their employers' neighborhoods, by engaging in casual but regular conversations with other domestic workers, neighbors, and local businesspersons. Second, their concerns for problems of street harassment and violence in various parts of the city, and issue that emerged regularly though somewhat indirectly in the course of the interviews. The latter issue emerged somewhat tangentially in the course of the interviews: the image of themselves and their lives that many provided tended to highlight their professionalism and their expertise, of their jobs and of the city of Naples, moving away from stereotypical notions of migrant women as helpless victims. In addition, many of these informants expressed an interest in the research project in general and in my fieldwork. A few provided helpful advice and insight on how to get around, economically and safely, in several low-income neighborhoods I had not been to for several years, advice which included, in some cases, warning me about neighborhoods where problems like pick-pocketing, robbery and stalking were more likely to happen. In other words, while informants rarely shared these experiences while answering interview questions related to the challenges they faced in carrying out recycling tasks,

they mentioned these problems as experts of the city and while giving me feedback on the research project.

Italian-born informants, homemakers in particular, were generally rather comfortable in discussing social reproduction in their homes and in the ones of their relatives, typically an ageing parent or in-laws. Women juggling domestic labor and paid employment outside the home in particular seemed to assume I would be aware of their struggles reconciling professional and family obligations. Some of them expressed a degree of frustration towards their immediate families for not contributing to home care or assisting elderly and children; on occasion, these frustrations extended to a paid domestic worker, generally a migrant woman. In spite of this openness, many Italian-born informants seemed somewhat concerned with appearing racist and hurried to describe the various things they do or have done in past to help out a migrant worker through small gesture like a small cash loan, sending gifts to their children in the sending countries or purchasing them a ticket home in case of a family emergency. More often than not, these stories anticipated an informal working arrangement between migrant workers and employers, including reductions of paid time off and of monthly stipend, in addition to the resentment described above.

At the time of the field research, trash collection services and recycling infrastructure in Naples varied across neighborhoods. Most urban neighborhoods provided a rather simple scheme based on some sort of doorstep collection for clean paper and landfill waste, plus a few neighborhood collections stations for glass, cans and plastics. Nearly all informants complained that such recycling stations could be difficult to find, as the municipal trash collection company removed or relocated them without notice. Other areas however enjoyed a more thorough doorstep collection of compost and recyclables, between once and twice per week (Azienda Servizi Igiene Ambientale, 2014).

Narratives

“Which” migrant workers recycle? Ethnicity versus experience

Anna is in her mid-forties. She is originally from a small town in rural Eastern Europe and had been living in Naples for about six years. At the time of our meeting, she had worked for four different families in the province of Naples. All of these jobs involved a degree of housework and live-in care: currently, a child, but previously she had worked with ageing and chronically ill people. When we spoke about her experiences with recycling, she explained that:

“The woman I work for now, three years ago she started recycling when I was already working for them. She showed me and now I do it all the time. It is easy, white (bin) for paper, green for glass, yellow for the plastic bottles and the big grey bin for everything else. You just have to separate things as you are discarding them” (Interview with Anna, July 22 2014)

In the excerpt above, Anna highlights how the color-coding of different types of trash and recycling bins made it easy for her to learn the recycling schemes in a neighborhood she had lived in for a time, even before she felt fluent in written Italian. The ease that Anna displays in discussing and carrying out domestic recycling contrast sharply with a rather common assumption, among members of the host society, that migrant domestic workers are either unaware or reluctant to engage with household recycling. In fact, several Italian informants and acquaintances were surprised to hear I was including this population in my study. Moreover, with the exception of a few articles in the Catholic newspaper *L’Avvenire*, the national press does not relate concerns for migration with ones of environmental justice in Campania. While both immigration and Campania’s waste crisis are highly discussed topics, the intersection of these two rarely gets much attention, with the exception of the occasional complaint directed against Romani people for pulling metal out of recycling bins, as shown in the previous chapter. In the local media, the only connection between migration and

waste appears in the Catholic newspaper *L'Avvenire*, which in 2013 published a few articles denouncing an “Illegal recycling system” in the town of Giugliano (Campania).

Early in the morning, (...) four (North African male) migrants have already separated metals, a mirror, some chairs, bicycles and tricycles for children. Locals drive by to drop off their garbage bags in exchange for a small tip. Later in the day, a truck driven by a group of Romani men stops by. They bargain with the immigrants, then pay them a few euros and load the sorted materials, metals in particular, to sell them. By the end of the day, a Senesi (Giugliano's official trash collection company) truck will drive by and with the help of these immigrants, will load the garbage and drive it to the RDF plant (Mira, 2013)

As shown in the excerpt above, these articles denounce illegal garbage administration in Giugliano for enabling illegal behaviors, but also local citizens and Romani groups for profiting from the disenfranchisement of North African migrants and asylum seekers. Mira (2013) avoids placing any blame for waste trafficking on the migrants, whom she presents as victims of poverty and global dispossession. However, the author accuses trash collection companies and local citizens, but also Romani groups for their involvement with illegal waste management.

The excerpt above summarizes the scarce existing material connecting somewhat problems of waste trafficking with issues of migration and race inequalities: as the article show, these notions involve the experiences of North African men. Among members of the host society, the idea of migrant domestic workers as largely unaware or uninterested of environmental topics and green practices is widespread. The excerpt below speaks to these concerns, as illustrated in the words of Janine, a wealthy Neapolitan-born professional living in a wealthy gated community.

“I don't know, do they...do they even know? Not for anything, would they even care, coming from all the problems that they do sometimes? I don't want to sound...but it can be hard to get them to do it. My sister and I, we share a Filippina worker...a lovely lady, but she just puts everything together. My sister tells her all the time to keep things separate, but then every time she looks, she keeps throwing everything out in the same bag (...) But she is a good worker for the rest, we trust her. It's just hard to explain this to her” (Interview with Janine, September 21 2014)

The notion of cultural and language barriers, as well as extensive experiences of war, famine and other human-made disaster would make environmental concerns hardly relevant for low-income migrant women emerged during various interviews with Italian-born informants. These assumptions led five different participants to ask explicitly whether women born in Eastern European countries would be more capable of sorting household trash. A retired physician with a politically liberal and green agenda for example wanted to know,

“So is it mostly Ukrainians and women from Eastern Europe who recycle well? I imagine they have something similar in their countries, maybe, not as messy as we do though. Here in Naples, we are...unique! (Rolls her eyes and laughs a bit). But at least an idea, right?”
(Interview with Christina, July 30 2014)

It is interesting to note that Christina does not view Naples as a modern and functioning city; however, she is fast to imagine that the culture of recycling could be common in other EU countries. As following excerpt shows, the biggest obstacles that migrant women face in dealing with recyclables are working hours and, because they do not have access to a car, lack of recycling stations at a reasonable distance from their homes and workplaces. However, some employers believe that a worker's national origins are more relevant in determining their ease with recycling than other factors, such as the number of years they lived in Italy, or their educational background.

Elaine, a woman in her sixties from Central America who had been working in Naples for over twenty years highlighted how different neighborhood conditions, and scheduling constraints, could make even the most committed recycler sway into throwing everything together

“I live near the Cathedral. It is a beautiful neighborhood, and affordable, but one of the last they clean up after the trash emergencies. So it gets really humiliating, not just for us (foreign-born workers), for everybody. We try our best to recycle, but the recycling station is far. If I walk all the

way up the hill and it's not there, then I'll just leave all in the grey bin¹⁸, and maybe the collection company will sort it all later. I don't like doing this, but this is the government's fault (that the service is so poor)" (Interview with Elaine, July 23 2014)

Having lived there for so many years, Elaine considers Naples to be a second home: her investment to the city underlies her efforts to recycle and her criticism of the local administration. Her words further show that while setting out to deliver recyclables, and as she sorts materials, people in her neighborhood don't know that she will find an available recycling station, but this does not prevent her from trying, if anything in the hopes that a trash collection company will finish sorting.

Recycling and the claustrophobia of live-in work

So far, I have referred to domestic labor in very general terms. In this section, however, I highlight how specific jobs that migrant women take shape how they go about recycling. As the narratives show, the experiences of live-in workers, can be quite different from the ones of full-time, live-out workers.

Amelia, 65, is originally from a small town in Central Asia. She had been working in Naples for about five years, taking almost exclusively live-in work with ageing women. In the course of our interview, she highlighted how recycling fits into her broader work contexts, but also some advantages and challenges that these tasks pose.

"It is difficult, my job, (...) but we (my employer and I) are close, really. We live together, spend lots of time together, always close. I try hard to keep everything clean, and in the evening take the trash out. I take as many bags as there are, and drop them off, a few blocks away (...) As my employers want, as the house needs. On the way back, I stop sometimes, for a phone call or to say a quick hello to a friend". (Interview with Amelia, July 10 2014)

¹⁸ Grey bins are used to collect landfill materials. Because in certain neighborhoods, households are required to place recyclables in light colored (grey or purple) bags and landfill waste in thicker, darker ones, Elaine hoped that trash collectors would make sure the recyclables did not end up in the landfill

Working in a high-end area in downtown Naples, Amelia, found herself walking quite a bit to a recycling station. The distance between place of work and recycling station bought Amelia some time away from the house, although she is still performing domestic work. The excerpt above shows how Amelia employed familiar and affectionate terms to describe her employers, while repeatedly using the term “difficult” in reference to her line of work. Spending much time indoors with an ageing individual is indeed a recurring issue for migrant domestic workers: Anna, the Eastern European informant cited previously, had purposefully switched to a childcare position because:

“After so many years taking care of elderly and dying people, I started to fall ill myself. I even had to take up my own free time and some of my money to pay for check-ups, but they found nothing wrong with me, physically. One cannot always do that kind of work”
(Interview with Anna, July 9 2014)

While the work of elderly care can be emotionally draining, the precarious conditions that Italian immigration policy imposes on work visas are such that many workers agree to forgo parts of their stipends and benefits in exchange for the support of their employers. Angela, an Italian informant in her mid-fifties, explained how she had worked with the employees at a public Center for Fiscal Assistance (*Centro Assistenza Fiscale*) so that she and her live-in worker sign a part-time contract for housekeeping only:

“They showed me how to declare her a 25 hour per week cleaner, so that her social security contributions I have to pay stay at the minimum. I can give her a bit of cash for the difference (...) I know it is a bit irregular, but the actual stipend, between pay and contributions, would be over one thousand euros per month, and we cannot afford that. My mother cannot live by herself, but she is not even eligible for public subsidy. It is not ideal, I know, but this way I pay what I can, and Katia gets her visa renewed, which is more important for her” (Interview with Angela, August 1 2014)

Particularly in the case of non-EU citizens, work visas and residence permits are contingent on employment, a situation that pushes many low-wage migrants to accept disadvantageous, informal working arrangements. The excerpt above also shows that the institutionalization of home-care in

Italian welfare system places a certain economic hardship on families: as a result, some hire undocumented workers, while others propose informal arrangements like the one above. However, these part-time contracts do not guarantee neither the pay nor a mandatory rest time for migrant workers. It is in these contexts that live-in workers experience stress and claustrophobia, but also try to use the long walk to the recycling station to make some personal time and stretch their legs, although they are still working. Although far from ideal, time spend outdoors, regardless of the purpose, further represents an important opportunity to engage with other neighborhood actors, such as neighbors, local businesspersons and other domestic workers.

I always try to introduce myself to people in the community, when I get the chance. It is good to keep an eye out for burglars, but also to know the neighbors, in case there is an emergency or...just in case, you never know. (Interview with Nadia, July 15 2014)

Nadia's propensity to monitor the neighborhood is very common among the migrant domestic workers I interviewed. As Nadia explained, during the month of August in particular the homes of single, retired individuals become vulnerable to potential robberies and burglaries: being mindful of people transiting through the neighborhood or, in Nadia's case, a gated community is an obvious safety precaution. In addition to these concerns, Nadia draws attention to needing to know neighbors and fellow workers in case of an emergency happening to their employers or to them. Many migrant workers rely extensively on the support of fellow migrants, with whom they spend time their time off and exchange information and basic resources, including employment opportunities, coupons and phone bills, but also money in case of personal and family emergencies. During the working week however these contacts may be working in relatively distant neighborhoods; while employers' and their extended families can, and in many cases do provide an additional safety net, it is obvious that these connections would not be helpful in case of a fallout or aggression on the part of the employer. Getting to know the neighbors and the neighborhood one

works in is thus an additional important task that migrant domestic workers seek to achieve while performing chores outside the home, such as taking the recyclables or grocery shopping. While these networks only develop over the course of various weeks, they can nonetheless be quite effective at guaranteeing emergency resources. When I first met Fiona, another informant from Central Asia, she was making do during a spell of unemployment with a part-time job cleaning and keeping a store for two businesspersons in her neighborhood. Although she did not seem very fond of her new employers, she admitted that them reaching out to her was helping her make ends meet as she searched for a new full-time contract.

Several Italian informants understood that their live-in migrant employees welcomed opportunities to perform outdoors house chores, such as taking care of groceries and of recycling. While many tried to accommodate them, acknowledging the difficulties of a live-in caregiving job, others were too concerned about their relatives' safety to allow it. As an Italian informant explained, her family had hired a live-in migrant worker:

“Specifically to sit at home with my grandmother. As long as she is home with her, she can do whatever she wants, we really require minimal house chores of her. So she can read, watch TV, use the internet...I don't care. But I do the groceries and the garbage, because I need her to be at home. She has two afternoons off and I never call her, I never disturb her when she is free (unlike a previous employer had done). But when she is at work, she has to be in the house ...it's hard, but it's what she is paid to do...and it is good money” (Interview with Marianne, August 1 2014)

Marianne's words portrait a common picture of a semi-immobilized, ageing persons requiring full-time assistance while living from home. While this solution gives families peace of mind of their ageing relatives living in a context that is comfortable and familiar to them, and easy to access for visit, the anxiety that something might go wrong or that they require help are pushing some employers- particularly women- to want someone supervising their relatives almost at all times.

These concerns, coupled with the need or desire to minimize costs, can result in extremely harsh, exploitative working conditions for care workers, without employers even noticing.

Street harassment and “dirty garbage”

Particularly in Naples, taking out garbage and recycling is chore laden with memories and concerns of urban disarray. While this chore allows live-in workers to step outside for a few minutes, it can also expose them to harassment or rebuking, particularly on the part of host society actors; however, it is only in few cases that informants believed this happens specifically because they are handling garbage. The excerpt below provides an example of this:

“Sometimes, if I go in the afternoon a storeowner will complain that I cannot bring down the paper, but they are wrong. I told my employers and they supported me. But now I go in the evening most of the times, after they close the shop.” (Interview with Amelia, July 10 2014)

Amelia was working in a relatively wealthy downtown neighborhood, with the main avenues lined with mid-range boutiques and several historical buildings; in the afternoons and evening, many day-tourists and casual shoppers crowd the area, looking to make a small purchase or simply taking a walk. Although in 2008 and 2006 residents reported occasional arson of uncollected garbage, it did not suffer from the trash emergency as much as other districts did.

While Amelia knew that she could legally dispose of certain recyclables, such as clean paper and plastic, at any time of the day, the proximity between the white bin and a store sometimes ended up with the owners’ complaining or rebuking her, perhaps hoping to dissuade her from taking out recyclables during opening hours. Because of Naples’ history of irregular trash collection, many business owners worried that uncollected materials would accumulate outside their establishments and drive away potential clients. Amelia had told her employers about the accident, and had their

support; however, she still preferred to take care of the household trash in the evening, after closing time, and avoid a public quarrel or rebuking.

Business owners' reluctance to recycling stations in uptown Naples became evident in November 2014, when a coalition of high-end stores and business owners petitioned for the removal of a newly-installed recycling station from the monumental Piazza dei Martiri Square, a downtown commercial and office district housing some of the most high-end clothing stores as well as a large international bookstore. Storeowners expressed concerns that Naples' unreliable collection and possibilities of littering would "disrupt the square's elegance" (Corriere del Mezzogiorno, 2014). This article, but also Amelia's experience suggests that domestic workers may find themselves in caught between two opposing movements in the neighborhood, one trying to enhance recycling infrastructure and one seeking to keep anything remotely "dirty" or "unbecoming" away from a wealthy area. In spite of this neighborhood positive reputation within locals, it is thus not surprising that even long-time, European-born migrants such as Anna admitted to shopping sales in the area, on occasion, "but always going with a friend".

Problems of street harassment, pickpocketing and theft are recurring concerns for many migrant women; while being somewhat hesitant to discuss these issues many participants acknowledged experiencing verbal aggressions and street harassment regularly, in addition to having suffered from pickpocketing and robberies, particularly in the first few weeks after arriving. Most informants did not attribute the harassment specifically to their handling of waste as much as to xenophobia and misogyny.

"There are good and bad people everywhere...In Naples and in Santo Domingo. Bad people will call things at you, whether it is because you have dark skin, you are a woman or because you are carrying a garbage bag. But I don't acknowledge them, and move on"
(Interview with Anne, 23 July 2014)

From this perspective, experiencing street violence and harassment while carrying out recycling duties is more of a consequence of a hostile public sphere rather than the particular practice of recycling. The presence of foreign-born women and women of color in public places in Naples is quite rare, in not only the neighborhoods they work, but also in the areas where groups of them rent flats to spend time off and possible spells of unemployment.

“Get the bus or take out the recyclables?” Concerns of live-out workers

Tense situations concerning garbage and recyclables, but also working conditions for migrant domestic workers are not unique to downtown neighborhoods. Rather, issues of inappropriate infrastructure and carelessness on the part of host society actors were a recurring topic of conversation, particularly with foreign-born women.

Fatima, 42, born in North Africa, works as a domestic assistant and housekeeper for a couple living in a wealthy residential area along the Naples Bay. She works between 8:00 am and 5:00 pm for five days per week, with Friday mornings and Sundays off; her employers are a bed-ridden elderly woman suffering from a major paralysis and her husband. She earns about 500 Euros per month, roughly the pay of a part-time housecleaner rather than the one of a personal assistant. Fatima however is in charge of keeping the house for her employers as well as assisting the bed-ridden woman. In the remaining time, she has a small home with her daughter, a recently naturalized Italian citizen, in an older, working class and low-income neighborhood.

Having lived in Naples for over 20 years, Fatima speaks Italian fluently and is familiar with city's politics and waste problems unfolding in various neighborhoods. For example, she reminded me that trash collection in Naples has been irregular and unstable for many years, and that what we witnessed recently was a media hype due to the problem moving in wealthier areas. Furthermore,

while she is pleased with cleaning services in her neighborhood, where in spite of a certain poverty, recycling and garbage collection are reliable- much more than in the fancy gated community where her employers live. Although the latter is one of the wealthiest and fanciest residential areas of the city, people are constantly littering and in her words, “just never pick up after themselves, indoors and outdoors alike.”

With regards to trash collection, Fatima is not pleased with the services and most important, with her employers’ expectations. When I asked her about how she manages household waste for her current employers, she looked down and paused for a moment before saying:

‘Families usually want us - migrant workers I mean (...) - to take the garbage out when we leave. Usually, the white bin for the paper and the grey bin for the landfill are rather easy to find. (The recycling container for) Plastic, so and so and the one for glass is difficult. Sometimes they are there, sometimes not, the plastic bells. To be very straightforward with you dear, most of us have to take the bus and then a train to go home from work, and the bells¹⁹ are pretty far, in the opposite direction. It is exploitative (*sfruttamento*) of the families- we are done with our hours, yet they still expect us to walk in the opposite direction and then go back to wait for the bus. This can take up an additional two hours, unpaid, since the time we finish working and we get home. So we...we say we take it, but we just leave it in the grey bin, all together with the humid. It is exploitative of the families, but it’s the administration’s fault too, if the bins are so hard to find”. (Interview with Fatima, July 10 2014)

Unlike Amelia, Fatima believes that trying to talk to her employers about this would be a lost cause.

“Oh no way dear. They would say, ‘Then what are *you* doing here?’ It’s a house chore, so it is our job you know? Even though it would not be a problem for him (the husband) to do it on his way to work. He drives a cab”

Fatima’s contributions highlight the impingement of working conditions – generally exploitative ones- on their ability to carry out such tasks. Although her comments reveal that in

¹⁹ Neighborhood recycling containers for materials such as glass, cans and plastic are tall and bell-shaped, with only one opening at the top that is large enough for a bottle of soda to pass but deliberately much smaller than a garbage bag. Because of this somewhat odd shape, trash collection companies sometimes refer to the as “bells”

many ways, she finds her employment relationships unfair, Fatima is comfortable making small arrangements and adjustments within her routine, without being harassed or feeling threatened in the neighborhood. At the same time, while her bed-ridden employer provides little supervision to her household management, Fatima still cares to sort household materials and hope the garbage collection company will sort for her, similarly, to what Elaine had mentioned about a lower-income neighborhood.

The meaning of recycling in migrant domestic workers' routines

The narratives above show different ways in which migrant women engage with recycling as part of their own household practices and in the context of their jobs. Interviews with both Italian and foreign-born informants illustrate how these different actors make sense and experience recycling as one of many household chores but also as part of their broader living and working regimes.

Many low-income migrant domestic workers in Naples actively engage with recycling practices; while regulations have varied frequently and are not homogenous across the metropolitan area, migrant domestic workers do not generally find them challenging. While this study shows that migrant women's recycling behavior is tied to working conditions, access to recycling stations and familiarity with Naples, some members of the host society assume that national origins- particularly, European ancestry- are an important factor in recycling behavior. These assumptions underlie a concerning tendency to racialize Naples' migrant population and marginalize workers from the Global South. Earlier in this chapter, I have highlighted how members of the host society conceded that workers from other EU countries might be capable of recycling, while people from South Asia or North Africa – i.e. people of color – appear as "poor", "desperate" "outsiders" who cannot quite grasp the rationale and habit of sorting household materials. Issues of racism also emerged from

experiences of street harassment. While the latter two are long-standing problems in migrant women's lives, engaging with the "dirty" work of taking out the trash risks drawing attention to migrant women's presence in a public context. In Amelia's case, these encounters compromised her sense of safety in the neighborhood she was working, regardless of her employers' support.

Interviews with migrant women have shown that while there is no one unique reason to engage (or not engage) with recycling practices, the challenges of different working conditions can play a decisive role. In this sense, the claustrophobia that many informants associate with live-in care work can push some to recycle very carefully and effectively, as this chore represents one of their few opportunities to step outside their employers' homes. On the one hand, this shows an ability to organize a routine strategically, thus challenging notions of migrant domestic workers as uniquely helpless victims. However, these forms of micro-agency further reveal how informal arrangements between employers and employees ultimately benefit host society actors. Because many migrants' work visa depends on their formal employment status, employers hold sufficient power over working conditions to turn taking out the garbage, traditionally a form of "dirty" work, into a rare opportunity for something that resembles, but ultimately is not, a break. As a result, not only can Italian families and lawmakers expect an affordable workforce to outsource elderly care but also, unexpectedly, to engage, by proxy, in scrupulous recycling practices.

Comparing the experiences of live-in and live-out workers further shows a tendency among employers to impinge upon their workers' time off. Fatima's case can exemplify how the lack of respect for work hours, coupled with lack of appropriate infrastructure, ultimately goes against both the worker's and the employer's wish to recycle. Fatima's, and to an extent Elaine's experiences further show how far workers are willing to go to carry out their environmentalist agendas within the limits of working conditions and infrastructure. Both cases exemplify how workers will engage in

an accessible practice, such as separating household materials, but would not take on unreasonable labor or efforts when the municipal administration and/or their employers are not doing their part. Their experiences of infrastructural provisions in different neighborhoods further highlight that there is no clear link between the wealth of a particular district and the availability of recycling services, with certain wealthier neighborhoods lacking infrastructure just as much as poor ones, while some working-class communities enjoyed a more effective and reliable service. In the absence of any official data from A.S.I.A on recycling rates in Naples²⁰, it might be difficult to grasp this unusual pattern. The fact that recycling services in particular are not only offered, but also more consistently enforced in lower-income districts however may indicate that trash collection companies are prioritizing densely populated areas over wealthier and less populous districts. This argument however falls short because of the excellent recycling performance of several small and medium-sized towns in Campania: this observation suggests that at an institutional level, waste governance in Campania may be placing the “dirty” work of recycling and sorting through their trash upon lower-income segments of the population.

Many Italian-born respondents did not seem to mind helping sharing recycling chores with a migrant worker, especially if a particular neighborhood did not have an easily accessible recycling station. However, this narrative was not homogenous in my fieldwork. In Fatima’s case, her able-bodied employer outright refused to have anything to do with housekeeping, an arrangement that previous literatures document abundantly but that I encountered only sporadically. More interesting in this sense is Marianne’s concern for her grandmother’s safety, to the point that she is willing to take care of recycling and garbage on a daily basis. While this level of involvement is a bit uncommon, Marianne’s words reveal how the encounter and working arrangements between Italian

²⁰ Since 2009, A.S.I.A has refused to disclose data on recycling rates in Naples’ municipality.

women and migrant domestic workers is one laden with anxiety (which in turn, may result in additional emotional labor on the part of the domestic assistant), and institutional shortcomings. While some of these emotions reflect informants' concerns for the deteriorating health of a close family member, there are limits to how traditional homes can be safe and accessible for semi-independent individuals. The lack of consistent funding for home-care in a country with very few options for assisted housing place Italian families, particularly women, in a problematic situation, which certainly plays a part in the employment decisions they make with migrant workers. Rather than justifying those Italian families exploiting migrant workers, these considerations highlight how the institutional apparatus, specifically migration regulations and privatization of welfare actively create the conditions for these exploitative encounters to take place.

Conclusions

In this chapter, I illustrate how some middle-class families outsource the dirty work of sorting, discarding and disposing of household materials and recyclables to low-income migrant women. These findings broaden our understanding of the feminization of environmental concerns in Western countries by highlighting how migrant women's invisible labor of sorting, packaging and disposing of household materials enables, or at least facilitates the adoption of transnational norms of waste behavior on the part of their employers. It further reveals how green practices and jobs can become avenues for host society members to express racist beliefs or inclinations, whether it is in the form of personal prejudice or outright harassment against migrant women. These racisms ignore and risk limiting the contributions that migrant women make to sustainable efforts in host societies.

Second, this ethnography debunks a lingering prejudice against non-EU migrants' alleged indifference to green matters. While migrant women from different regions are in fact active

recyclers in their own neighborhoods, their insights, voices and experience are not yet part of environmentalist scholarships or social movements. Foreign-born domestic workers' experiences further highlight how a combination of environmentalist ideologies, accessibility of recycling stations and working conditions intersect in allowing them to recycle or not, in safe or exploitative conditions.

Workplace recycling reveals a racialized and conflicted picture of migrant domestic workers' experiences in Naples. On the one hand, the participants of this study illustrate forms of everyday agency in their ability to resist unreasonable demands on the part of employers, whether this entails being indoors for days in a row or on the opposite, working outside of their scheduled hours. However, these forms of micro-agency should not overshadow concerns for fair working arrangements for domestic labor. These oppressive working conditions are rooted in everyday informality, such as the part-time contracts that many informants accepted, but also in the immigration and welfare regimes of the host society, which still regularly underfund and outsource all aspects of social reproduction to families.

As a domestic chore that takes place at least in part outdoors, recycling practices further reveal understudied aspects of migrant domestic workers' experiences in a host society: these include problems of street harassment and aggression, but also their efforts to build a secondary support network made of employers' neighbors and shopkeepers, but also fellow domestic workers of various national backgrounds. These secondary networks develop in addition to the relationships they entertain with co-nationals and employing families and provide a degree of job and workplace security. While both of these concerns appear in immigration scholarship, they do so in relation to other category of workers, as live-in domestic workers spend little time outdoors. This chapter draws attention to some of the ways that live-in workers in particular work to establish secondary

networks, in spite of the constraints of their jobs, through recycling chores for example. As for their experiences with street harassment and experience, this chapter speaks to a growing concern for studies of gender violence for the experiences of minority women, particularly working-class foreign-born minorities. While acknowledging this group as one at high-risk of victimization, recent scholarship still struggles to incorporate these marginalized communities in their studies (Stanko, 2005).

By exploring the linkages between women's empowerment and environmentally friendly norms from the perspective of paid domestic labor, this paper contributes to studies of inequities in the context of modern green economies. While previous studies have shown the risks of outsourcing the dirty and dangerous aspects of green jobs to ethnic minorities and low-wage migrants (Gregson et al 2015), this paper highlights how the idea of empowering women, in developing and in European countries, by enlisting them in environmentalist efforts excludes low-income ethnic minorities. These politics further exclude migrant women from civil rights in the context of cities that they make possible, by providing care and emotional labor to its seniors but also by lending expert hands to green initiatives.

Concluding, in this and in the previous chapter I have drawn attention to how a capitalist mode of accumulation by dispossession is allowing a series of actors- including households, private employers and workplaces – to slowly begin the processes of “going green” without having to invest in such practices. The uncertainties deriving from the recession but also from precarious immigration statuses are such that women of different nationalities, educational and professional backgrounds become key instruments in promoting environmentalist habits in their workplaces. For Italian women many of these practices have a social – or at least symbolic return, through the

approval and support of their coworkers, supervisors and fellow activists. None of this prestige apply in the case of migrant women, whose recycling efforts are neglected if not outright ignored.

CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSIONS

This dissertation set out to examine how sustainable waste management in Campania is reshaping gender and ethnic relationships. By highlighting the intersection between global, national and regional factors in determining the history and opposition to Campania's waste crisis, I have drawn attention to how the everyday experiences of a diverse group of women reflect transnational structures such as labor markets, immigration regimes and environmental governance and family.

Throughout the waste crisis and in its contested aftermath, waste governance in Campania has taken place through oppressive top-down reforms and has allowed little participation from local populations and civil society groups in general, and particularly ones that were suffering the most from problems of uncollected garbage, illegal dumping and toxic waste contamination. Relying on a combination of authoritarian institutions - such as commissioning of regional waste governance, the militarization of waste sites and the criminalization of waste protests and even independent trash collection initiatives – governing bodies have strived to reconfigure Campania's social geography to host a large waste-treatment hub that would benefit national and international businesses (Sassen, 2000; Brenner, 2002). Using ethnographic methods, I have drawn attention to how power – in this case, in the form of reterritorializations – affects the lives of a diverse group of women. In particular, I have drawn attention to the oppression and opportunities emerging in the realms of social movements and civil society, but also on the workplace and within families. The experiences I have presented in this dissertation include the reproduction of gender and ethnic hierarchies in the political, domestic and work spheres, but also concrete forms of resistances unfolding in everyday life and in civil society (Massey, Amin and Thrift, 2003; Sassen, 2003; Burawoy et al. 2000).

Findings contribute to our understanding of the role of global dispossessions in shaping women's experiences of environmental injustices, sustainable development and ecological

modernization efforts. More specifically, I indicate three distinct ways in which anti-waste activists in general but women in particular are seeking to establish sustainable waste practices in Campania: by organizing large and small demonstrations, public events and petitions; by restructuring household practices and by striving to make their places of work greener. In addition, I have highlighted oh low-wage, migrant domestic workers are becoming increasingly involved with issues of waste and sustainability, in their neighborhoods and in their places of work. While the conditions in which they find themselves interacting with Campania's waste crisis as members of low-income communities and as a disenfranchised workforce are oftentimes outside of their control, migrant women are nonetheless able to find ways to use these outdoors tasks to address broader problems deriving from their precarious visa status. More specifically, this dissertation engages with literatures on neoliberal governance (Barry, 2003; Dunn, 2005; Gille, 2016), environmental sociology and justice (Mol and Spaargaren, 2000; MacGregor, 2007; Salleh, 2010; Park and Pellow, 2011), and transnational migration (Yeates, 2010; Raghuram, 2009; Muniandy, 2015; Miraftab, 2016).

Beginning with my contributions to neoliberal globalization, in the initial chapter of this dissertation I have relied on Sassen (1999) and Brenner's (2000) theories of the role of state governance in making neoliberal capitalism possible by ways of reconfiguring social geographies to conform to the interests of the private sector. While this perspective is not new, it offers a significant departure from the methodological nationalism underlying existing scholarship on Campania's waste crisis. Following, I highlighted how the EU's transnational framework is entangled in seemingly contradictory ways with the history of Campania's waste crisis. On the one hand, the EU waste directives have imposed waste disposal standards that, unintendedly, have given way to a profitable market for underground waste trafficking (Barry, 2003; Dunn, 2005; Gille, 2016). However, liberally-minded environmentalist activists have highlighted how their mobilization could not have gone on for so many years, let alone grow, without the support that they received from the

European Union Commission. These experiences draw attention to the contradictory outcomes that transnational governing body can have in terms of co-generating the conditions for dispossession while retaining the moral – and to an extent, legal – authority to halt or limit such dispossession. Finally, in the fourth and fifth chapters I have returned to neoliberal governance from the perspective of Theodore and Brenner’s “real experiences of neoliberalism”. I have highlighted how the privatization of garbage and waste materials as the property of a municipal monopoly broadens existing notions of environmental privilege. In addition to having access to safe and clean environments, I highlight how neoliberal capitalism in Naples is creating a clear-cut distinction between those who can – or cannot- profit from sustainable waste management. By limiting access to waste materials to garbage operators, this privatization of waste creates an additional distinction between those who can and cannot enlist waste in their politics.

By analyzing the public discourse around issues of gender, environment and anti-waste mobilization in Campania, I have expanded upon environmental sociology, ecofeminist and political ecology on gender essentialism in the context of environmentalist efforts, including grassroots movements but also top-down development endeavors (Carlassare, 2001; Salleh, 2003; Reed, 2001; MacGregor, 2007). In the third chapter, I have described how in two distinct rural areas, both of them with an extensive history of toxic waste contamination, local women have organized into mothers’ groups. Relying on a rather archetypical notion of motherhood and maternal duties, these groups have gained a certain recognition within their neighborhoods and local civil societies; in the case of the more conservative of these movements, this recognition extends to government representatives. By mobilizing around motherhood, these groups are denouncing criminal organizations charged with toxic waste contamination, while at the same time drawing attention the failure of local governments, to the socially irresponsible behaviors of transnational industries and to the raising costs of child and maternal health.

While mothers' movements certainly exist and represent an important component of environmentalist movements in Campania, maternalist identities are not dominant among local anti-waste movements. Although several activists identify as "mothers", they do so in very concrete, immediate and relational terms, such as when interacting with student activists or when scheduling events; they are not, in other words, mobilizing around motherhood. Furthermore, many women participating to large and gender-neutral movements actively try to avoid defining their activism in maternal terms, and strive to highlight the contributions they provide to these grassroots organizations in terms of professional expertise and political beliefs. However, many of these women have reported find themselves time and time again described as "anti-waste mothers", even in reputable national newspapers. Consequently, the political insights, as well as the legal and technical expertise that female activists mobilize around remain marginalized. In this same chapter (Chapter Three), I have discussed how the extent to which extended families and primary networks actually support mothers' activism is contingent upon the type of effort and commitment that such activism requires. The cases of the Postcards Mothers and the Volcano Mothers as well as the ChiaiaNo Landfill welcome the involvement of homemakers and stay at home mothers in various efforts, including demonstrations, occupations and picket lines and coordination with other groups. While these communities tend to have a lower socio-economic status than the ones affiliated to the CoReRi or the Campania Citizens, opposition to the siting of a toxic facility in the community generally fosters more support for women's involvement with political protests. On the contrary, wealthier and more educated professionals have highlighted how their activism took place at the expenses of their personal time and, in certain cases, collided with their families' expectations.

Through analysis of the expansive coverage that these activists' maternal identities have obtained in national newspapers, I argue how this strategic use of essentialist notions of Southern-Italian mothers as emotional, concerned and fully devoted to their families (and communities) is

providing a space for the voices of working-class women living in a generally unresponsive and close-knit urban bourgeoisie. Subsequently, I draw attention to how the intersection of class, gender and religious identity shape the opportunities that “maternalist” activism generates for the women involved in such groups but also for the ones mobilizing under different organizations. Access to the contributors of a national Catholic newspaper can offer a powerful networking tool for the Postcards’ Mothers seemingly isolated rural community. However, other groups would find that participating to such networks would imply being unable to denounce the lack of women’s representation in governing bodies (as the Volcano Mothers did) or the ambivalent role that the Catholic Church is playing in the waste crisis. Therefore, I argue that although maternal identities are indeed appealing and may seem universal (MacGregor, 2013). However, the extent to which maternalism enables social movements to thrive – in the media, with local civil societies and communities- is contingent on the intersection of politics, class and in this case, religion.

The next substantive contribution of this dissertation is drawing attention the role of precarious and disenfranchised labor in making environmentally friendly efforts possible and affordable. These considerations speak to Ecological Modernization Theory and to the Women-Environment nexus, but also call for a closer intersection of migration and environmental sociologies. Previously, I have discussed how the privatization of garbage, coupled with the lack of systemic investments in developing green technologies limit the extent to which activists and entrepreneurs can expect to make any significant revenue from the green sector. However, efforts to educate the public to sustainable waste management and to reduce waste production are in place, in the context of private homes but also in places of work. In Chapters 4 and Five, I have discussed women’s involvement with such efforts: as activists, as concerned citizens and as domestic workers. Drawing on critical globalization scholarship, I have highlighted how a combination of environmentalist beliefs with the economic instability resulting from the 2008 recession, but also the precarious conditions allowed

under Italian immigration law are pushing different groups of women to take on such tasks as volunteers, or outright unpaid work. By engaging in such tasks, both Italian and migrant women can hope that the recognition of their efforts will provide them with a degree of job security. Italian women can hope to contain some of the uncertainties associated with the overall economic decline that Campania is experiencing, but also reinforce their position within social movements. In this context, it is interesting to note how as of 2014 volunteerism – which existing scholarship had addressed in the context of marginalized communities in the Global South (Miraftab 2004; Hanson 2015) – is an important workplace strategy for highly-educated female professionals in a European country. While these experiences diverge in many important ways, the one of environmentalist professionals in Southern Italy is further proof of growing precariousness under neoliberal regimes.

Migrant domestic workers and personal assistants have far less choice in the matter when employers expect them to package, sort and dispose their recyclables – even in neighborhoods where they do not feel safe. While the experiences of migrant and Italian women differ in many important ways, differences that underlie exclusionary nature of race politics in everyday life, the necessity of unpaid, disenfranchised and volunteer labor in implementing sustainable reforms draw attention to an important oversight in both ecological modernization theory and in the women- environment nexus (Resurrecion, 2013). Both these approaches understand the private sector as key to containing environmental devastation while at the same time creating employment opportunities for highly-educated workforces (Mol and Spaargaren, 2000) but also for manual workers (Asia Business Council, 2016); along similar lines, the women-environment nexus suggests that employment opportunities in the green sector could help address gender gap in the workplace. My dissertation however highlights how the availability of precarious labor forces can allow green efforts to take place decoupled from the economic, technological and social justice advancements suggested by those theories – meaning, as yet another form of accumulation by dispossession.

Migrant women's experiences of waste and recycling in Campania expand on both environmental justice and the care chain literatures. In-depth interviews and participant observations with migrant domestic workers indicate that recycling practices are not very common among urban Neapolitan households: consistently with the statistics provided by Legambiente (2016), recycling is more frequent in smaller and medium-sized towns in Campania's peripheries. In their experiences however, when a household does decide to recycle, they will rely on domestic workers to sort and package the materials; many of them will also expect the domestic worker to deliver the recyclables in the appropriate collection center. By highlighting how Italian households outsource the more tedious and burdensome aspects of recycling to a low-income migrant worker, these findings broaden Western European notions of the intersection between environmentalist efforts and domestic work (Schultz, 2003; Littig, 2004; Carlassare, 2011). In addition, these experiences provide a mirror image to how the global outsourcing of risks and hazards to the Global South and its citizens is shaping not only the practices of large industries and plants (Beck, 1999; Wallerstein, 2004; Miraftab, 2016), as well as households.

Taking out garbage and recyclables represents a surprisingly rare opportunity for live-in domestic assistants to step out of their employers' homes. By framing waste as an ethnographic artefact providing some insight into how migrant workers experience public places, my dissertation suggests how live-in care workers in particular seek to build a secondary support network while trying to manage the risks of harassment and aggressions in a given neighborhood. Simply put, the relatively long walks to a recycling station offer migrant women with the possibility to spend a little time outdoors and away from their employers, offering them opportunities to stretch their legs, to run some personal errands, and to meet their neighbors. While the migration literature has drawn attention to secondary networks for migrant families and men (Ehrenreich and Hochschild, 2003; Pande, 2015; Yeats, 2010), the efforts of live-in migrant women are still largely absent from this

scholarship -perhaps because live-in workers have no choice but to build these networks over the course of several months, and during work hours.

According to some, the care-chain literature in particular has emphasized the role of remittances and caregiving roles to the point of obfuscating all other aspects of migrant women's lives (Yeats, 2010; Raghuram, 2009). In part, my dissertation seeks to address this gap in the literature by drawing attention to migrant women's involvement with the environmental quality of a host society, and to their efforts in building a secondary network. At the same time, because the care sector is so central to the employment and visa opportunities for female migrant workers, I highlight how immigration regimes, and more specifically Italy's politics of regular exceptionality, continue to make caregiving central to migration scholarship. Informants' insights on the institutional and informal practices underlying their employment and immigration statuses suggest that existing data on what Italian press defines as "the white economy", i.e. the domestic and caregiving sector, may be inaccurate. If these findings were to be confirmed in other regions, this would implicate important limitations in using social security data on domestic and care labor. Finally, the role of migrant workers in caring for ageing individuals in Italian homes further draw attention to the key role that migrant labor plays in allowing host societies to re-produce, and re-imagine idealized notions of cultural identities (Muniandy, 2015; Miraftab, 2016). In this case, these imagined identities are projected into the future as well as the past and portray Italy as a place that can at one embrace the habits of modern civility, such as recycling, while upholding a traditional habit of caring of ageing family members in the comfort of their homes.

Policy Implications of research

In December 2015, the European Commission published its "Strategic engagement for gender equity 2016-2019", as a follow-up to the 2011-2020 Pact for Gender Equity and to the UN's 2030

Agenda for Sustainable Development. Both documents seek to integrate questions of gender equity with sustainable economies and environmentally sound practices: several of the goals indicated in these agendas speak to important issues for my dissertation. In particular, I refer to the desired 75% employment goal, for both women and men, by 2020 (European Union Commission, 2015), and to providing recognition to “unpaid care and domestic work, through the provision of public services, infrastructure and social protection policies and the promotion of shared responsibility within the household and the family as nationally appropriate” (Strategic Engagement for Gender Equality, pp 32). The document further acknowledges migrant women in general as a vulnerable group, that is systematically excluded from labor markets through national immigration policies (pp. 8)

While in principle, many of the goals listed in these agendas are widely accepted among scholars and institutions, both documents have received criticism for not being able to provide a framework on how to effectively integrate concerns for gender equity and sustainability (Koheler, 2016). My dissertation provides insights on how the concerns for women’s employment, citizenship opportunities and green efforts intersect at the levels of daily life and politics in the context of Campania.

With regards to employment goals, I have highlighted how issues of waste and recycling are presenting entrepreneurial opportunities for both women and men. While waste-related work remains largely a prerogative of unionized male workers, efforts to implement green practices in workplaces and professional environments that are not necessarily tied to waste can become avenues for women to seek new employment opportunities within their current jobs, and to gain recognition.

I have highlighted the limitations and consequences of viewing migrant women’s contributions to host societies uniquely in relation to labor markets. In particular, this dissertation draws attention to the knowledge, expertise and commitment of many long-term, foreign born

residents to their neighborhoods and communities, but also to some of the inhumane ways of life that result from Italy's limited citizenship policy. This dissertation provides further insights into how these immigration policies can force migrant women into low-wage caregiving jobs, but also to some of the benefits that more inclusive immigration policies could yield, in terms of insights on sustainability in urban areas and of engagement to green practices.

Finally, my findings suggest that while the Italian Centers for Financial Assistance may be encouraging greater numbers of families to finance a migrant workers' immigration status, the kind of informal practices they engage with are reducing an already fragile institutional support for low-wage migrant workers. These findings suggest a stronger input and participation on the part of migrant workers in administering and supervising employment practices.

Possibilities for Future Research

Very recently, one of the study participants complained on social media that once again, she could not sleep because of the fumes of burnt tires coming in from outside. To her great disappointment however, most people in her neighborhood were no longer inclined to petition to the local authorities, let alone engage with community cleanup activity. Instead, these former anti-waste activists were busy organizing to drive a group of recently-arrived migrants away from the neighborhood, a choice that left this young activist feeling frustrated and disillusioned. Although the threat of illegal dumping and landfill siting in many cases brought neighbors to work together against government interventions on the territory, these solidarities do not necessarily imply a commonality of political opinions, or shared social justice goals. The arrival of migrants and refugees for example seems to have put a strain on neighborhood solidarities, which are now growing tense under the pressure of anti-immigrant sentiment, ramping following the recent refugee crisis. These divisions underlie a lingering xenophobia within local communities, as well as disregard or simply

ignorance, of the state of global inequalities nowadays. Such narrow-minded perspectives cast doubts on the support, hence feasibility, of activists' goals to "finding sustainable ways to treat waste locally, (or) it will just end up in Somalia or another developing country". While the Italian media has stopped reporting on the possible waste deal with Morocco, I would find it interesting to follow up with anti-waste activists on if, and how, they and their organizations thought of addressing the possibility of international shipments of local wastes.

Issues of immigrant reception and anti-immigrant sentiment in the context of the current refugee crisis are consistent with established perspectives, such as contact theory and integrated threat theory (Fussell, 2014). However, exiting literature on women's migration also indicates that domestic workers are somewhat exempt or at least protected from anti-immigrant policies, and according to some, sentiment (Schuster, 2010 King and Zontini, 2005). Indeed, many of the Italian governments' "amnesties" target specifically *colfe badanti*, domestic workers and personal assistants. Because of the high demand for these services, the amnesties for domestic workers are the only ones so far who received strong political support from both right and left-wing parties. While such amnesties have led some scholars (Van Hooren, 2012; Ambrosini, 2014) to conclude that migrant domestic workers are a somewhat safe and protected category of low-wage migrant workers, in 2012 the International Labor Organization (ILO) denounced an alarming lack of protection for migrant workers in terms of labor rights (ILO, 2012). It remains to be seen whether and how the current refugee crisis will affect these alleged exceptions, as refugee women begin to look for employment in domestic services.

Collaborating with organization such as Yalla has given me the opportunity to learn about various forms of financial assistance and "services" that NGOs and banks are making available to migrant and refugee families. These include personal loans designed specifically for recently-arrived

migrant women but also housing assistance programs for families with small children. While these programs are relatively recent, it will be interesting to see the scope and outcomes of these financial opportunities in the context of European country, and in comparison to existing studies of the Global South. Finally, my dissertation further highlights the need for a more systematic study of the working conditions and health risks for migrant domestic workers. Particularly, my findings suggest that the expanding sector of live-in elderly care may have negative impact on migrants' physical and emotional health on a group that already has limited access to healthcare in a host society. Existing scholarship on the health risks of migration in Europe (Speciale and Regidor, 2011) overlooks the experiences of migrant domestic workers, and the health risks that this population faces as a consequence of the work they are hired to do in the host society (Markides and Rote, 2015).

Abundant studies discuss the empowering potential of the green economy in relation to both women and developing countries, particularly in terms of political representation and creation of jobs. Scholarship further indicates that women's unpaid work at the level of households is central to implementing sustainable lifestyles in European cities. This dissertation discusses the role of women's work, paid and unpaid, in making existing jobs and work places more environmentally friendly. These considerations suggest that analyzing more closely how environmentalist policies affect workplaces, paying attention to the paid and unpaid opportunities and duties that may become available – or implicitly mandatory - for different groups of workers.

Finally, I have discussed some of the difficulties I encountered while collecting data in certain male-dominated and somewhat crime-ridden areas. While the experiences of harassment and minor threats I mentioned are common occurrences of field research, particularly on the part of scholars of ethnic, racial or sexual minorities, as well as women and perhaps junior researches, I have drawn attention to the lack of a systematic engagement with these concerns on the part of academic

institutions. While this institutional silence risks victimizing affected researchers twice, as their experiences and data become taboo (Kulick and Wilson, 2000), concrete concerns about funding opportunities, as well as the risk of stereotyping informants and research sites are important concerns that hinder, yet need to underlie any such discussion. Although in this dissertation I do not offer a definitive answer to how we can go about some of the risks of conducting field research without harming our informants, research on teaching ethnographic methodologies might represent a productive starting point.

REFERENCES

- Agyeman, Julian. *Introducing just sustainabilities: Policy, planning, and practice*. Zed books, 2013.
- Alaimo, Stacy. 2008. "Ecofeminism without Nature? Questioning the Relation Between Feminism and Environmentalism." *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 10 (3): 299-304.
- Alvarez, Sonia E. 2000. "Translating the Global Effects of Transnational Organizing on Local Feminist Discourses and Practices in Latin America." *Meridians* 1 (1): 29-67.
- Alvarez, Sonia E. 2009. "Beyond NGO-ization? Reflections from Latin America." *Development* 52 (2): 175-184.
- Ambrosini, Maurizio. "We are against a multi-ethnic society': policies of exclusion at the urban level in Italy." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 36, no. 1 (2013): 136-155.
- Anderson, Bridget. *Doing the dirty work?: The global politics of domestic labour*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2000.
- Andretta, Marzia. "Da" Campania felix" a discarica. Le trasformazioni in Terra di Lavoro dal dopoguerra ad oggi." *Meridiana* (2009): 87-120.
- Armiero, Marco. "Seeing like a protester: nature, power, and environmental struggles." *Left History* 13, no. 1 (2008).
- Armiero, Marco. "Teresa e le altre: Storie di donne nella Terra dei fuochi." (2014).
- Armiero, Marco, and Giacomo D'Alisa. 2012. "Rights of Resistance: The Garbage Struggles for Environmental Justice in Campania, Italy." *Capitalism Nature Socialism* 23 (4): 52-68.
- Appadurai, Arjun. *Modernity at large: cultural dimensions of globalization*. Vol. 1. U of Minnesota Press, 1996.
- Associazione Antigone. 2008. "Rifiuti e Uomini che Rifiutano le Responsabilita': e se per il compostato ci si affidasse alle donne?" January 11. http://www.associazioneantigone.net/news-gruppi.asp?id_news=2330
- Associazione Genitori di Tutti. 2013. "Lettera Aperta al Presidente della Repubblica." December 5. <http://www.noigenitoriditutti.it/news/lettera-aperta-al-presidente-della-repubblica-dopo-iniziativa-cartoline/>
- Azienda Servizi Igiene Ambientale, 2014 "Statuto Societario". Assemblea Generale dei Soci, April 11 <http://www.asianapoli.it/sites/test.asianapoli.it/files/Statuto%20societario.pdf> Last accessed 2/2017
- Bail, Christopher A. 2012. "The Fringe Effect Civil Society Organizations and the Evolution of Media Discourse about Islam since the September 11th Attacks." *American Sociological Review* 77 (6): 855-879.
- Barry, Andrew. "Technological zones." *European journal of social theory* 9, no. 2 (2006): 239-253.
- Beck, Ulrich. 2002. "The Terrorist Threat World Risk Society Revisited." *Theory, Culture & Society* 19 (4): 39-55.
- Belardo, Maria Teresa. 2013. "E Le Mamme Vulcaniche Restarono Fuori le Porta" *Parallelo41*, December 9 <http://www.paralleloquarantuno.it/articoli/e-le-mamme-vulcaniche-restarono-alla-porta.html>

Bellows, Anne C. 1996. "Where Kitchen and Laboratory Meet." In *Feminist Political Ecology: Global Issues and Local Experience*, edited by Dianne Rocheleau, Barbara Thomas-Slayter, and Esther Wangari. London: Routledge.

Bevilacqua, Piero. "I rifiuti e la metamorfosi dissipativa della natura." *Meridiana* (2009): 27-39.

Block, Fred, and Margaret R. Somers. *The Power of Market Fundamentalism*. Harvard University Press, 2014.

Bondi, Liz. "Teaching reflexivity: Undoing or reinscribing habits of gender?." *Journal of Geography in Higher Education* 33, no. 3 (2009): 327-337.

Brancaccio, Anna. 2013. "Come nella Terra dei Fuochi, anche noi avvelenate ai piedi del Vesuvio." *Parallelo41*, November 6. <http://www.paralleloquarantuno.it/articoli/come-nella-terra-dei-fuochi-anche-noi-avvelenati-ai-piedi-del-vesuvio.html>

Brancaccio, Anna. 2013. "La rabbia e l'orgoglio: la trincea delle Mamme Vulcaniche" *Parallelo41*. November 7. <http://www.paralleloquarantuno.com/articoli/la-rabbia-e-lorgoglio-la-trincea-delle-mamme-vulcaniche.html>

Brenner, Neil. "Globalisation as reterritorialisation: the re-scaling of urban governance in the European Union." *Urban studies* 36, no. 3 (1999): 431-451.

Brenner, Neil, and Nik Theodore. "Cities and the geographies of "actually existing neoliberalism"." *Antipode* 34, no. 3 (2002): 349-379.

Brú-Bistuer, Josepa. 1996. "Spanish Women Against Industrial Waste: A Gender Perspective on Environmental Grassroots Movements." In *Feminist Political Ecology: Global Issues and Local Experience*, edited by Dianne Rocheleau, Barbara Thomas-Slayter, and Esther Wangari. London: Routledge

Bullard, Robert D., and Glenn S. Johnson. "Environmentalism and public policy: Environmental justice: Grassroots activism and its impact on public policy decision making." *Journal of Social Issues* 56, no. 3 (2000): 555-578.

Burawoy, Michael, Joseph A. Blum, Sheba George, Zsuzsa Gille, and Millie Thayer. *Global ethnography: Forces, connections, and imaginations in a postmodern world*. Univ of California Press, 2000.

Carlassare, Elizabeth. 1994. "Destabilizing the Criticism of Essentialism in Ecofeminist Discourse." *Capitalism Nature Socialism* 5 (3): 50-66.

Carlassare, Elizabeth. 2000. "Socialist and Cultural Ecofeminism: Allies in Resistance." *Ethics and the Environment* 5 (1): 89-106.

Chetta, Alessandro. 2014. "Le mamme antidiscarica parlano in Inglese." *Il Corriere del Mezzogiorno*, October 18. http://napolitans.corrieredelmezzogiorno.corriere.it/2010/10/18/le_mamme_antidiscarica_parlano/

Corona, Gabriella, and Maurizio Franzini. "Capire l'emergenza rifiuti a Napoli. Un'introduzione." *Meridiana* (2009): 9-25.

Corona, Gabriella, and Rocco Sciarrone. "«Meridiana», venticinquesimo anno." *Meridiana* (2012): 9-12.

Corona, Gabriella, and Daniele Fortini. *The Problem of Waste Disposal in a Large European City: Garbage in Naples*. Edwin Mellen Press, 2012.

Il Corriere della Sera a. 2013 "Terra dei Fuochi, la Strage dei Bambini." September 17.
<http://www.corriere.it/inchieste/manifestazione-ad-acerra/5a29d486-1f9f-11e3-9636-b0708204026a.shtml>

Il Corriere del Mezzogiorno. 2013. "Balduzzi contestato ad Aversa: «Qui si muore.»" January 8.
http://www.corriere.it/salute/13_gennaio_08/balduzzi-contestato-aversa_c52a34b8-59a9-11e2-bf1c-a7535a9f5f63.shtml

Corriere del Mezzogiorno. 2015. "Inceneritore, De Luca condannato: scatta la sospensione da sindaco" January 2015 last accessed 3/2/2016
http://corrieredelmezzogiorno.corriere.it/salerno/cronaca/15_gennaio_21/inceneritore-de-luca-condannato-scatta-sospensione-sindaco-f512b31c-a178-11e4-8981-1b01bbe95f7b.shtml

Corte di Giustizia dell'Unione Europea. 2015. Comunicato Stampa 86/15 Lussemburgo, 16 Luglio

Creswell, John W. *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage, 2013.

D'Alisa, Giacomo, David Burgalassi, Hali Healy, and Mariana Walter. "Conflict in Campania: Waste emergency or crisis of democracy." *Ecological economics* 70, no. 2 (2010): 239-249.

D'Alisa, Giacomo, and Marco Armiero. "What Happened to the Trash? Political Miracles and Real Statistics in an Emergency Regime." *Capitalism Nature Socialism* 24, no. 4 (2013): 29-45.

Davies, Anna R. 2008. "Civil Society Activism and Waste Management in Ireland: The Carranstown Anti-Incineration Campaign." *Land Use Policy* 25(2): 161-172.

De Haas, Hein. "Migration and development: a theoretical perspective1." *International migration review* 44, no. 1 (2010): 227-264.

Del Porto, Dario. "I governatore della Campania indagato per voto di scambio. De Luca: "Qui moriamo di avvisi di garanzia"" *La Repubblica* 12/14/2016
http://napoli.repubblica.it/cronaca/2016/12/14/news/incontro_de_luca-sindaci_indagine_per_voto_di_scambio-154070942/ Last Accessed 12/14/2016

Demarco, Marco. 2013. "Del Giudice: "Abbiamo solo 7 spazzatrici e non c'è traccia dei siti di compostaggio. Il nuovo manager chiede a tutti di mettere da parte I pregiudizi e di darsi da fare per la città." *Il Corriere della Sera*, January 3. <http://corrieredelmezzogiorno.corriere.it/napoli/notizie/cronaca/2013/3-gennaio-2013/del-giudice-abbiamo-solo-7-spazzatrici-non-c-traccia-siti-compostaggio-2113389913195.shtml>

Demaria Harney, Nicholas. "Transnationalism and entrepreneurial migrancy in Naples, Italy." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 33, no. 2 (2007): 219-232.

De Rosa, Anna Laura. 2013. "Corteo Terra dei fuochi è già un fiume in piena" *La Repubblica*, November 9.
http://napoli.repubblica.it/cronaca/2013/11/09/news/terra_dei_fuochi-70585823/

Doherty, Ann, Olivier Hoedeman, Adam Ma'anit, and Erik Wesselius. 2000. "Corporate Europe" In *Europe Inc.*, edited by Belén Balanya. London: Pluto Press.

- Di Feo, Gianluca, and Claudio Pappaiani. 2013 "Bevi Napoli e poi muori, l'inchiesta choc degli USA" *L'Espresso*, November 13
Last accessed 3/1/2016
<http://espresso.repubblica.it/inchieste/2013/11/13/news/bevi-napoli-e-poi-muori-1.141086>
- DeVault, Marjorie L. *Liberating method: Feminism and social research*. Temple University Press, 1999.
- Dines, Nick (2013) 'Bad news from an aberrant city: a critical analysis of the British press's portrayal of organised crime and the rubbish crisis in Naples', *Modern Italy*, vol.18, no.4, 1-14.
- Doherty, Ann, Olivier Hoedeman, Adam Ma'anit, and Erik Wesselius. *Europe Inc*. Edited by Belén Balanya. Pluto, 2000.
- Dunn, Elizabeth C. "Standards and Person-Making in East Central Europe." *Global assemblages: Technology, politics, and ethics as anthropological problems* (2005): 173-193.
- Dwyer, Sonya Corbin, and Jennifer L. Buckle. "The space between: On being an insider-outsider in qualitative research." *International journal of qualitative methods* 8, no. 1 (2009): 54-63.
- Ehrenreich, Barbara, and Arlie Russell Hochschild. *Global woman: Nannies, maids, and sex workers in the new economy*. Macmillan, 2003.
- England, Kim VL. "Getting personal: Reflexivity, positionality, and feminist research." *Critical geographies: A collection of readings* (2008): 241-256.
- Ernst, Glen J. 1994. "Racial and Economic Exploitation in the Siting of Toxic Wastes." *Bulletin of Science, Technology & Society* 14 (1): 28-32
- Esposito, Francesco G. 2013. "Tumori, contestato Balduzzi 'I roghi dei rifiuti uccidono.'" *Il Mattino*, January 9.
http://campania.peacelink.net/rifiuti/articles/art_11138.html
- European Commission Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers. *Strategic Engagement for Gender Equality 2016-2019* : 2015
https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/strategic_engagement_for_gender_equality_en.pdf
Retrieved July 2016
- Fagan, G. Honor. 2004. "Waste management and its contestation in the Republic of Ireland*." *Capitalism nature socialism* 15.1 pp. 83-102.
- Fuchs, Jackie. 2011 "The Toxic Crime of the Century" *The Huffington Post*, May 10th. Last accessed 03/01/2016
http://www.huffingtonpost.com/jackie-fuchs/the-toxic-crime-of-the-ce b_122670.html
- Fussell, Elizabeth. "Warmth of the welcome: Attitudes toward immigrants and immigration policy in the United States." *Annual review of sociology* 40 (2014): 479-498.
- Gaard, Greta. "Ecofeminism revisited: Rejecting essentialism and re-placing species in a material feminist environmentalism." *Feminist Formations* 23, no. 2 (2011): 26-53.
- Giddens, Anthony. *Runaway world: How globalisation is reshaping our lives*. Profile Books, 2002.

Gille, Zsuzsa. "Actor networks, modes of production, and waste regimes: reassembling the macro-social." *Environment and Planning A* 42, no. 5 (2010): 1049-1064.

-----, *Paprika, Foie Gras, and Red Mud: The Politics of Materiality in the European Union*. Indiana University Press, 2016. Gille, Zsuzsa, and Benjamin J. Vail. "Litter on the Shores of Bohemia: Environmental Justice, European Enlargement, and Illegal Waste Dumping in the Czech Republic." (2012): 577-579.

Gille, Zsuzsa, and Seán Ó. Riain. "Global ethnography." *Annual Review of Sociology* (2002): 271-295.

Gould, Kenneth A. "Response to Eric J. Krieg's 'The Two Faces of Toxic Waste: Trends in the Spread of Environmental Hazards'." In *Sociological Forum*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 21-23. Springer Netherlands, 1998.

Gowan, Teresa. "New hobos or neo-romantic fantasy? Urban ethnography beyond the neoliberal disconnect." *Qualitative Sociology* 32, no. 3 (2009): 231-257.

Gravetti, Francesco. 2010. "Battaglia su Cava Sari, il blitz del procuratore Mancuso." *Il Mattino*, November 11 http://campania.peacelink.net/rifiuti/articles/art_6507.html

Graziani, Chiara. 2013. "Rifiuti, la Camera rende pubblica la deposizione di Carmine Schiavone: 'Quei camion dal nord.'" *Il Mattino*, October 31. <http://www.ilmattino.it/PRIMOPIANO/POLITICA/schiavone-tolto-il-segreto-alla-deposizione/notizie/348344.shtml>

Gregson, Nicky, Mike Crang, Julie Botticello, Melania Calestani, and Anna Krzywoszynska. "Doing the 'dirty work' of the green economy: Resource recovery and migrant labour in the EU." *European Urban and Regional Studies* (2014): 0969776414554489.

Gutberlet, Jutta. 2012. *Recovering Resources-Recycling Citizenship: Urban Poverty Reduction in Latin America*. Burlington: Ashgate Publishing, Ltd.

Hanson, Anne-Marie S. "Women's ecological oral histories of recycling and development in coastal Yucatán." *Gender, Place & Culture* 23, no. 4 (2016): 467-483.

Hart, Gillian. "The provocations of neoliberalism: Contesting the nation and liberation after apartheid." *Antipode* 40, no. 4 (2008): 678-705.

Harvey, David. "NeoLiberalism: A brief history." (2005).

Harvey, David. "Neoliberalism as creative destruction." *the annals of the american Academy of political and social science* 610, no. 1 (2007): 21-44.

[Hooper, John. 2008. "More Garbage for Naples" *The Guardian*, January 10 last accessed 3/1/2016](http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2008/jan/10/moregarbagefromnaples)
<http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2008/jan/10/moregarbagefromnaples>

Huffington Post (Editorial Office) "Marocco, rivolta contro l'importanza di rifiuti dall'Italia: "Sono tossici, vengono dalla Campania" *The Huffington Post* 07/05/2016 Last accessed 12/14/2016
http://www.huffingtonpost.it/2016/07/05/marocco-rifiuti-italia_n_10811476.html

Harvey, David. 2007. "Neoliberalism as Creative Destruction." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 610 (1): 21-44.

- International Labour Organization *Effective Protections for Domestic Workers: A guide to designing labour laws* Conditions of Work and Employment Programme, Industrial and Employment Relations Department – Geneva: 2012
http://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/effective_protection_for_domestic_workers_a_guide_to_designing_labour_laws_0.pdf
 Retrieved July 2016
- Iovino, Serenella. "Naples 2008, or, the waste land: trash, citizenship, and an ethic of narration." *Neohelicon* 36, no. 2 (2009): 335-346.
- King, Russell, and Elisabetta Zontini. "The role of gender in the South European immigration model." *Papers: revista de sociologia* 60 (2000): 035-52.
- Klein, Naomi. *This changes everything: Capitalism vs. the climate*. Simon and Schuster, 2015.
- Koehler, Gabriele. "Tapping the Sustainable Development Goals for progressive gender equity and equality policy?." *Gender & Development* 24, no. 1 (2016): 53-68.
- Kulick, Don, and Margaret Willson, eds. *Taboo: Sex, identity and erotic subjectivity in anthropological fieldwork*. Routledge, 2003.
- Laino, Giovanni. "La crisi dei rifiuti a Napoli." *Archivio di Studi Urbani e Regionali* (2008).
- Leach, Melissa. 2007. "Earth Mother Myths and Other Ecofeminist Fables: How a Strategic Notion Rose and Fell." *Development and Change* 38 (1): 67-85.
- Legambiente. 2013. "Rapporto Ecomafia: Nomi e numeri dell'illegalità ambientale" June 17 last accessed 09/22/2016
<http://www.legambiente.it/contenuti/dossier/ecomafia-2013-nomi-e-numeri-dellillegalita-ambientale>
- Lerner, Steve. "Sacrifice Zones." *The Front Lines of Toxic Chemical Exposure in the United States* (2010).
- Lepore, Amedeo, and Riccardo Padovani. *La Cassa per il Mezzogiorno e la Banca Mondiale: un modello per lo sviluppo economico italiano*. Rubbettino, 2013.
- Levitt, Peggy, and Deepak Lamba-Nieves. "Social remittances revisited." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 37, no. 1 (2011): 1-22.
- Littig, Beate. *Feminist perspectives on environment and society*. Routledge, 2014.
- Lutz, Helma. "Gender in the migratory process." *Journal of ethnic and migration studies* 36, no. 10 (2010): 1647-1663.
- MacGregor, Sherilyn. *Beyond mothering earth: Ecological citizenship and the politics of care*. UBC Press, 2011.
- Malafrente, Susy. 2010. "Pompei, il giorno della supplica: «La madonna fermi il piano.»" *Il Mattino*, October 3.
http://campania.peacelink.net/rifiuti/articles/art_5858.html
- Marconi, Luca. 2013. "Cartoline di lutto al Papa e a Napolitano da 7 mamme che hanno perso i loro bimbi" *Il corriere del Mezzogiorno*, September 18.

<http://corrieredelmezzogiorno.corriere.it/napoli/notizie/cronaca/2013/18-settembre-2013/cartoline-lutto-papa-apolitanoda-7-mamme-che-hanno-perso-loro-bimbi-2223165390315.shtml>

Mahler, Sarah J., and Patricia R. Pessar. "Gendered geographies of power: Analyzing gender across transnational spaces." (2001): 441-459.

Markides, Kyriakos S., and Sunshine Rote. "Immigrant health paradox." *Emerging trends in the social and behavioral sciences: An interdisciplinary, searchable, and linkable resource* (2015).

Miranda, Adelina, and Rosa Gatti "Campania" in Fondazione Caritas Migrantes *Rapporto Immigrazione 2013. Tra crisi e diritti umani* pp 239-243 Perfect Paperback Press, 2014

Marres, Noortje. *Material participation: technology, the environment and everyday publics*. Springer, 2016.

Massard-Guilbaud, Geneviève, and Peter Thorsheim. "Cities, environments, and European history." *Journal of Urban History* 33, no. 5 (2007): 691-701.

Massey, Doreen. "The political challenge of relational space: Introduction to the Vega Symposium." *Geografiska Annaler: Series B, Human Geography* 86, no. 1 (2004): 3-3.

Il Mattino. 2014. "Terra dei Fuochi, Patricello e le Mamme da Napolitano: il presidente si e' commosso." January 22.

http://napoli.repubblica.it/cronaca/2014/01/22/news/terra_dei_fuochi_patricello_da_napolitano_il_presidente_si_commosso-76665975/

Mies, Maria. *Patriarchy and accumulation on a world scale: Women in the international division of labour*. Palgrave Macmillan, 1998.

Miller, Vernice, Moya Hallstein, and Susan Qass. 1996. "Feminist Politics and Environmental Justice: Women's Community Activism in West Harlem, New York." In *Feminist Political Ecology: Global Issues and Local Experience*, edited by Dianne Rocheleau, Barbara Thomas-Slayter, and Esther Wangari. London: Routledge

Mira, 2012. "Campania Violata. Rifiuti, raccolta differenziata gestita da rom e immigrati" *L'Avvenire* 10/13/2012 <https://www.avvenire.it/attualita/pagine/rifiuti-raccolta-gestita-da-rom-e-immigrati> Last accessed 11/19/2016

Miraftab, Faranak, David Wilson, and Ken Salo, eds. *Cities and Inequalities in a Global and Neoliberal World*. Routledge, 2015.

Mohai, Paul, David Pellow, and J. Timmons Roberts. 2009. "Environmental Justice." *Annual Review of Environment and Resources* 34: 405-430.

Mol, Arthur PJ, and Gert Spaargaren. "Ecological modernisation theory in debate: a review." *Environmental politics* 9, no. 1 (2000): 17-49.

-----, "Environment and modernity in transitional China: frontiers of ecological modernization." *Development and Change* 37, no. 1 (2006): 29-56.

Mollett, Sharlene, and Caroline Faria. "Messing with gender in feminist political ecology." *Geoforum* 45 (2013): 116-125.

Mouwal, Karima "Il Marocco Si Ribella Ai Rifiuti: Non siamo la discarica d'Italia" *La Stampa* 8/7/16
<http://www.lastampa.it/2016/07/08/esteri/il-marocco-si-ribella-ai-rifiuti-non-siamo-la-discardita-lyoPKcAAVTn9oa9wurmquL/pagina.html>

Last accessed 12/16/2014

Mukerji, Chandra. 2010. "The Territorial State as a Figured World of Power: Strategics, Logistics, and Impersonal Rule." *Sociological Theory* 28 (4): 402-424.

Näre, Lena. "The moral economy of domestic and care labour: Migrant workers in Naples, Italy." *Sociology* 45, no. 3 (2011): 396-412.

Navy and Marine Corps Public Health Center, 2011 "Naples Public Health Evaluation Public Health Summary Volume III" in Di Feo, Gianluca, and Claudio Pappaiani. 2013 "Bevi Napoli e poi muori, l'inchiesta choc degli USA" *L'Espresso*, November 13

Last accessed 3/1/2016

<http://espresso.repubblica.it/inchieste/2013/11/15/news/veleni-in-campania-il-dossier-dello-scandalo-1.141232>

Nizza, Mike. 2011. "In Italy, a Billionaire Takes Out the Trash" *The New York Times*, May 28 Last accessed 3/1/2016

<http://thelede.blogs.nytimes.com/2008/05/21/in-italy-a-billionaire-takes-out-trash/>

Organo, Vanessa, Lesley Head, and Gordon Waitt. "Who does the work in sustainable households? A time and gender analysis in New South Wales, Australia." *Gender, Place & Culture* 20, no. 5 (2013): 559-577.

Ortolani, Franco. 2010. "Napoli- Emergenza rifiuti in Campania: la Commissione Europea e l'eredità di 15 anni di potere straordinario" *Wordpress*, May 10, last accessed 3/2/2010

<https://altocasertano.wordpress.com/2010/05/04/napoli-emergenza-rifiuti-in-campania-la-commissione-europea-e-l%E2%80%99eredita-di-15-anni-di-potere-straordinario/>

Pande, Amrita. "From "Balcony Talk" and "Practical Prayers" to Illegal Collectives Migrant Domestic Workers and Meso-Level Resistances in Lebanon." *Gender & society* 26, no. 3 (2012): 382-405.

Parreñas, Rhacel Salazar. "The reproductive labour of migrant workers." *Global Networks* 12, no. 2 (2012): 269-275.

Park, Lisa Sun-Hee, and David N. Pellow. *The slums of Aspen: immigrants vs. the environment in America's Eden*. NYU Press, 2011.

Pasotti, Eleonora. "Sorting through the trash: the waste management crisis in Southern Italy." *South European Society and Politics* 15, no. 2 (2010): 289-307.

Petrillo, Antonello. 2009. *Biopolitica di un rifiuto: le rivolte anti-discardita a Napoli e in Campania*. Verona: Ombre corte.

Pellow, David Naguib. *Resisting global toxics: Transnational movements for environmental justice*. mit Press, 2007.

- Pellow, David N., and Hollie Nyseth Brehm. "An environmental sociology for the twenty-first century." *Annual Review of Sociology* 39 (2013): 229-250.
- Piazza, Gianni. "Locally unwanted land use movements: the role of left-wing parties and groups in trans-territorial conflicts in Italy." *Modern Italy* 16, no. 3 (2011): 329-344.
- Pillow, Wanda. "Confession, catharsis, or cure? Rethinking the uses of reflexivity as methodological power in qualitative research." *International journal of qualitative studies in education* 16, no. 2 (2003): 175-196.
- Pini, Barbara. "On being a nice country girl and an academic feminist: Using reflexivity in rural social research." *Journal of Rural Studies* 20, no. 2 (2004): 169-179.
- Piper, Liza, and Sherilyn MacGregor. "Beyond Mothering Earth: Ecological Citizenship and the Politics of Care." (2007): 326-328.
- Puglia, Ilaria. 2013. "Non tolleriamo più uno Stato complice di questo ecocidio" *Parallelo41*, November 20. <http://www.paralleloquarantuno.com/articoli/non-tolleriamo-piu-uno-stato-complice-di-questo-ecocidio.html>
- Puglia, Ilaria. 2014. "Patriciello e le mamme della Terra dei fuochi più credibili di partiti e sindacati" *Parallelo41*, January 11. <http://www.paralleloquarantuno.it/articoli/patriciello-e-le-mamme-della-terra-dei-fuochi-piu-credibili-di-partiti-e-sindacati.html>
- Purcell, Mark. "Possible worlds: Henri Lefebvre and the right to the city." *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36, no. 1 (2014): 141-154.
- Raghuram, P. (2012). Global care, local configurations—challenges to conceptualizations of care. *Global Networks*, 12(2), 155-174.
- La Repubblica. 2010. "Rifiuti, molotov lungo la strada per Terzigno. Le mamme alla Madonna: "No discarica"" October 3. http://napoli.repubblica.it/cronaca/2010/10/03/news/rifiuti_molotov_lungo_la_strada_per_terzigno-7666240/
- La Repubblica. 2010. "Scontri a Terzigno, cinque arresti: Noi col rosario voi coi manganelli". October 19. http://napoli.repubblica.it/cronaca/2010/10/19/news/terzigno_ancora_scontri_nella_notte_tre_agenti_feriti_cinque_fermi-8208852/
- Reed, Maureen G. "Taking stands: A feminist perspective on other women's activism in forestry communities of northern Vancouver Island." *Gender, Place and Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography* 7, no. 4 (2000): 363-387.
- Resurrección, Bernadette P. "Persistent women and environment linkages in climate change and sustainable development agendas." In *Women's Studies International Forum*, vol. 40, pp. 33-43. Pergamon, 2013.
- Ridet, Philippe. 2013 "Naples, La Poubelle de l'Italie" December 23rd last accessed 9/22/2016 http://www.lemonde.fr/planete/article/2013/12/20/naples-la-poubelle-de-l-italie_4337894_3244.html?xtmc=campania&xtcr=1
- Ridgeway, Cecilia L., and Lynn Smith-Lovin. "The gender system and interaction." *Annual review of sociology* 25, no. 1 (1999): 191-216.

Righetti, 2013. "I Cittadini Campani Contro Clini" April 5 2013

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aQ9SwEP_J28

Last Accessed 11/16/2016

Rocheleau, Dianne, Barbara Thomas-Slayter, and Esther Wangari. "Gender and environment: A feminist political ecology perspective." *Feminist Political Ecology: Global issues and local experiences* (1996): 3-26.

Romero, Mary. *Maid in the USA*. Psychology Press, 2002.

Salleh, Ariel. "Ecofeminism as sociology." *Capitalism Nature Socialism* 14, no. 1 (2003): 61-74.

Sannino, Conchita. 2008. "Rifiuti, Si di Napolitano al Decreto: Dieci discariche e tolleranza zero" May 24

Last accessed 9/22/2016

<http://napoli.repubblica.it/dettaglio/rifiuti-si-di-napolitano-al-decreto-dieci-discardiche-e-tolleranza-zero/1463886>

Sardo, Raffaele. 2013. "Aversa, Contestato Balduzzi." *La Repubblica*, January 9

<http://ricerca.repubblica.it/repubblica/archivio/repubblica/2013/01/09/aversa-contestato-balduzzi.html>

Sarli, Doriana. 2015. "Da Posillipo a Pianura, un Viaggio di Sola Andata" in Armiero, 2015. *Teresa e le Altre* pp

Sassen, Saskia. "Spatialities and Temporalities of the Global: Elements for a Theorization." *Public Culture* 12, no. 1 (2000): 215-232.

----- "The state and globalization." *Interventions* 5, no. 2 (2003): 241-248.

Saviano, Roberto. "Gomorra, Mondadori." (2006).

Schultz, Irmgard. "Women and waste*." *Capitalism Nature Socialism* 4, no. 2 (1993): 51-63.

Schultz, Irmgard, Diana Hummel, Claudia Empacher, Thomas Kluge, Alexandra Lux, Engelbert Schramm, Stephanie Schubert et al. "Research on gender, the environment and sustainable development." *Studies on gender impact assessment of the programmes of the fifth framework programme for research, technological development and demonstration. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities* (2003).

Schuster, Liza. "The continuing mobility of migrants in Italy: shifting between places and statuses." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 31, no. 4 (2005): 757-774.

Serner, Simone Neri. *Incorporare la natura: storie ambientali del Novecento*. Vol. 83. Carocci, 2005.

Shiva, Vandana. *Staying alive: Women, ecology and development*. Zed Books, 1989.

----- "Development, Ecology and Women." *Earthcare: An Anthology in Environmental Ethics* (2009): 274.

Shove, Elizabeth. "Comfort, cleanliness and convenience: The social organization of normality (New Technologies/New Cultures)." (2004).

Smith, Michael Peter, and Luis Eduardo Guarnizo, eds. *Transnationalism from below*. Vol. 6. Transaction Publishers, 1998.

Speciale, Anna Maria, and Enrique Regidor. "Understanding the universality of the immigrant health paradox: the Spanish perspective." *Journal of immigrant and minority health* 13, no. 3 (2011): 518-525.

- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. 1990. *The Post-colonial critic: Interviews, Strategies, Dialogues*. New York: Routledge.
- Stanko, Elizabeth. *Intimate Intrusions (Routledge Revivals): Women's Experience of Male Violence*. Routledge, 2013.
- Strozza, Salvatore, Federico Benassi, Raffaele Ferrara, and Gerardo Gallo. "Recent demographic trends in the major Italian urban agglomerations: the role of foreigners." *Spatial Demography* 4, no. 1 (2016): 39-70.
- United Nations Environment Programme with Frankfurt School-UNEP Collaborating Centre for Climate & Sustainable Energy Finance. 2016 "Global Trends in Renewable Energy Investments 2016" *Bloomberg- Energy Finance*
http://fs-unep-centre.org/sites/default/files/publications/globaltrendsrenewableenergyinvestment2016lowres_0.pdf
 Last accessed 1/26/2017
- Vanderbeck, Robert M. "Masculinities and fieldwork: widening the discussion." *Gender, Place & Culture* 12, no. 4 (2005): 387-402.
- Van Hooren, Franca. "When families need immigrants: The exceptional position of migrant domestic workers and care assistants in Italian immigration policy." *Bulletin of Italian Politics* 2, no. 2 (2010): 21-38.
- Verdicchio, Pasquale. "Discourse in Southern Italy." *Revisioning Italy: National Identity and Global Culture* (1997): 191.
- Wallerstein, Immanuel Maurice. *World-systems analysis: An introduction*. Duke University Press, 2004.
- Wimmer, Andreas, and Nina Glick Schiller. "Methodological nationalism and beyond: nation–state building, migration and the social sciences." *Global networks* 2, no. 4 (2002): 301-334.
- World Economic Forum, 2016 "The Global Gender Gap Report" October 26, 2016
<http://reports.weforum.org/global-gender-gap-report-2016/> Last accessed 11/19/2016
- Yeates, N. (2012). Global care chains: a state-of-the-art review and future directions in care transnationalization research. *Global Networks*, 12(2), 135-154
- Zagaria, Cristina. 2011. "Le Mamme Vulcaniche." In *Non è un paese per donne*, edited by Carmen Pellegrino and Cristina Zagaria, 219-244. Segrate, Italy: Piccola Biblioteca Oscar Mondadori.

APPENDIX A: INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRES

Questions for anti-waste activists

- When did you become involved with issues of waste in Campania?
- What is it that you do as part of your involvement with this issue?
- When did you decide to join a socially-active group dealing with issues of waste and the environment?
- Please describe your group's stance on issues of waste in Campania
- Are you familiar with European Union waste regulations?
- What is your opinion on these policies?
- If applicable: what do people in your group think about these policies?
- In your experience, do these regulations fit well with the context and potential of this region?
- In your experience, what would be some good strategies to alleviate problems of trash in this region?
- How do issues of waste management in Campania affect you personally?
- Optional:
- What is your age?
- What is your main occupation?

Questions for domestic workers

- I am going to ask you a few questions about your experience as a domestic worker/homemaker in Naples/Campania.
- What is/are your main occupation(s) at the moment?

- How long have you had this/these occupation(s)?
- Can you tell me about the chores that you do in the house?
- Does your employer/ family recycle?
- If yes, which materials?
- Do you take garbage or recycling bags out at all?
- If yes:
 - How often?
 - Is there a particular time of the day that (you) OR (your employer wants you to) take the garbage out?
 - How much time does this take you, each time?
 - Is there a place close to the house where you can leave the bags?
 - Is that location safe and convenient for you?
 - Does this chore bother you at all?
- Are you in charge of buying groceries for your family/employer?
- If yes:
 - What kind?
 - Where? Please don't specify the names of the stores, but let me know what kind of stores are these
 - How often?
 - How much time does this take you, each time?
 - Does this chore bother you at all?
 - Is that location safe and convenient for you?

APPENDIX B: INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD APPROVAL LETTER

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS AT URBANA-CHAMPAIGN

Office of the Vice Chancellor for Research
Institutional Review Board
528 East Green Street
Suite 203
Champaign, IL 61820



July 1, 2014

Zsuzsa Gille
Sociology
57 CAB
605 E Springfield Ave
M/C 454

RE: *Transnational governance and social inequality in the European Union: an ethnographic study of Campania's waste crisis*
IRB Protocol Number: 14760

Dear Dr. Gille:

Your response to stipulations for the project entitled *Transnational governance and social inequality in the European Union: an ethnographic study of Campania's waste crisis* has satisfactorily addressed the concerns of the UIUC Institutional Review Board (IRB) and you are now free to proceed with the human subjects protocol. The UIUC IRB approved, by expedited review, the protocol as described in your IRB-1 application with stipulated changes. The expiration date for this protocol, UIUC number 14760, is 06/30/2015. The risk designation applied to your project is *no more than minimal risk*. Certification of approval is available upon request.

Copies of the attached date-stamped consent form(s) must be used in obtaining informed consent. If there is a need to revise or alter the consent form(s), please submit the revised form(s) for IRB review, approval, and date-stamping prior to use.

Under applicable regulations, no changes to procedures involving human subjects may be made without prior IRB review and approval. The regulations also require that you promptly notify the IRB of any problems involving human subjects, including unanticipated side effects, adverse reactions, and any injuries or complications that arise during the project.

If you have any questions about the IRB process, or if you need assistance at any time, please feel free to contact me or the IRB Office, or visit our Web site at <http://www.irb.illinois.edu>.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Anita Balgopal'.

Anita Balgopal, PhD
Director, Institutional Review Board

Attachment(s)

c: Valeria Bonatti